MANITOBA CLEAN ENVIRONMENT COMMISSION

BIPOLE III TRANSMISSION PROJECT
PUBLIC HEARING

VOLUME 24

Transcript of Proceedings
Held at Winnipeg Convention Centre
Winnipeg, Manitoba

TUESDAY, NOVEMBER 20, 2012

## **APPEARANCES**

CLEAN ENVIRONMENT COMMISSION Terry Sargeant - Chairman
Pat MacKay - Member
Brian Kaplan - Member
Ken Gibbons - Member
Wayne Motheral - Member
Michael Green - Counsel to the Board
Cathy Johnson - Commission Secretary

MANITOBA CONSERVATION AND WATER STEWARDSHIP

Bruce Webb Elise Dagdick

MANITOBA HYDRO

Douglas Bedford - Counsel Janet Mayor - Counsel

Shannon Johnson

BIPOLE III COALITION Brian Meronek - Counsel Karen Friesen Garland Laliberte

CONSUMERS ASSOCIATION OF CANADA

Byron Williams - Counsel

Gloria Desorcey Aimee Craft - Counsel

MANITOBA METIS FEDERATION Jason Madden - Counsel

MANITOBA WILDLANDS and SAPOTAWEYAK CREE NATION Gaile Whelan Enns

GREEN PARTY OF MANITOBA James Beddome

PEGUIS FIRST NATION Robert Dawson - Counsel

TATASKWEYAK CREE NATION Ian Cluny Shaun Keating

Volume 24	Bipole in Flearing Willington	110 (211156) 20, 2011
APP	EARANCES CONTINUED:	Page 5453
PINE CREEK FIRS Charlie Boucher Warren Mills John Stockwell		

INDEