

MANITOBA CLEAN ENVIRONMENT COMMISSION

LAKE WINNIPEG REGULATION REVIEW

UNDER THE WATER POWER ACT

VOLUME 9

* * * * *

Transcript of Proceedings
Held at RBC Convention Centre
Winnipeg, Manitoba
TUESDAY, MARCH 24, 2015

* * * * *

APPEARANCES

CLEAN ENVIRONMENT COMMISSION

Terry Sargeant - Chairman
Edwin Yee - Commissioner
Neil Harden - Commissioner
Beverly Suek - Commissioner
Bill Bowles - Counsel to Commission
Cathy Johnson - Commission Secretary
Joyce Mueller - Administrative Assistant
Amy Kagaoan - Administrative Assistant
Phil Shantz - Advisor
George McMahon - Advisor
Bob Armstrong - Report writer

MANITOBA CONSERVATION AND WATER STEWARDSHIP

Rob Matthews
Puru Singh

MANITOBA HYDRO

Doug Bedford - Counsel
Janet Mayor - Counsel

CONSUMERS ASSOCIATION OF CANADA (Manitoba chapter)

Byron Williams - Counsel
Aimee Craft - Counsel
Gloria Desorcy

MANITOBA METIS FEDERATION

Marci Riel
Jasmine Langhan

MANITOBA WILDLANDS

Gaile Whelan Enns

PEGUIS FIRST NATION

Lloyd Stevenson

PIMICIKAMAK OKIMAWIN

Annette Luttermann
Darwin Paupanakis
Jeremiah Raining Bird
William Osborne

KEWATINOOK FISHERS

Meryl Ballard

NORWAY HOUSE FISHERMAN'S CO-OP

Keith Lenton

APPEARANCES

TATASKWEYAK CREE NATION
Sean Keating

INTERLAKE RESERVES TRIBAL COUNCIL
Cory Shefman

INDEX OF PROCEEDINGS

Presentation by Norway House Fisherman's Cooperative	
Keith Lenton	1477
Langford Saunders	1481
Leslie Apetagon	1505
Closing by Mr. Saunders	1517
Questions by CEC Panel	1523
Questions by Mr. Settee	1536
Presentation by David Grant	1539

INDEX OF EXHIBITS

NHFC 1	Norway House Fishermen's Co-op general outline	1556
NHFC 2	Norway House Fishermen's Co-op presentation	1556
WPG 19	David Grant's presentation	1556

1 TUESDAY, MARCH 24, 2015

2 UPON COMMENCING AT 9:30 A.M.

3 THE CHAIRMAN: Good morning. We'll
4 resume the proceedings. This morning we have a
5 participant presentation, this time on behalf of
6 the Norway House Fisherman's Co-op. We have
7 counsel for this participant, Mr. Lenton, as well
8 as two elders with him.

9 Part of our procedural guidelines, or
10 one of our procedural guidelines require that
11 anybody giving testimony be sworn in. Will you be
12 giving testimony, Mr. Lenton, or are you just sort
13 of stick handling?

14 MR. LENTON: I'm stick handling today.

15 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. So we'll ask,
16 the Commission secretary will swear in the two
17 elders that are with you.

18 MS. JOHNSON: Gentlemen, can you state
19 your name for the record, please?

20 ELDER APETAGON: Good morning. My
21 name is Leslie Apetagon, from Norway House
22 Fisherman's Co-op, I am the eldest fisherman
23 there.

24 MR. SAUNDERS: My name is Langford
25 Saunders, I'm currently the president of

1 Fisherman's Co-op Association.

2 Leslie Apetagon: Sworn

3 Langford Saunders: Sworn

4 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

5 Mr. Lenton, you may proceed, if you
6 wish to give further introductions, we would
7 welcome it.

8 MR. LENTON: Yes, thank you, Mr.
9 Chair. Good morning, Commissioners, participants
10 and members of the public. As I've been
11 introduced, my name is Keith Lenton and I'm here
12 with the Norway House Fishermen's Cooperative.
13 Norway House Fishermen's Cooperative, an
14 incorporated cooperative under the Manitoba
15 Cooperatives Act and respects the interests of all
16 the commercial fishermen in Norway House. They
17 are also the primary commercial users of Playgreen
18 Lake, and so their stake in Lake Winnipeg
19 Regulation is obvious, as the panelists will speak
20 to. It's important to recognize, though, that the
21 interests at stake here are not just those of the
22 commercial fishermen themselves, but they also
23 extend to their families and the community at
24 large, as they are a very pivotal part of the
25 economy and culture there.

1 So, beside me are the two panelists
2 who will be presenting the concerns and
3 recommendations relating to Lake Winnipeg
4 Regulation from the point of view of the
5 Fisherman's Co-op. So as they introduce
6 themselves, there is Langford Saunders, current
7 president of the Norway House Fisherman's
8 Cooperative, and Elder Leslie Apetagon, a long
9 time commercial fisherman and community member.

10 So I'd just like to give a bit of
11 background on them before we proceed, because I
12 think it's important that you know where they are
13 coming from.

14 So, again, Mr. Saunders has 18 years
15 of experience fishing in the areas in and around
16 2-Mile Channel and Catfish Bay, and on Playgreen
17 Lake. He's also been involved with the commercial
18 fishermen as a staff member, beginning in 1980 and
19 culminating over 30 years of involvement in the
20 local industry.

21 Mr. Saunders also has significant
22 leadership experience outside the corporate
23 office, as he served in his community as
24 councillor for the Norway House Cree First Nation
25 between 2002 and 2009. He retains extensive

1 involvement in the connections in the community to
2 this day, of course. He was appointed by the
3 Minister of Water Stewardship to be part of the
4 Lake Winnipeg Quota Review Task Force in 2011, and
5 is currently a member of the Lake Winnipeg Fishery
6 Co-management Board. In recognition of his
7 advocacy of the commercial fishers, Mr. Saunders
8 was a recipient of the 60th Diamond Jubilee Award.

9 As leader in this business and in the
10 community, he continues to have active involvement
11 and has a lot to say about Lake Winnipeg
12 Regulation. So that's why he's here today. So
13 Mr. Saunders will provide evidence on the change
14 over time with respect to the water quality,
15 shoreline erosion, the fish stocks and just, you
16 know, the water and riparian environment
17 generally.

18 Now, Elder Leslie Apetagon is also a
19 commercial fisherman, as I mentioned. He has a
20 lot of experience on Playgreen Lake as well. He's
21 been fishing there for approximately 33 years in
22 total, broken up over time, most extensively in
23 Playgreen Lake.

24 We should note that our presentation
25 will be mostly pertaining to Playgreen Lake.

1 So prior to this he was familiar with
2 the area through his fishing experiences with his
3 father. As a young man he began fishing
4 personally and moved into the commercial fishery
5 when he was older.

6 Now he is a member of the six elders
7 of chief and council of the Norway House Cree
8 Nation, and is highly knowledgeable about the
9 impacts of Lake Winnipeg Regulation, or of the
10 water on his community.

11 He's also a former president of the
12 Norway House Fisherman's Cooperative, with a
13 tenure of over six years. This began in 1986, and
14 he was involved in the negotiations with Manitoba
15 Hydro back then, which gave rise to two
16 settlements which are known as claim 16 and claim
17 16(a). And this was, of course, prior to the
18 master implementation agreement which we are
19 familiar with now.

20 Based on his experience, he will be
21 providing his observations and experiences on
22 Playgreen Lake, both prior to Lake Winnipeg
23 Regulation and after, you know, culminating in
24 today.

25 So just by brief outline of what we

1 will be talking about today, I just want to say we
2 will be focusing on the commercial fishery in
3 Playgreen Lake, of course, but also discussing the
4 experiences of the commercial fishers as they
5 relate to the broader community and the impacts
6 that that has on them, as well as the
7 communication and consultation with Manitoba
8 Hydro, and what the commercial, or what the
9 Fisherman's Cooperative would like to see going
10 forward in terms of communication and
11 consultation.

12 I'd also just note that although we
13 have two representatives here from the
14 cooperative, I understand that many more would
15 like to share their story with the Commission when
16 the Commission visits the Norway House community
17 after these proceedings. So we're going to hear
18 from two experts today, but I imagine there will
19 be more input down the road.

20 So without further adieu, I'd like to
21 turn this over first to Mr. Saunders.

22 MR. SAUNDERS: Good morning. Welcome
23 everybody and good morning to everybody in here.

24 As you can probably feel that I'm kind
25 of overwhelmed, sitting in front of the

1 Commission, also in front of Manitoba Hydro and
2 the participants in here.

3 When I feel something like that
4 coming, it's because it's coming from the heart.
5 An elder taught me a long time ago that if
6 something comes from your heart, in our Cree
7 language is (Cree spoken), it comes out of your
8 mouth, which is (Cree spoken), then it comes down
9 to your hands, (Cree spoken). So everything
10 relates to your heart. And if you want to help
11 people and if you want to tell a story, it has to
12 come from here.

13 So this morning, I'm going to be
14 talking about the experiences of the impacts that
15 occurred since the channel, 2-Mile Channel and
16 8-Mile has occurred, since it had been open.

17 First of all, before I do speak on
18 that, I would like to acknowledge Ms.
19 Ruth Kristjanson from Manitoba Hydro, staff, Hank
20 McIvor, and the staff that I have been working
21 with since 2012, communicating directly with them
22 in regards to the shoreline stabilization projects
23 that we had been going through. So it's only fair
24 that I acknowledge those individuals, because I
25 can say that they -- I was not -- that they

1 weren't part of any of our lives in our community,
2 but being directly involved with them.

3 Communication is one of the things
4 that we are here for today. It's to make it very
5 loud and clear that we represent the commercial
6 fishermen of Norway House. We are our separate
7 entity from the Cree Nation. And we have to be
8 treated that way, in that way, because in the
9 past, and it keeps on going, is that everybody
10 believes that when you talk to Chief and Council,
11 that you talk about everybody, they represent
12 everybody. But that's not the case in our
13 community. We are appointed, we are elected by a
14 separate, the Manitoba Cooperative Act, and we are
15 looking after our own fishery in our community,
16 and we are very heavily impacted by what is going
17 on in our environment.

18 When you live in our environment, the
19 environment 365 days of the year, you will know
20 what I talk about. I seen things that changed in
21 our commercial fishing in Playgreen Lake. As a
22 boy, I grew up fishing with my uncle, the early
23 '70s, for sturgeon. We used to have a fishing
24 ground just at mouth of 8-Mile, where the channel
25 was opened up, created. We used to get commercial

1 fish for sturgeon, for domestic and also for
2 commercial.

3 1983 was the last time that I seen my
4 uncle actually catch a sturgeon in that area.
5 It's last time I went with him to go set a net
6 there, all we got was moss, sticks, trees. And
7 that was his, that's where it ended for him in
8 regards to commercial fishing. To see a man that
9 provided for his family, but also they used that
10 for historical reasons, commercial fishing for
11 sturgeon when they come, to lose something like
12 that, it's priceless.

13 Today, there is nothing there in
14 regard to sturgeon. Those fishing grounds are no
15 longer there.

16 Commercial fishing, like I said,
17 growing up, started working for a co-op 1979,
18 1980, as a shore hand, at a very young age. I was
19 only 16 years old, summer job. Summer of fishing
20 used to go on until July, August, at that time.
21 So I was given the opportunity to go make a little
22 bit of money after school. Eventually, I just
23 kept on working for the co-op.

24 You know, I seen fish come out of
25 Playgreen Lake, and the size and the species of

1 fish, the hunchback, the whitefish, the quality of
2 whitefish that came out of that lake is no more.
3 And then seeing, I remember the families, that
4 continues today, that continues and fish. Our
5 co-op is like a family, the Menow boys, the
6 Apetagons, the Robinsons, the Saunders, the
7 Muswagons. This is a family affair of fishing in
8 our community. There is 50 fishermen, commercial
9 fishermen in our co-op. Out of those 50
10 fishermen, there's three helpers to each boat.
11 One family, when you look at the family structure
12 of a fisherman, you see five. Each individual
13 helper has five in the number. If you look at 15
14 in a boat, times that by 50, and then you look at
15 the staff of 16 individual staff members that are
16 there that work for us, and their families, you
17 can see how much impact commercial fishing comes
18 to our community. A community that is a dead-end
19 community off 373, off number 6 to 373, then you
20 go down two hours, you got to come up two hours to
21 number 6. The closest community is Cross Lake, an
22 hour away, and then you have to gauge of to
23 Jenpeg.

24 Commercial fishing in a community of
25 Norway House has changed so much. Playgreen Lake,

1 the amount of fish that used to be caught there
2 has not, is not there anymore. Therefore
3 conservation has moved most of our quota,
4 three-quarters of our quota to Lake Winnipeg. And
5 that puts an impact on our commercial fishermen,
6 to go out there more, to go further out, to travel
7 further in order for us to commercial fish. Any
8 given time right now, a commercial fisherman
9 spends about \$180 per boat to go catch fish per
10 day, and the cost of living is so high back in our
11 community. But we continue fishing. We continue
12 fishing, and that's the way of life since the
13 early 1900s. It's been proven that we have been
14 commercial fishing in that lake, in our area,
15 since then. It's proven in court that we had been
16 there. We harvest sturgeon.

17 So I'm trying to make it short. I
18 could stay here all day to explain to you what's
19 what in Norway House. But I'm trying to speed up
20 the process in here on what's going on, and I know
21 that Elder Apetagon here is going to be talking
22 about his personal experiences on the lake.

23 We know, I asked this question to our
24 commercial fishermen, what do you expect, or what
25 do you want me to say in these proceedings? And

1 one of the things they said was that we accept
2 2-Mile is going to be here, it's not going to go
3 away. We accept that, that it's going to be
4 there. But we need Manitoba Hydro and Manitoba
5 Conservation to talk, to come and sit down with us
6 and talk to us and hear us, what our concerns are.

7 I think to me that was very simple,
8 simple, very simple thing for a request for our
9 commercial fishermen to ask, to be recognized
10 that -- to be recognized, to be talked to, to be
11 consulted about what's going on. Not that we
12 expect that somebody comes into our community,
13 that they go to Chief and Council and expect that
14 Chief and Council talks for us. You know, we have
15 respect for Chief and Council, but we need to be
16 respected also for communication.

17 I'll talk a little bit about fish
18 stocks and spawning grounds. Used to be in the
19 fall, we would catch the whitefish coming in, we
20 would catch them in our rivers. We would -- our
21 elders, our people, our fishermen would be smoking
22 whitefish, and they would be hanging them up for
23 the winter. Those days are gone. They are not
24 there anymore the way they used to be. Those
25 things have been altered. Us commercial fishermen

1 have the ability to go out, to go set five or six
2 nets in order for us to get that fish. In the
3 rivers, it's very hard. You have to go somewhere
4 else. But the local people don't have the ability
5 to buy \$120, \$130, \$150 net, and whatever adds up
6 to whatever the string, the rope that you need.
7 It's hard for them. So even hard for us where we
8 can just spring out, instead of 100 yard net, a
9 50-yard net and get what we need for us to store,
10 to eat. Those days are gone.

11 I can honestly say that when we're
12 done Lake Winnipeg fishing in the fall, then we
13 move into Playgreen Lake to fish. It seems like
14 there's a door at the channel of 2-Mile. There's
15 abundance of fish outside 2-Mile, maybe a half
16 mile out from 2-Mile. But you fish in Playgreen,
17 that fish is not coming in. Why would they come
18 in? Studies, I have seen reports where sediments
19 have completely filled up Playgreen Lake. Debris
20 come into Playgreen Lake. Where is the fish?
21 Where is the fish food?

22 The most impacted area of Playgreen
23 Lake is the west shore where there used to be
24 abundance of fish that was harvested from that
25 area. It's no more. There's just a small area

1 where the mouth of Jack River and Nelson River
2 that fishermen, about 15 of them fish there. And
3 that's how much it can handle. You know, so fish
4 stocks in the spawning ground, I don't know, there
5 is no answer, I have no answer, I just know that
6 they are no longer there.

7 It's very difficult to fish in
8 Playgreen Lake. We have 115,000 kilograms of
9 quota, that's whitefish, pickerel, quota fish that
10 we can harvest of that 115. The last five years
11 we have, we harvested about 80,000, average 80,000
12 of that 115, for a period of four weeks. If it
13 was Lake Winnipeg, we could have finished that in
14 a week. But because of what's happening in
15 Playgreen Lake, with the sediments and the debris
16 that is moving into Playgreen Lake, we are very
17 heavily impacted.

18 In the spring, I usually go fly around
19 to see the ice conditions in Lake Winnipeg for us
20 to start fishing. I see the sand bars, the
21 sediments, buildups along the west shore of
22 Playgreen Lake, when the water is clear, when the
23 ice has moved. Three years in a row I had been
24 flying around to see. See in the picture, you see
25 there, that's pretty much what I see when I fly on

1 the west shore. That's pretty much what I see.

2 I tell the truth when I say this,
3 there is so many changes. The land itself, like
4 Playgreen Lake erosion is a big problem for
5 2-Mile -- for Playgreen Lake on the west shore.

6 In 2012, I took it upon myself as the
7 president to speak to Bob Monkman of Manitoba
8 Hydro, the community relations. If we have a
9 chance to, is there anything we can do to do some
10 shoreline stabilization for our area? And he
11 agreed to look at it and see if he can come up
12 with the funds to do it. So since 2012, we have
13 completed, we're just finished, actually just
14 finishing up the fifth project that Manitoba Hydro
15 has funded in regards to that shoreline
16 stabilization, at the west side, the west side of
17 Playgreen Lake. But there is so much more to do.

18 And I thank the people from Hydro for
19 giving us communication. That's the first time we
20 actually communicated, and not getting Chief and
21 Council involved, but going through the community
22 relations department and see if we can work with
23 and talking to vice-president Ruth Kristjanson on
24 the deal with these shoreline issues that we have.

25 I have a little video in regard to

1 that. I got this video Sunday, before I came out.
2 I had a chance to go out, I bought this GoPro it's
3 called, a camera that you attach to your head.
4 And I figured a visual aid for myself and for the
5 people here to see what I'm talking about in
6 regards to shoreline.

7 You will see the first video going
8 north, and you can see where the water levels are,
9 it's amongst the trees. These are the trees that
10 are causing problems. These trees eventually are
11 going to fall into the lake and become a floating
12 hazard. It's a big problem. It just continues.
13 In some areas you will see it is more, you see
14 more of it, that it's happening. And these are
15 the trees that go in the water that we catch.
16 Because when we say that we catch these trees is
17 that they still have the greens in them when we
18 catch them in the nets in the year -- in the fall.
19 And that's why I initiated the discussion with
20 Manitoba Hydro to address this issue, to take
21 these trees off.

22 A project we did in 2014, December of
23 this past year, we did 2.6 kilometres in the
24 8-Mile area, the reserve's selection. Out of that
25 area, we took a diameter from 3-inch to 36-inch

1 diameter trees, the amount of 8,000 trees removed.
2 That could have been, 95 percent of them could
3 have been in the water, that are in the water.

4 The video itself, it's telling what is
5 going on in the community in our west shore of
6 Playgreen Lake. And it just continues. It
7 continues every year. And I took it upon myself
8 to talk and start communicating with Hydro, to see
9 what they can do. Because I don't believe that
10 this is acceptable. How can we Cree people, (Cree
11 spoken) of our community, can accept this
12 happening? It's bad enough we're losing trees,
13 the value, the oxygen givers of the earth, I heard
14 on TV. The trees, we're losing so much. But then
15 it goes into the water.

16 Us human beings have adapted where we
17 are drinking waters filtered. One elder told me
18 that animals don't have the ability to get them
19 filtered water. They drink whatever there is, the
20 contaminants that come into the waters. The
21 animals that create medicine, that are with
22 medicine, the muskrat, are no longer there. They
23 are frozen out to the fluctuation of the water.

24 The trapper once said, that's
25 trapping, this is a one, trapline number one it's

1 called. He said, how can we trap here? Either we
2 have to be monkeys to trap here, climb over trees.
3 That's one of the description I heard. You've got
4 to climb over trees to trap along the shore.

5 So it's a continuous problem,
6 shoreline erosion in our community, and not just
7 the west shore. This is just, the video only
8 covers six kilometres of where I went with the
9 skidoo just to briefly show what's going on. I
10 would say that there's another 30 kilometres of
11 shoreline that has to be looked at. It is the
12 same way, the conditions of it is the same. So I
13 just wanted to show what's out there.

14 And the other video that goes south
15 would show what's happening now, what the
16 difference is between the shoreline, the way it
17 is, and our guys working. This video here will
18 show what it's like if we are not bothering the
19 shoreline, if we're not touching the shoreline, if
20 there's no program, this continues. Then you will
21 see the finished product after our guys. We
22 fulfill our contract where we go 10 feet in and
23 cut anything that's there and keep the stumps. We
24 cut our trees at 12 inches, as recommended by
25 Hydro, and then we leave the stumps that hold

1 everything in place.

2 At the end of the video, you'll see
3 that 2-Mile, the 2012 product of 2-Mile, I faced
4 the camera toward 2-Mile, that's where it ends.
5 We have done that in 2012, and you can see the
6 difference. There's no erosion. What's happening
7 there is actually keeping, what we did in 2012
8 actually stops erosion. And people will say, well
9 fluctuation up and down -- yeah, fluctuation
10 happened but the earth didn't move because there's
11 no tree, there's no 40-foot tree pulling the
12 debris down. So the project itself actually
13 worked.

14 This video shows that we're going
15 towards 2-Mile. So we are impacted big time.
16 Like I said, I can't say enough of how much we are
17 impacted about what's going on in our area. And
18 all I can do is just tell you the way I see it and
19 what we go through. And our lives have been
20 altered in a way that, as commercial fishermen, in
21 order for us to get away from this, we have to go
22 fish in Lake Winnipeg, further, where our elders
23 used to fish on Playgreen Lake, the abundance of
24 fish. Even the whitefish boats in 1950s came and
25 fished and used trap nets in Playgreen Lake,

1 because that's how abundance of fish there was.

2 There's a lot of things that had
3 happened and this -- we couldn't see ourselves
4 being quiet and expect Chief and Council to talk
5 for us, where we say that we are our own governing
6 system, that we have to speak for ourselves.
7 That's why we are here today.

8 Here this video shows what we have
9 been doing, and we do stockpile these wood and we
10 salvage the wood from this area, and we haul them
11 back to the fish station for other fishermen and
12 other band members to use. So we have been
13 hauling wood, whatever we can cut here, and then
14 we haul them back. But you can tell there's a big
15 difference in what you saw previously from that
16 video to what it is, the finished product. It's
17 more cleaner, looks a lot better.

18 In the summer, I encourage everybody
19 to come, if you have a chance come and see our
20 area, come and see for yourselves what's going on
21 in our community. And for yourselves to see, it's
22 a big difference than when you read a report,
23 there's a big difference when you actually can see
24 for yourself what's going on in our community, in
25 our area of concern, of 2-Mile.

1 So with that, we have talked about
2 sediments, we talked about the floating debris, we
3 talked about the amount of sturgeon that used to
4 be in our area, water qualities. Just briefly on
5 water quality, in our experience, we used to drink
6 water from the lake. When you go fishing, we used
7 to go just grab water and then we use it for
8 cooking, making tea, making coffee. Nowadays we
9 don't do that. Since about 10 years ago, we have
10 to start hauling water from the community for us
11 to drink out in the lake. Because if you drink
12 that water, you're going to be running to the
13 washroom in a couple of hours. That's what it
14 does to you. And even when you boil it, when you
15 make tea, you still have that effect. And so we
16 advise our guys, our helpers, our family, we have
17 to bring water to our camps. And that put us, you
18 know, it's another -- another issue for us is
19 that, why we have to haul water, there's -- the
20 lake is just right there, you know. Why can't we
21 drink the water? But it's not that we don't want
22 to drink it, it's because if we drink it, we get
23 sick. You know, that's the only reason.

24 Lake Winnipeg, in the beginning of the
25 season, we can take a cup of water and, you know,

1 we can drink the water. But a week after that,
2 can't do it, because you're going to get sick.
3 And you can't afford to get sick. There's only a
4 window of opportunity to work commercial fishing.
5 And you tend to want to take your water out with
6 you in a boat, for you and your helpers to drink.
7 So again, that's an issue that we have to deal
8 with, with us, daily.

9 And communication, again, I talked
10 about, is I would like to see more communication
11 directly involving with Manitoba Hydro and
12 ourselves from now and for the future. It's
13 because we're going to be there. And like I said
14 before, we accept 2-Mile is going to be there
15 forever, but we don't expect anybody to -- we
16 don't want anybody to say that when we signed an
17 MIA, that everybody is signed off, you know. Why
18 is it there in the agreement, what does it say,
19 unforeseen? There's a lot of unforeseen that is
20 going on in the community and, therefore, there
21 has to be communication with the commercial
22 fishermen.

23 And you know, for myself, I am 51
24 years old, I will continue talking for my
25 fishermen until the time my fishermen tells me

1 that's enough for you. But currently, right now,
2 they push me. They tell me to go out there and
3 talk for us, because nobody else is. We have to
4 be heard. And when the Commission does come to
5 Norway House, we will have a line-up of fishermen
6 that will be speaking on their issues. And it's
7 common issues that we deal with every year for
8 ourselves.

9 You know, I'll tell a little bit of
10 Northern Flood Agreement plus the MIA. We have
11 some account there, the commercial fishermen
12 account. I remember being involved, I was a board
13 member in 1998, I would think. Yeah, around that
14 time I became a board member, you know, knowing
15 the discussions are happening already and I was
16 part of the meetings. There were three meetings
17 that happened before the signing of the agreement
18 for the commercial fishermen. And if you do not
19 believe me, look at the schedules of the MIA.
20 There is discussions, there's three meetings
21 identified, that it wasn't about the environmental
22 impact or our concerns, it's more about the money,
23 the compensation. That's what the discussion
24 about the fishermen was all about, the
25 continuation of the compensation that was going

1 on.

2 To this day, I don't know, to be
3 honest with you, I don't know what we were
4 compensated for. I wish somebody can tell me what
5 the compensation was for, you know. But it was
6 all about the money, how much money you are going
7 to be getting.

8 When the discussion was happening
9 about the money, the true value, or the amount of
10 dollars that was talked about is like half of what
11 we get, we got at the end, you know. It was the
12 Chief and Council that made the decision for us,
13 not the commercial fishermen. You know, we were
14 kind of forced to sign because it would impact the
15 Cree Nation. When you lump, you put everything
16 together in one, we don't want that anymore, we
17 want to be separated from -- we are the resource
18 users, we are impacted big time compared to the
19 Cree Nation.

20 Yes, recreationally, we used to go
21 swimming, we used to enjoy the beaches at Sandy
22 Island, Sandy Bar, you name it. We used to enjoy
23 those beaches around our area. The islands used
24 to have beaches. That itself has been negatively
25 impacted, there is no beaches anymore. The

1 recreational part for Playgreen Lake is no longer
2 there that used to be. So, yes, there is
3 impacted. And when you look at recreation, I'll
4 just share a little bit of history. When I used
5 to grow up, when we were growing up, we used to
6 have a skating rink down the bank at our house.
7 We used to have a big, the snowbank was maybe 6,
8 7 feet high on each side. It was like a rink, it
9 was a rink, but snow, we piled up snow. The ice
10 would come and it cracks, and you patch the ice
11 up, right. As the years went on, we tried to put
12 the rink back on the lake. As soon as south wind
13 comes, the whole rink is covered by water. The
14 water has moved on top. Soon it was not
15 skate-able, we abandoned that area. We tried
16 again. We'd do it again. We'd flood it, we'd do
17 this, we'd flood, we'd flood, we'd flood.

18 It got to a point, today I see a rink,
19 plowed, for maybe a week, and the water levels
20 somehow affects it. It's gone. It's seldom that
21 I see kids skating on the river. That's been
22 altered, the way the recreation used to be has
23 been altered. Because Norway House is situated
24 right in the mouth, right where the funnel system
25 of the Nelson River and the two channels. So

1 we're situated there. So we're impacted.

2 Just to give you a few things to talk
3 about, talking about here, just to know what's
4 going on. I'll just finish off my presentation
5 here. I could have done more, I guess I could
6 have said more.

7 I'll just use an example of failure
8 communication. 2011, there is a compensation
9 package given to the Norway House Cree Nation. To
10 this date, we have been asking about what happened
11 there. Because we got impacted in the flood of
12 2011, where we have lost our docks in our
13 community, myself, on our islands, our fishing
14 areas, our fishing islands, our camps, our cabins,
15 I was impacted with the loss of my docks.

16 I'll just give you a picture of what
17 we have to go through, what we actually do to
18 build a dock again. We haul logs, we haul rock,
19 we buy lumber, the decking. Now, we go out in our
20 lake, the lake, we harvest logs. Then we have to
21 haul rocks out there, greater distance, we have to
22 haul lumber, greater distance. Then we have to
23 build. So we got impacted with the 2011 flood,
24 and compensation was given to the Cree Nation, but
25 not to us. But again, again, because of the

1 assumption that the Cree Nation speaks for us.
2 And that's where I'm trying to get at here. I'm
3 using that as an example that we should be talked
4 to, the communication has to be there, so that we
5 continue the dialogue between Hydro and ourselves.
6 Then come to our office and talk to us about
7 what's happening.

8 2012, communicated about that, about
9 shoreline stabilization, it worked, it continues
10 to work. And also we asked the Manitoba Hydro,
11 communicates with Manitoba Hydro to close the
12 gates at Jenpeg while we commercial fish. They
13 said yes the first time, and then they said no the
14 second time. So we didn't ask again. But we
15 wanted to see if it does impact, the impacts when
16 they close the gates, and it did impact us. It
17 did a positive impact on us. There was fish at
18 that time. But then everybody says it's just --
19 what do you call that word -- coincidence that it
20 happened.

21 So I just wanted to share a little bit
22 of communication where -- use an example of that
23 2011 compensation, that to this date, we have not
24 received any explanation, even though that again
25 this morning, as of early this morning, I was

1 saying schedule a meeting with Hydro on Friday.

2 So again, the communication, I'm forcing the
3 communication, so to speak, but it shouldn't be
4 that way.

5 So to finish off, I have a bit of, a
6 few recommendations to the Commission before you
7 do -- again, I asked the commercial fishermen,
8 what do you want me to say at this hearing? And
9 one of the things they said they want, before the
10 recommendation should be coming from the
11 Commission, that Manitoba Hydro comes to Norway
12 House to talk to Norway House Fisherman's Co-op,
13 to hear our concerns and to look at how to
14 mitigate, compensate for what's going on now and
15 for the future.

16 Seeing that Manitoba Hydro is seeking
17 for a 50-year permit, that we should be looking at
18 something for the future for our fishermen.
19 Because again, 2-Mile is going to be there, 8-Mile
20 is going to be there, things are still going to be
21 happening around the lake, we'll still have the
22 issues, but we need somebody to deal with the
23 issues.

24 And there should be up-to-date studies
25 happening. I know that, I did part of that

1 co-management ward for under the MIA also, and
2 there is presentation of the CAMP fish studies
3 that were done. You know, I'm very surprised that
4 Mr. Don MacDonald did a presentation at that
5 meeting, and he talked about fish stocks, but he
6 didn't say what that commission, the report or
7 Hydro submission was on fish stock on Playgreen
8 Lake. That was very surprising to me to read.
9 And he never said that in that presentation. And
10 I asked him about it, and he kind of evaded the
11 question for me. So me and him are kind of -- we
12 used to talk a lot, but, you know, because that's
13 kind of, that's not true. You cannot say that the
14 fish stocks are very healthy in Playgreen Lake.
15 Where? Tell us where? We'll go fish there, you
16 know, we'll go set our nets there. Tell us where?
17 Tell us where the sturgeon is? We'll go catch the
18 sturgeon. You know, are you a better fisherman
19 than us, and we're the ones that are fishing all
20 over the lake. You know, that's something that,
21 something that we need to be talked to about.
22 Those are changes.

23 And from 1990s, there's discussion
24 about the elders talking about that there would be
25 no fish in Playgreen. And they were true, they

1 knew what they were talking about.

2 So that's one of the recommendations
3 that I would -- that would be very helpful for us,
4 and also recommend that more communication needs
5 to happen. And there could be recommendation for
6 the Commission to Hydro for them to come and meet
7 with us and talk about the mitigation of the
8 problems on Playgreen Lake.

9 There could have been more I could be
10 talking about, and I don't want to take too much
11 of that time. I think, I'm trying to put all my
12 message in a short period of time, that it's very
13 clear. And I also provided a visual aid of what
14 I'm talking about in regards to the shoreline
15 stabilization.

16 And again, I'd like to thank you for
17 giving me the opportunity to come up and speak.
18 Thank you.

19 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you,
20 Mr. Saunders.

21 ELDER APETAGON: Good morning. My
22 name is Leslie Apetagon, again, an elder from
23 Norway House, and one of the elder fishermen
24 there.

25 I want to tell you a little bit first

1 about, you know, my history of, you know, of being
2 with my dad, you know, fishing, you know, when I
3 was just a young fellow. I recall him fishing on
4 Mossy Bay back in the '50s. And I recall being
5 with him at one time, you know, lifting his net.
6 I was only about, I believe I was about five years
7 old.

8 Our families used to move there, you
9 know, in June, July, you know, by one of the
10 pick-up boats they call them, you know, these
11 private, I guess private buyers fishermen, fish
12 buyers used to have. They used to have one big
13 boat each and they would haul families over there.
14 The area we stayed was all Apetagon family were
15 there, my uncles, my grandfather was over there.
16 And you know, all our families were there and we
17 really enjoyed being out there.

18 And then in 1958, all of a sudden, you
19 know, Norway House fishermen were kicked out of
20 Mossy Bay area. I believe it was, you know, maybe
21 they were kicked out because they weren't --
22 whitefish fishermen didn't like them being out
23 there, you know, fishing, you know, amongst them.
24 Anyway, in '58 they were moved back to, Playgreen
25 Lake was open for Norway House.

1 So I recall being out there, 1958 in
2 the summer, we moved to an area there, and a nice
3 camp, you know, and nice beaches on where we were.
4 Again, all our family, Apetagon family were over
5 there in that one area. You know, water was
6 clean, you know, beaches were clean, and
7 everything was clean, lots of fish. I recall, you
8 know, seeing lots of fish. What I mean lots was
9 maybe six, 10 tops per day, you know, one of them
10 old wooden fish tubs, you know, six, 10 tubs a
11 day. That was lots for the small boats they were
12 using at the time.

13 Again, I want to tell you a little bit
14 of history about myself. When I was 16, maybe
15 before that, back in 1962 Norway House Fishermen's
16 Co-op was formed, and there were no more private,
17 you know, fish buyers. Playgreen Lake was
18 strictly for, you know, Norway House Fishermen's
19 Co-op. They had a quota, their own quota of fish,
20 you know, one overall quota, like we still have,
21 you know, the same system now, but it's bigger.

22 Anyway, '62, and I believe in '63,
23 '64, I was 16, 17 years old, I had -- my dad got
24 me a licence, a commercial licence which was
25 available through, you know, an old retired, you

1 know, fisherman. So I was able to fish there two
2 years, 16, 17 years old. And when I turned 18, I
3 wanted to look, you know, for something else, so I
4 went mining for about 18 years in Thompson. You
5 know, worked there underground all that time. And
6 I moved back -- got married in the meantime, in
7 them years -- and the wife and I moved home in
8 '84. That's when I decided, you know, when I
9 moved home, I said, I don't want to touch any more
10 rock, no more fishing, which was the two things I
11 have done in my life. The first thing that
12 happened to me when I moved home, you know, my
13 late brother, you know, he was a former Chief of
14 Norway House as well, you know, he was also a
15 former minor in Thompson. He asked me, you know,
16 there's work coming up in Norway House, you know,
17 sewer and water, maybe you should form a company,
18 you know, buy some drills. Anyway, we did that.
19 And, again, you know, I started working on rock.
20 And later on that year a friend of mine, Lloyd
21 Simpson, offered me his fishing licence. I guess
22 fishing was always in my blood, you know, growing
23 up, you know, in a family that fished, you know,
24 it was in me. So it didn't take me long to see,
25 yes, you know, I'm very interested.

1 Again in 1985, I started fishing,
2 commercial fishing. 2-Mile was already there,
3 8-Mile was already there, and I started fishing.
4 But year after year before that, I was home in the
5 summer, you know, and I was out there with my dad,
6 you know. He was out fishing, you know, year
7 after year.

8 Anyway, I start fishing again in '85.
9 And I recall two years, '85, '86, you know, there
10 was still fish, there was still --whitefish was
11 still plentiful. And after that, you know, it
12 started dropping, you know, started losing nets as
13 well, you know, so much debris, you know, from
14 shoreline erosion. Erosion was just starting, you
15 know, at the time. I recall an area I fished,
16 there was hydro line was built there along, in the
17 bush there, and it came out into the shore. That
18 hydro line was for 8 Mile Channel, that area.

19 And year after year after that, you
20 know, hydro poles, you know, just start, you know,
21 falling down because, you know, it's erosion.
22 They were no longer in the bush, they were
23 somewhere in the water, you know, and some were
24 gone, floated away. And fishing got, you know,
25 got worse, worse, you know. So much stuff, you

1 know, building, you know, in the water, in the
2 floor, floor of the, you know, the lake.

3 Anyway, now travelling through that
4 area, you know, the lake, Playgreen Lake, when I
5 go fish on Lake Winnipeg, water used to be about
6 10, 12 feet. Now that same area, water is about
7 eight, 10 feet. That's how much this stuff builds
8 up down there, you know. And when I travel there,
9 that's where I used to have my nets on Playgreen
10 Lake, and I no longer fish that area. I quit
11 fishing that part of the lake on south end of
12 Playgreen Lake, 2-Mile area there, towards 8-Mile,
13 that area, that big area -- it is a big area. And
14 myself, I no longer fish there. I only fish Lake
15 Winnipeg and I fish the very north end of
16 Playgreen Lake by, it's called, you know, Dead
17 Island area. That area, at least, you know, some
18 places you can go where there's no current, you
19 know, at least -- you don't get much sturgeon in
20 your nets. You pretty well have to hide your nets
21 nowadays if you want to fish anywhere on
22 Playgreen. There's so much of this algae, this
23 green stuff coming from Lake Winnipeg, you know,
24 there's so much, it's thick, you know.

25 Langford was telling, you can no

1 longer drink that water, it's so dirty. Like he
2 said a while ago, you can probably drink that
3 water, you know, maybe a week when you start
4 fishing, maybe a week it's nice, you know, clear.
5 And after that, it's no longer drinkable, you
6 know, you can't even use it -- for maybe washing
7 dishes, but, you know, you've got to boil it or do
8 something anyway.

9 Like he said there, we haul water, we
10 all have big jugs, you know, five gallon jugs, you
11 know, a few each, you know, we haul water every
12 time we go home. And kids, you know, they can no
13 longer, you know -- the place I have my cabin, it
14 is a nice island, he mentioned that, you know,
15 sandy island, it's very nice, beaches were all
16 around there. Now, you know, water goes up and
17 down, you know, beaches are no longer -- some
18 areas, you know, they have a little bit of beach
19 here and there, but kids no longer don't want to
20 swim there. They'd like to, you know, every time
21 they come out they'd like to. They are our
22 grandchildren, you know, they like water, you
23 know, kids. That, you know, it's no longer there.
24 Fish, you know, is getting worse and worse and
25 worse.

1 I was in a meeting here a while ago in
2 Winnipeg, I think it was called a four-partum
3 meeting. They came, you know, Hydro people were
4 there, younger, they were presenting something
5 like this, you know, with all the, all of this
6 data, you know, from Playgreen Lake, data after
7 data, you know. Sure it looks good, you know, it
8 looks good up there, but some of that stuff, it's
9 not true, you know, we -- us, we know, us
10 fishermen, that's the resource user there, we
11 know. We know what's there. We know the damage
12 that's there. We know.

13 You know, it's very important to
14 listen to, you know, grassroots people there. I
15 have seen the time there, you know, there was a
16 study done, you know, I don't know what year, 2012
17 or something like that, myself, I didn't see
18 nobody there who was doing that study. I don't
19 know.

20 This erosion, 2-Mile cut there and
21 8-Mile, the intakes there from Lake Winnipeg, the
22 corner of these towns, you know, they erode real
23 fast, you know. There was a beacon installed
24 there by Fisheries and Oceans, I guess, for us to,
25 you know, to mark that channel. You know, the

1 light there, it lights up in the night, and then
2 just in case you are out there I guess you know
3 where to go. But that beacon, I don't know how
4 many times it's been moved. It's been moved, you
5 know, every two years. That's how fast that
6 corner was away. Something has to be done there.

7 I recommended a meeting, I am talking
8 about, you know, a few weeks ago that they should
9 do something there, you know, put rock there to
10 stop that erosion. It's going to be expensive.
11 But if you don't do it now, you know, it's going
12 to be more expensive, you know, years down the
13 road.

14 So something has to be done there to
15 stop that. If you don't stop it, you know, it's
16 going to keep eroding, and maybe some day you're
17 going to have a 12-Mile Channel there. That's how
18 fast that shoreline erodes.

19 And on the Playgreen Lake side, you
20 know, like Langford mentioned there, you know, I
21 believe in 2012 or something like that, we -- I
22 was fortunate to help, being able to help them.
23 One of the guys here, you know, doing the cutting,
24 you know, and pulling logs out of their machines,
25 that was my job, you know. But I'm an older guy

1 already, I couldn't be in the deep snow they are
2 cutting. But the first time we started there, I
3 kind of thought, you know, I wonder if this is
4 going to work? I wonder if we're working for
5 nothing? But the following summer I travelled one
6 side of that 2-Mile there to my camp, where we cut
7 that shoreline there, you know, I travelled
8 through that shore. And you know, it looks pretty
9 good. You know, that ground isn't, you know, fall
10 into the water anymore, you know, it's just, you
11 know, it stays there. And that's when I believe
12 it does work.

13 And the following year, you know, we
14 did some work at 8-Mile again, and I was helping
15 there as well.

16 And last year, there was no cutting
17 last year till this year. And I strongly believe
18 that we should continue doing this shoreline
19 clearing, you know. It does help that whole west
20 shore of Playgreen Lake, that's the worst part.

21 On the other side, you know, it still
22 erodes some areas, but it's more rocky, you know,
23 that side. So it's -- you know, that's what I
24 think should be done there, you know, continue
25 doing this cutting, you know, so much year after

1 year.

2 Like Langford said, your fishing, it's
3 really, you know, it really drops off. I pity the
4 fishermen that fish on the south end of that lake.
5 Me, I would never set a net there again. I
6 continue fishing on the north end because I had
7 experience fishing there, when I mentioned, you
8 know, when I was 16, 17 years old, I fished up
9 there with my dad. And that's how I know that
10 area, and I always go back to it.

11 And on the south end, you know, I
12 don't know how long you can continue fishing there
13 the way it is. You know, it's getting worse,
14 worse, worse.

15 And even the fishing in the river, I
16 haven't set a net in the river in the winter in I
17 don't know how many years. You know, even in the
18 winter it's bad, you know, your water is so dirty,
19 you know. You know, maybe you can set a net for
20 maybe a couple of days, that's about it, you have
21 to pull it out. And all the people that used to
22 have nets along the river, nobody is setting nets
23 anymore. Maybe an odd commercial fisherman does
24 set a net.

25 Most of our, you know, domestic fish,

1 you know, guys, you know, from the community, you
2 know, they go to these inland lakes. There's a
3 few lakes around Norway House, you know, on the
4 east inland, you know, that have good fish, good
5 eating fish, whitefish, pickerel. And if anybody
6 here knows Kinosoo Lake, it's one of the top, you
7 know, angling lodges over there, you know, it is a
8 good lake. And our late grandfather, our dad, you
9 know, had a trapline close to that area. So my
10 brother and I still go up there in the winter. He
11 traps, and we set a net on Kinosoo. You know,
12 that's where I get my fish in the winter.

13 I don't know what else I can --
14 there's so much stuff. There's so much stuff, so
15 much impacts, you know, in Playgreen Lake.

16 I just turned 68 last week. I'd like
17 to fish a few more years, but I prefer Lake
18 Winnipeg and, like I said, north end of Playgreen
19 Lake. And the fish in Lake Winnipeg, it's
20 farther, farther travelling. You burn maybe 120,
21 130 litres a day just to go there and back.
22 That's how far we have to go, you know,
23 distance-wise it's a long ways. Because we go as
24 far as Limestone Point, and some of us go to
25 Little Black River area, Spider Island area. I

1 fished there many years as well. When I was a
2 little younger, you know, I fished there, but I no
3 longer go to that area.

4 So about Playgreen Lake, like I said,
5 it's really, you know, it's damage has been done,
6 you know. I don't know how to fix it, can never
7 fix it.

8 And I guess that's all about I have to
9 say. Thank you for listening to me.

10 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Elder
11 Apetagon. Perhaps we'll take a short break and
12 come back just after 11:00 o'clock.

13 MR. LENTON: Yes, we can do that. I
14 understand that Mr. Saunders just has a few
15 concluding remarks.

16 THE CHAIRMAN: We can do that right
17 now.

18 MR. LENTON: Okay.

19 MR. SAUNDERS: Thank you. I just
20 wanted to share the challenges that we go through.
21 I forgot to mention that one of the challenges
22 that we have as commercial fishermen on Playgreen
23 Lake is that equal certification. And this is a
24 market-driven initiative that comes in where it
25 asks the fish that you harvest from the lake has

1 to be sustainable. And then that's a double-edged
2 sword for us. We can say that Playgreen Lake is
3 no longer sustainable, therefore, we cannot fish.
4 Then we don't fish, we can't harvest fish, right?
5 So that impacts us.

6 Then on the other hand we can say,
7 well, it's sustainable. Then we lie, we're not
8 telling the truth. And that's what I call a
9 double-edged sword, that's a challenge for us.

10 You know, we see a lot of changes.
11 And just a brief history in regards to where, this
12 old man, Elder Andrew Evans, when I was in council
13 he used to come and say, when am I going to be
14 compensated for removing me from my fishing
15 grounds? So I started listening to him, what he
16 was talking about and, you know, I started
17 conveying that information that he was saying.
18 And he started talking about the 2-Mile Channel,
19 the location where the 2-Mile Channel was created.
20 And he started talking about the stories, about
21 how this area used to be rich in fish. And it was
22 a spawning ground where the fish migrated, and the
23 fish was so abundant in that area. He used to
24 talk about two channel, two currents going along
25 the shore, and he used to talk about the beach.

1 It was all sandy beach. In some areas there's
2 rock. And it used to be just that inside current,
3 and then the outside current. And then in the
4 middle, there used to be weeds where the fish used
5 to be. And he said, you could just see nets,
6 flags, all over. And that's where all the
7 fishermen from Norway House went to fish at the
8 beginning of the season. And they would catch
9 their limit and then move away. And then on the
10 north side of it, where they used to go harvest
11 sturgeon. And he said, that's what I'm talking
12 about, me being removed from my fishing grounds.
13 When am I going to be compensated for that?

14 These are just, I just wanted to share
15 that with you, the challenge of equal
16 certification, and the history of where the
17 location of 2-Mile. And again, back to the
18 communication of us commercial fishermen being
19 able to speak about the issues, not just the money
20 part, we want to talk about the issues. The money
21 part can come in afterward, you know. We want to
22 mitigate what's going on, and the shoreline
23 stabilization is one of the things,
24 recommendations.

25 And then other things is, how can you

1 put a value on what's happened of our Treaty, our
2 right, our way of life has been altered in a way
3 for Playgreen Lake and for our families. Not just
4 commercial fishermen, for our families, the other
5 families in the community. Everything has been
6 altered.

7 When you travel down the street of
8 Winnipeg and you see a pothole, you avert it, and
9 then you complain to your mayor to fix it. They
10 fix it. Then you don't have a problem anymore.
11 In our community, we have those obstacles
12 continuing, continuing, multiplying every year,
13 and nobody is there to fix it. We just got to
14 learn to adapt and live with it. But that's no
15 longer acceptable in our eyes. Because for the
16 future generation, what are we leaving?

17 You know, 1962, when our grandfathers
18 and our elders stood by the beach at Sandy Island
19 and said that this is where our fish station is
20 going to be, they didn't have a blueprint, all
21 they had was a stick and they drew in the sand,
22 this is where our fish station is going to be,
23 this is where our ice house is going to be, every
24 man will bring in four big logs for the
25 construction of the ice house. That's how our

1 co-op was created and that's how our co-op
2 continues to grow, is that we have to learn from
3 our elders, and we have to protect for what we
4 have. Because if we don't do it, then we forget
5 what was set up for us to continue to move
6 forward. And we know that we have to adapt to
7 what changes we have in our lives. Right. But we
8 need to be heard, we need -- there has to be a
9 dialogue here. Not that we accept there's a
10 little bit of dollar here, be quiet, go away, no
11 longer is acceptable. We have to be consulted
12 individually, and not by going to Chief and
13 Council and saying that we're consulting you, go
14 consult your people. It's a two-way street. I
15 don't believe there's a two-way street. I always
16 said that to Chief and Council, you can't go say
17 duty to consult to somebody else, and you don't
18 even consult us, your people, you know.

19 But, again, there's a lot of things
20 that I continue to say. And I'm building up here
21 so I'd better slow down for a bit. And, you know,
22 thank you very much again, Mr. Chair and the
23 committee, for giving us the opportunity to speak.
24 And if anybody has any questions, by all means.

25 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you,

1 Mr. Saunders. Does that conclude your
2 presentation?

3 MR. LENTON: Yes, it does.

4 THE CHAIRMAN: We'll take a break now
5 until ten after 11:00, and we'll come back. And
6 if anybody has questions, we'll proceed then.

7 (Proceedings recessed at 9:55 a.m.
8 and reconvened at 11:10 a.m.)

9 THE CHAIRMAN: Can we come back to
10 order? We're open now for some questions.

11 I would like to note, in particular to
12 the other participants, that the cross-examination
13 rules we have put in place for these proceedings,
14 participants can only cross-examine other
15 participants if today's presenter has taken a
16 position with which you don't agree, or which
17 might negatively impact the position you wish to
18 take, or if you wish to challenge something that
19 they have put on the record. One thing we will
20 not tolerate anymore is a whole series of softball
21 questions from participants to participants as we
22 have seen in the past.

23 So having said that, first, Hydro, do
24 you have any questions?

25 MR. BEDFORD: No, we don't.

1 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

2 Participants, I'll change up the order a little
3 bit, Interlake Reserves Tribal Council,
4 Mr. Shefman?

5 MR. SHEFMAN: We aren't opposed in
6 interest.

7 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
8 Ms. Whelan Enns, any questions?

9 MS. WHELAN ENNS: No, Mr. Chair.

10 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
11 Mr. Williams? No.

12 MR. WILLIAMS: No questions.

13 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. I believe
14 some of the panelists have some questions.

15 Mr. Yee?

16 MR. YEE: Thank you very much for your
17 presentation. I really appreciated some of the
18 video on the shoreline stabilization projects.
19 And I guess, Mr. Saunders, you mentioned that this
20 was the fifth, you mentioned there was at least
21 five projects funded by Manitoba Hydro. I was
22 just wondering, when did they begin and is this
23 anticipated to be an annual thing to continue on?

24 MR. SAUNDERS: 2012 is a first
25 project. And we like to believe that it's an

1 ongoing process, an ongoing project happening year
2 to year. I did speak on Ruth Kristjanson, on a
3 50-day work project for upcoming winter season,
4 2015/2016.

5 MR. YEE: Thank you very much.

6 THE CHAIRMAN: Ms. Suek?

7 MS. SUEK: Again, thank you very much
8 for your presentation. I wanted to ask, I do have
9 a few questions. One of them is the chart that I
10 shared with you at the break. It's a chart by
11 Manitoba Hydro on the changing fish within
12 Playgreen Lake. And I'm wondering if you can
13 comment on it, from your knowledge and experience
14 of actually being on the lake? There seems to be,
15 from their chart, a loss of the whitefish. And
16 there is quite a bit of other that is in that
17 chart that is not categorized. Can you comment on
18 your perception of that chart and what the reality
19 is for you?

20 MR. SAUNDERS: The realities, just
21 seeing the chart now, and earlier I made a comment
22 in regards to the CAMP saying that there is
23 abundance of fish, and my comment was, tell us
24 where they are? But the chart itself, the first
25 time I actually seen the chart, this chart does

1 tell the truth.

2 The others are white, jackfish,
3 mullets, other species. The decline of whitefish
4 is there, the yellow, and the blue is -- well,
5 northern pike, I would think northern pike falls
6 under the grey category because there's a whole
7 bunch of them, and also mullets. And walleye is,
8 I would argue this is too nice, this is too of a
9 good chart. I think there is a decreased amount
10 of pickerel also. And when I say there is no
11 fish, it's the quota fish that we are talking
12 about, that we harvest commercially.

13 MS. SUEK: Right. And the other fish
14 that you talked about, the other categories, are
15 those commercially valuable fish? Are those fish
16 that are useful to you, or are they not the fish
17 that you want and need?

18 MR. SAUNDERS: Well, they weren't
19 targeted fish. Jackfish, I just learned recently
20 that the price of it increased to a dollar a
21 kilogram. And the price of mullet, that sucker,
22 have increased itself. So they weren't targeted
23 fish, so therefore we weren't harvesting them.
24 And there's a lot of damage done to your nets if
25 you harvest those kind of fish. They are very

1 rough on your nets, the jackfish.

2 MS. SUEK: Oh, okay.

3 MR. SAUNDERS: Where normally it's not
4 targeted fish, we go after the quota fish. But
5 recently because there's no -- if you look at that
6 2010 chart, a very small amount of whitefish,
7 therefore, we have no choice but to go after the
8 jackfish and the mullets, the suckers, right. And
9 our production shows that at the co-op.

10 MS. SUEK: Right, okay. Thank you.

11 I do have more questions. You talked
12 about the quality of the fish being different, you
13 feel that the quality, some of the fish is
14 different than it used to be. Can you talk a
15 little bit about what's the difference, how you
16 see that as different?

17 MR. SAUNDERS: You see, the difference
18 between Lake Winnipeg and the Playgreen Lake, in
19 my experience anyways, from what I have seen
20 growing up and when I was a manager at the co-op,
21 at the station also handling fish, is that the
22 fish in Playgreen Lake used to be called the
23 hunchback whitefish, the big whitefish. You know,
24 normal catch for a fisherman. When I was scaling,
25 I was scaling the fish at that time, early '80s,

1 was that they'd bring in -- we didn't have any
2 smalls, not much medium, but a whole bunch of
3 large and jumbos, because that's what they are
4 targeting.

5 MS. SUEK: Right.

6 MR. SAUNDERS: And then as the years
7 went on, that changed because they are going
8 after, the fish is starting to go away. Every
9 year it was different. And then we got forced to
10 go fish more into Lake Winnipeg. So the texture
11 of the fish, the firmness of the fish, and towards
12 to what it is today is very different.

13 MS. SUEK: Oh, okay. Thank you.

14 You talked too about not being able to
15 drink the water, assuming there is more sediment
16 in the water than there used to be, it may not be
17 as clear, maybe you can tell me if that's correct
18 or not. Has any organization ever tested on an
19 ongoing basis the water and why it's not drinkable
20 anymore? I mean, you know it's not drinkable
21 because you get effects from it. But has it ever
22 been tested by any organization that you know
23 about?

24 MR. SAUNDERS: I know there has been,
25 I think under the Northern Flood Agreement, the

1 MIA, the office of Environmental Monitoring Agency
2 have done some water quality testing. I haven't
3 seen any reports out of it yet, or even shared
4 with us about that. You know, the change of the
5 water, the early part of the spring you could
6 drink, like five, 10 years ago, like I said
7 before. Now we can't even do it. Even though it
8 looks clear, there seems to be something in there
9 that makes you sick, you know. So, yes, I would
10 say that more testing needs to happen. And your
11 question is, if there had been testing? Yes,
12 there has been testing but I haven't seen a report
13 on it.

14 MS. SUEK: So there may have been
15 testing, but it hasn't been communicated to you --

16 MR. SAUNDERS: No.

17 MS. SUEK: -- what the results were?

18 MR. SAUNDERS: Yeah.

19 MS. SUEK: You also mentioned about
20 the closing, you know, your request to close the
21 gates at certain times to allow the fishermen to
22 fish, and that Hydro did that once but didn't do
23 it another time. Do you think that there is a
24 possibility for you to work with Manitoba Hydro to
25 talk about, you know, when the water is released

1 and when it's not released, and working it out in
2 a way that would work for Norway House fishermen?

3 MR. SAUNDERS: We tried when we
4 requested, we put that request in. And I thought
5 the working relationship was there to, again, help
6 us out the following year and see if it works.
7 But we were told it's just a coincidence that it
8 happened that there was fish. And since then,
9 there is no other communication in regards to that
10 effect. I'd like to believe that -- I'd like to
11 think that we should be able to communicate and
12 work together on it. But there is always reports
13 that Hydro always tells us that they are not
14 affecting us because the report says it's not.
15 There's gates at Warren Landing, there's monitors,
16 whatever you call it, and they have different
17 areas that they say that it's not. But like,
18 again, it's us that live the lake, we know the way
19 it is, and hopefully that we can put aside some of
20 these studies and use common sense, you know.

21 MS. SUEK: So you believe that it does
22 affect the fishing?

23 MR. SAUNDERS: Oh yeah.

24 MS. SUEK: Could you -- I'm not
25 familiar with eco-certification that you

1 mentioned. Can you talk a little bit about what
2 that is?

3 MR. SAUNDERS: Eco-certification is
4 like, again, market driven. It's the big fish
5 buyers, under the public, general public. They
6 require that each fish, each species that is
7 harvested from the lake have a sticker that says
8 to the consumer that I am buying fish that is
9 sustainable from the lake. In a nutshell, that's
10 what eco-certification is.

11 MS. SUEK: Okay, thanks. That's all
12 my questions. Thank you very much.

13 THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Harden?

14 MR. HARDEN: Yes, I have just one
15 question on the chart that's shown on slide four,
16 if you can turn to that? Are the production
17 figures, are they established by the Fishermen's
18 Co-op?

19 MR. SAUNDERS: Yeah.

20 MR. HARDEN: Okay. And the black line
21 is your quota, is it?

22 MR. SAUNDERS: Well, it came from
23 Fisheries Branch and it was given to us.

24 MR. HARDEN: Oh, okay. So you
25 mentioned the quota being at one point 115,000,

1 and it seems in the recent years that looks to be,
2 from reading in the very small graph, about where
3 that black line falls. That's why I was
4 wondering.

5 MS. SAUNDERS: Yeah. Currently we
6 have 115. We used to have a lot more than that.
7 And most of our quota has been transferred to Lake
8 Winnipeg, because we couldn't harvest the fish.

9 Now, when I say 115, we can only
10 harvest 80,000 currently right now of quota fish,
11 in the last five years. So even when I talk about
12 the question you had in regards to working with
13 Hydro, in our graph, in our information, when they
14 did close the gate, we had a bunch of whitefish.
15 Our stats showed that we got whitefish on
16 Playgreen Lake when we asked to close the gate.

17 Can I just point out in the map where
18 the fish was caught? Can I?

19 THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah, absolutely.

20 MR. SAUNDERS: That's the location
21 where we harvest most of the whitefish, because
22 it's not impacted. And when we asked for the
23 gates to be closed, that's where a whole bunch of
24 whitefish was caught at that year. And then the
25 following year, when gates were not, previously

1 the gates were not open, we didn't catch anything.
2 And then when they opened the gates, when they
3 closed the gates, it worked. Then the following
4 year, when the gates were not open, then -- when
5 the gates were open, then we didn't get anything
6 again. So I don't know, if it's coincidence, it's
7 coincidence, but it's worth a try.

8 MR. HARDEN: All right. That was my
9 question just on the interpretation of that graph
10 there.

11 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. I have a
12 couple of questions.

13 Could you tell me a bit about the
14 fluctuation of lake levels on Playgreen Lake, how
15 much does it go up and down and is it different
16 than it was before 1976?

17 MR. SAUNDERS: The fluctuation in the
18 lake, I'll just use myself as an example. Since I
19 started commercial fishing in 1988, I think I
20 started fishing that year, I had to replace my
21 dock maybe about four times. And when you build a
22 dock, like the last one I built when 2011
23 happened, I built my dock where -- the level of my
24 boat, I leveled my boat with my deck. And I have
25 a 24-foot side prop, and the boat is about 2 feet

1 18 inches off from the water level. So I leveled
2 that off.

3 In a given year, last year the deck of
4 my dock was 2 inches just above water, a big
5 difference. Then sometimes in the fall, sometimes
6 in the fall, later fall, the water drops where my
7 deck, the deck is above, about 12 inches above my
8 boat. So that's the difference of the
9 fluctuation.

10 In certain years, the south -- you
11 know, the last couple of years what we have been
12 experiencing about Playgreen Lake is that
13 Playgreen Lake is getting wider, and the water is
14 not going anywhere, like the way it goes to go
15 down, because there is so much erosion happening
16 that the lake itself, it's becoming wider. The
17 basin is getting wider, bigger. So, therefore,
18 the water level, it doesn't fluctuate as much of
19 it, because it's got area to expand, to go to.
20 Right. That's the experience that we're starting
21 to, and it's talked about by commercial fishermen
22 and elders seeing what the impacts is.

23 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

24 Your quota, do you divide it up among
25 individual fishermen or is it just whoever catches

1 what sort of adds up to the 80,000 or 115,000?

2 MR. SAUNDERS: I think the way it's
3 working is we divide it amongst each other. And
4 that's why our co-op keeps on growing.

5 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.

6 MR. SAUNDERS: We do it the other way,
7 then there's no co-op.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: Right.

9 MS. SAUNDERS: So we do that, we
10 divide amongst each other.

11 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you.

12 Now, how much of your fishing is done
13 on Lake Winnipeg as opposed to Playgreen Lake now?

14 MR. SAUNDERS: Like I said, we fish
15 Playgreen Lake maybe four weeks in the fall, where
16 we have that 115,000. So the majority of the
17 fishing is done -- like the 29 days of fishing is
18 done in the spring on Lake Winnipeg. And then in
19 the fall we do about two weeks, 14 days. In total
20 we do about close to 40, over 40 days of fishing
21 on Lake Winnipeg. And then we come in to do that
22 115, and we spend about 28 to 30 days on Playgreen
23 Lake to try to catch that 115, that 115,000 quota.
24 And we have maybe more, like double the amount or
25 almost triple the amount of quota on Lake Winnipeg

1 than we do on Playgreen Lake.

2 THE CHAIRMAN: So you do have a quota
3 on Lake Winnipeg?

4 MS. SAUNDERS: Yes.

5 THE CHAIRMAN: Elder Apetagon, you
6 spoke about your family going to fish in Mossy
7 Bay, is that on Lake Winnipeg?

8 ELDER APETAGON: Yes.

9 THE CHAIRMAN: Is that near Mossy
10 Point, which is down the east side of the lake?

11 ELDER APETAGON: Mossy Bay starts at
12 Mossy Point.

13 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mossy Point, yes.

14 ELDER APETAGON: It goes all the way
15 to Limestone Point.

16 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. I was just a
17 little curious about it. It's not a major issue.
18 So thank you very much for that.

19 Mr. Williams?

20 MR. WILLIAMS: Good morning, panel
21 members. Just for the clarity of the record,
22 Ms. Suek, panel member Suek made reference to a
23 Hydro chart which I presume is from Hydro's
24 document. But just if you could put the page
25 number on, that would be helpful for the record

1 and for us in the future.

2 THE CHAIRMAN: I think Mr. Lenton has
3 it.

4 MR. LENTON: That's page 85 of Hydro's
5 materials.

6 MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you.

7 THE CHAIRMAN: Good point. Thank you,
8 Mr. Williams.

9 Now, Pimicikamak, you were out of the
10 room when we started the questioning. Do you have
11 any questions for Norway House?

12 I noted also when you were out of the
13 room that questions are only if you have taken an
14 adverse position to what they have stated, so if
15 you don't agree with what they stated. It's not
16 an opportunity to lob softballs at them. So you
17 can come up, Mr. Settee.

18 MR. SETTEE: Thank you, panel. Good
19 morning everyone. I've just got a few questions,
20 it's about fish dogs also, fish quality rather.

21 Mr. Saunders, I am just going to ask
22 you if the fish dogs have been tested for mercury?

23 MS. SAUNDERS: Yes, they have.

24 MR. SETTEE: So you got communicated
25 with the information?

1 MR. SAUNDERS: We asked in regards to
2 there was a concern about mercury. And again Don
3 MacDonald of Fisheries, who were the manager up
4 north, stated that there has been studies ongoing
5 or that happened and there is no concern.

6 MR. SETTEE: Did you, I guess the
7 other question is did you people over there lose a
8 lot of the fishing nets due to debris and
9 fluctuations or freezing up in the winters?

10 MS. SAUNDERS: We don't, like not
11 commercial fish in the winter, but the recreation,
12 like for sustainability, yes, there has been nets
13 frozen.

14 MR. SETTEE: Okay, thank you. I guess
15 my next question is, the clean up you have done
16 there, we'd just like to know how much percentage
17 of employment was created, or what the numbers are
18 for the people that worked and benefited from the
19 clean up.

20 MR. SAUNDERS: We used the commercial
21 fishermen because the proposal comes from the
22 commercial fishermen, so we employ commercial
23 fishermen. And in regards to dollar amount, we
24 base it on per hour work, eight hour a day, and
25 also rental for skidoo, travel, because we travel

1 anywhere from 50 kilometres there and back to go
2 do the work, and skidoo rental is being paid.

3 MR. SETTEE: That's pretty good. How
4 many people were employed?

5 MS. SAUNDERS: We have 26, we have a
6 submission of proposal for 26, at any given time
7 22 to 26 individuals work.

8 MR. SETTEE: So I guess my last
9 question is, are you considering other areas for
10 cleanup? I think you mentioned there was just, on
11 your video there were 30 kilometres of areas that
12 are affected?

13 MS. SAUNDERS: Well, if we can find
14 somebody to fund the whole lake to be cleaned up,
15 we'll do it, you know.

16 MR. SETTEE: Thank you. Those are my
17 questions.

18 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Settee.
19 That concludes this presentation. So
20 thank you, Mr. Lenton, and particularly thank you
21 to Mr. Saunders and Elder Apetagon. Thank you for
22 coming here today and for preparing your
23 presentation and making it.

24 MR. LENTON: Thank you.

25 MR. SAUNDERS: Thank you.

1 THE CHAIRMAN: We have one member of
2 the public who wishes to make a presentation now.
3 So we'll give you a moment or two to move away
4 from the front and then we'll turn to him.

5 Sir, if you would state your name for
6 the record, then I'll ask the Commission secretary
7 to swear you in?

8 MR. GRANT: Very good. David Grant is
9 my name.

10 David Grant: Sworn

11 THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Grant, I should
12 just note that public presentations are limited to
13 15 minutes. It's a rule that we enforce strictly,
14 just for fairness. I have some flash cards and
15 I'll start flashing you at about five minutes, one
16 minute, and then time is up.

17 MR. GRANT: Okay. I find it ironic,
18 the last presentation I made on this topic was 10
19 years ago this month, and on the topic of the
20 floodway. And unfortunately, all my good ideas,
21 none of them were put in place. It would have
22 made things a lot easier for Hydro if they had,
23 but, oh well.

24 Anyway, this is to do with the impact
25 that our modern policy on the prairies is there's

1 water in my backyard, get it out of there so I can
2 farm, or there's water in our town, get it out of
3 here, and there's a creek going by our town, and
4 let's put walls along the side of the creek so it
5 doesn't spill into our yard. That works well for
6 that little town, but applied to the whole basin,
7 suddenly you've got way too much water in
8 Winnipeg. And suddenly you've got Lake Winnipeg,
9 which is the pot that everything flows into, with
10 a big problem.

11 So this is the implications, and we'll
12 see if this works. Earlier, an earlier version of
13 this presentation, I had some assistance from
14 University of North Dakota, Bethany Kurz. She
15 worked on their Waffle program down there.

16 And I guess, basically, the stuff in
17 red is probably the more important thing, that the
18 major streams going into Lake Winnipeg, policy
19 change can mitigate future problems. And I think
20 policy has been one of the reasons that we have
21 the problem that we have experienced in the last
22 few very wet years.

23 And I'll move on quickly to try and
24 observe the 15 minute thing, and there's more of
25 this that is here for your reference later.

1 Sources of flood water, this is all
2 obvious stuff. The places water comes from,
3 again, pretty obvious. This is an explanation of
4 the red, because that was the part that was
5 affected. This is the part of the basin that is
6 the flattest. I think it's been said that it's
7 the flattest, one of the plat flattest areas on
8 earth, probably because it was a lake bottom and
9 nothing much happened to it since it was a lake
10 bottom. So it doesn't have a lot of gullies in
11 it.

12 But, anyway, that's one of the
13 problems of trying to avoid flooding. And the
14 most obvious thing was enhanced drainage. There
15 were major floods here, obviously, forever. The
16 cost of mitigation goes up when you put a little
17 town right beside the creek. That's the part that
18 gets flooded. It's a nice place to be in the
19 summer, because there's water and there's
20 transportation 200 years ago, but now there are
21 problems.

22 And that's just an explanation of why
23 costs go up.

24 And ag practices, the drainage schemes
25 that people use, like tiling fields and replacing

1 the meandering creek with a nice deep straight
2 ditch, they do wonders for getting thunderstorm
3 water off the fields and not hurting the crop, but
4 they are an anathema to those of us that manage
5 water and that are afraid of downstream water.
6 And we're still making improvements on this.

7 Those who try to convince us in the
8 media that it's all because of global warming that
9 we're getting flooding in Winnipeg are also
10 strongly in denial, that drainage changes over the
11 last 100, 150 years have had any effect. I
12 contend that they are the major effect.

13 This is just your background, this is
14 where the water, when the water occurs in the Red
15 River? Typically heavily spring runoff. April is
16 the big month. May it's tapering off. If we had
17 nice mini storage across the basins, all the
18 basins emptying into Lake Winnipeg, if they all
19 had the 200 years ago level of mini storage, like
20 swamps and creeks and so on, if we went back to
21 there, we'd have a lot of flattening here. So the
22 spring would not be a 30, it would be a 20, and
23 the May would be a 20 and so on. But this severe
24 rise and fall in flow is largely because of the
25 way we have managed the drainage.

1 And it's not possible to go back to
2 those old ways, but we can, we could 10 years ago
3 have rebuilt our mini storage across the province.

4 And peak flow at the city, again,
5 these are drawings we have seen before. Funding
6 goes to drainage projects and little water is
7 stored, crops and towns suffer, and lakes
8 overflow. The other consequence of draining the
9 water the heck out of here because we don't want
10 it is because it isn't sitting on the land, and
11 that's where well water comes from. Well water is
12 land that was sitting on somebody's field and
13 soaked in. If it's never sitting on its field
14 because you tiled it and we've got a ditch, then
15 the water table goes down and down over the years.

16 California has a problem because the
17 water use changed and the pumping has gone crazy;
18 Colorado the same. But in Manitoba, it isn't
19 because we're stealing the water with deeper and
20 deeper wells and feeding more and more industries,
21 it's purely because you're not letting it soak in.

22 Anyway, so I'll move on. The fallacy
23 of the 700 year flood, that's not really related
24 to us, but it is in a way because the idea that
25 the water in the lake is a result of some

1 monstrous weather activity ignores the fact that
2 the water is there because it drained faster.

3 The other consequence is that if the
4 water was drained out of somebody's backyard and
5 into the lake, and didn't go into the aquifer in
6 that little town, there's more water in the lake.

7 So with all these drainage
8 improvements, we have more of the water that falls
9 in the basin going to the lake and less of it
10 going to support crops and wetlands, and less of
11 it in the water table. So the subterranean
12 resource is being depleted for quite a few
13 decades. So I would question -- Hydro didn't ask
14 for all this water, Hydro gets all this water. So
15 in a dry year, draining it out of Morris and
16 draining it out of Souris, and getting it into
17 that lake faster helps, because there's more water
18 to make power with. And then when there's way too
19 much water, they've got it too. So it's a curse
20 and a blessing. But certainly it's a thing that's
21 policy related because -- I have been advocating
22 for 15 years now that Manitoba build more small
23 wetlands, tried to get Ducks Unlimited on board,
24 again, in the early stages after the '97 flood and
25 didn't get very far. The guy in charge of that

1 program said the Minister promised him two
2 wetlands in the next couple of years. And I guess
3 of the idea of 10,000 wetlands was a dream.

4 So, anyway, moving on.

5 Again, the idea that there's a 700
6 year flood ignores the fact that if drainage
7 happens fast, then what Winnipeg sees, would have
8 seen in the years 1000 to 1700, we're going to get
9 a couple times in the next hundred years because
10 of all the wonderful drainage efforts. Civil
11 engineers are wonderful, they can do a great job
12 of getting the water out of here.

13 So, again, don't need to get into all
14 these details. So to say that Winnipeg is
15 protected from a 1 in 700 year flood, the
16 unfortunate thing with that is when it hits the
17 papers and the TV, people think, oh, good, we're
18 protected for 700 years, ignoring the fact that if
19 the 700 they are talking about was from 1800 back,
20 it's only, you know, that's going to happen two or
21 three times in the next century we're going to get
22 one like that. And if they double the amount of
23 drainage, it could be happening every 20 years.
24 So we shouldn't ever use that term. We could use,
25 Winnipeg is protected by 1.3 times the amount of

1 water from '97, if that is the way it is. Because
2 the engineers know how much water was there and
3 they know how much we're protected against. So as
4 a practical person, I'd much rather see they use a
5 ratio like that 110 percent or whatever. It would
6 make people feel comfortable, but it wouldn't
7 imply a monster guarantee like this one.

8 And Corps of Engineers uses different,
9 or comes up with different numbers. And I'm not
10 sure what that says about consistency and
11 practices for calculation.

12 And the other people have said that
13 the flooding events we have had are going to
14 happen more often just because of the drainage.
15 And then we get into more drainage stuff, too much
16 drainage.

17 Probably running out of time.

18 Deflecting the blame. Again, global
19 warming is the easy one to pick on. We have all
20 seen this, not lately thankfully, but this is a
21 lovely farm field. And this is just a picture I
22 took to support the idea of storage versus
23 drainage.

24 This valley in Lumsden, in spring we
25 can guess that a couple hundred years ago it would

1 have flooded, but now we can't afford that because
2 we have got a highway through there, and we have
3 got little towns and so on. And the fertile
4 valleys, the fertile land is larger that way
5 because, just like the Nile Delta, when there's a
6 flood and the water sits for a month, what's left
7 is wonderful soil. And we don't have that. You
8 can see what we do with our little creeks, we
9 don't let them flood across the farmland, we keep
10 them little pipes, in effect. And that's again
11 very near that valley and near Qu'Appelle.

12 And so we restrain these things, we
13 don't replenish the aquifers. There's some
14 problems that way. As I say, the towns and farms
15 are harmed by getting the water out of there
16 faster.

17 And the other thing we find, we have
18 all heard in the news, is a lot of our towns are
19 dependent on their little bridges, and the
20 floodwaters weaken the footings and you lose your
21 bridge.

22 So re-establishing wetlands was the
23 thing I was recommending 15 years ago when MFA
24 first got into the process, and again ten years
25 ago with CEC hearings. We still aren't doing

1 that, although I am pleased to hear that a little
2 bit of that activity is going to happen on the
3 Assiniboine. So we're going to protect Headingley
4 maybe with a pond. It's not like building ten or
5 15,000-ponds, but finally that's the first storage
6 project -- well, I shouldn't say that because the
7 MFA protection of Winnipeg is a storage project.
8 The lake south of the city takes most of the
9 water. This is again revealed by one of the MFA
10 presenters ten years ago, is that when a zillion
11 gallons of water heads toward Winnipeg in a bad
12 spring, a little over .5 of a zillion is stored in
13 a lake.

14 But, anyway, Waffle storage is another
15 one that works nicely for farmland, because you
16 just have to make sure the road on the downstream
17 end of that farm is a metre higher than the farm,
18 and there is your storage. You can store water.

19 It was said that, gee, that means the
20 guy doesn't get on his land early because he's got
21 this water there. The big problem here, before
22 you can put a crop in, is getting the soil warm.
23 And when you think about it, when you have a rice
24 paddy with a foot of water on your land in the sun
25 in April, it does a better job of thawing the land

1 out than it does just sitting with snow on it. So
2 that trade-off was a very good one for the farmers
3 in North Dakota. Where they had waffling, they
4 got the crop in earlier, because they didn't have
5 to wait as long for the frost to come out.

6 Anyway, I have to go through these
7 fast.

8 So the idea of macro storage is sort
9 of a good idea too, again, referring to the
10 floodway. The other advantage is getting the
11 nutrients out of the water, and that was one of
12 the big points that I was making ten years ago.
13 And in recent years people are actually doing the
14 harvesting of bulrushes and they are talking about
15 it. It could have been in a big way if we
16 diverted some of the bridge building funds from
17 ten years ago, 15 years ago, into wetland
18 creation. Because our existing floodway, the old
19 one was good enough if we could just keep that
20 water from hitting it so fast. And in those
21 10,000 new wetlands, we would have been harvesting
22 bulrushes. Lake Winnipeg would have been prettier
23 because all that nutrient would have been removed
24 in the small streams. Oh, well, that was a dream,
25 and it still could be, except that we don't have

1 the \$500 million bridge building fund to divert to
2 a good purpose like we did then.

3 And again, that's what I just said,
4 micro storage. I'll move on to, this is the
5 waffle thing where you hold water on a farm, on
6 farmland until we're done with it, that scenario
7 view of a waffled piece of land. And you can see
8 that while the water is sitting on that square of
9 land, the other land is still frozen, it's still
10 got snow on it. So that's again the idea of
11 melting it, thawing the soil underneath more
12 quickly. So, again, warming the soil. This is
13 some of the construction they do, because when you
14 have water on land you have to provide a way of
15 getting it off there in a hurry.

16 Anyway, so they do a little bit of
17 this work. This stuff is not -- it's custom
18 assembled but it's from normal rural galvanized
19 steel corrugated pipe, culvert stuff. And that's
20 what it looks like when they pull the plug. So
21 it's sort of like the bathtub, only bigger. So it
22 has a wire weir on it. So if there's bushes or
23 anything big floating down, somebody's old gas
24 tank floating down, it doesn't plug the hole. But
25 it does reduce the rate of water going into the

1 river by up to 30 percent. And you can see that
2 ten years ago, if we had been able to stop the, or
3 slow the flow and keep 30 percent of that water
4 out of the peak arriving at Winnipeg, that's a
5 pretty big deal.

6 So that's some of the benefits.

7 Anyway, reducing flood volume is the
8 big one and primary one, and flood relief to small
9 areas. Like Winnipeg has a ditch. Nobody else
10 has a ditch. So every other little town has to
11 count on sandbags, or walls, or moving out for a
12 month, none of them are particularly fun. But if
13 they did more of this waffle and more of this
14 wetland creation, then Souris wouldn't have a
15 problem, and Brandon wouldn't have a problem. And
16 it is ironic that it did come to pass.

17 So this is just flood levels at Grand
18 Forks, this is U.S. Army Corps. And that's some
19 more benefits. Again, the restoration of
20 wetlands, but you don't have to take the land out
21 of production where it's being stored on crop
22 land.

23 And once you have done that, then you
24 have built up your water, your subsurface water
25 and your crop will probably do better if it's got

1 water just a foot or two down.

2 Anyway, move on. We have been asked
3 to believe -- this topic of flooding and water has
4 been an interesting one over the last 20 years.
5 We have been asked to believe that the floodway
6 channel water is not any deeper than pre '97.
7 That was circulated to the media. Then callers
8 living south of the city called into the CBC and
9 said, in '97 I could get home, now I can't because
10 there's water over the road. How come? Well,
11 they came up with, there's ice on the water.
12 Well, no, it's because the design is that the
13 broom is 15 feet taller now than it was in '97.
14 That was part of the design. But the story was
15 that the water wasn't going to be any deeper. And
16 that all alternatives like storage in the post '97
17 period, we were told that they were going to
18 explore all possible solutions to this problem.

19 And then when the Manitoba Government
20 hired a very good engineering company to look at
21 the alternatives, the letter that said look for
22 alternatives said, as we know, storage doesn't
23 work, so anything that involves storage is not
24 allowed to be on your list of alternatives.

25 So, right away Jay Doering's idea of a

1 Ste. Agathe Lake, because there is a ridge there,
2 all these other storage methods like mine were all
3 off the table, and the one they built is a storage
4 plan.

5 So, anyway, just one of those little
6 ironies.

7 Now, I was at an RM council meeting
8 and the Reeve had been at a meeting with the
9 premier, and his comment for the farmers south of
10 the city was, well, these farmers would rather get
11 their compensation cheque than actually work for
12 their money, which didn't go over that well with
13 farmers.

14 So, I think we're running out of
15 things. Again, the idea of litigation,
16 cooperating with the Americans, if we could help
17 them with some money to hold their water back, if
18 we could help them with some of our money to
19 filter the critters out of their Devil's Lake
20 water, we would have spent about as much as we did
21 on lawsuits by cooperating, but we chose to kick
22 them in the shins.

23 Anyway, it can be used, micro storage
24 can be used, and there are other areas of
25 disagreement, unfortunately. And nutrient level

1 reductions, both of us want that. And peak flow
2 level reductions are what we all seek.

3 So I think we have run out of slides.
4 And in the living with the Red, the IJC,
5 International Joint Commission, is supposed to
6 settle border issues of water and so on, said that
7 we should not be going with litigation, we should
8 be helping each other and cooperating. And yet
9 Manitoba, all we hear about is lawsuits with the
10 Americans. I don't recall seeing in the media
11 ever an agreement with the Americans on nutrients
12 or water flow.

13 So they were worried too much water,
14 again, this is old stuff. And I'll try to respect
15 your one minute sign there, if that's what it was.

16 And one of the other issues, my
17 (inaudible) wanted me to mention that because her
18 kid has a problem with, when the water is high in
19 the sewer, it backs up in his basement. And
20 again, if the river level was controlled better,
21 and again that would be dependent on having a
22 better inlet structure, Hydro knows enough when
23 you take water out of a forebay for generation,
24 you take it from the bottom of the river.
25 Winnipeg, for some reason, the St. Norbert

1 structure takes it from the surface. Meaning you
2 can't even start to use it until the water is all
3 gone from the river, and that's when you need to
4 start taking that water out of the river into the
5 channel.

6 Okay. So that would have had a big
7 effect on the city, and home-owners in the city
8 would have loved to have reduced river levels when
9 flooding is happening.

10 So there we go. Conclusions, move on,
11 and I think that's it. Thanks, Terry.

12 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you very much,
13 Mr. Grant. Interesting presentation.

14 That brings today's proceedings to an
15 end.

16 MR. GRANT: There are no questions?

17 THE CHAIRMAN: No. I'm sorry, as part
18 of regular procedural guidelines, we don't ask
19 questions of the public presentations.

20 MR. GRANT: Okay. I was familiar with
21 the legislature where there is.

22 THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah. No, we're a bit
23 different, and we did that about a decade ago,
24 largely to save some of the public presenters from
25 what had been, previous to that, some fairly not

1 nice cross-examination. So, you know, if we had
2 any questions of clarification, we might ask them
3 of you, but I think your presentation was quite
4 straightforward, and there's more here for us to
5 read on our own time.

6 MR. GRANT: And I submitted it to your
7 secretary.

8 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes. It's become part
9 of the record now. Thank you, Mr. Grant.

10 So that brings today's proceedings to
11 a close. We won't have anything this afternoon.
12 We meet tomorrow morning when the Interlake
13 Reserves Tribal Council, I believe, will be making
14 their presentation. So 9:30 tomorrow. Documents?

15 MS. JOHNSON: Yes. We have NHFC, the
16 Norway House Fishermen's Co-op general outline as
17 submitted on February 23rd. Number 2 is their
18 presentation of today. And we have WPG 19, which
19 is Mr. Grant's presentation.

20 (EXHIBIT NHFC 1: Norway House
21 Fishermen's Co-op general outline)

22 (EXHIBIT NHFC 2: Norway House
23 Fishermen's Co-op presentation)

24 (EXHIBIT WPG 19: David Grant's
25 presentation)

1 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. If there's
2 no other compelling business, we will adjourn
3 until 9:30 tomorrow morning.

4 (Adjourned at 11:58 a.m.)

5
6
7
8
9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25

OFFICIAL EXAMINER'S CERTIFICATE

Cecelia Reid and Debra Kot, duly appointed
Official Examiners in the Province of Manitoba, do
hereby certify the foregoing pages are a true and
correct transcript of my Stenotype notes as taken
by us at the time and place hereinbefore stated to
the best of our skill and ability.

Cecelia Reid
Official Examiner, Q.B.

Debra Kot
Official Examiner Q.B.

This document was created with Win2PDF available at <http://www.win2pdf.com>.
The unregistered version of Win2PDF is for evaluation or non-commercial use only.
This page will not be added after purchasing Win2PDF.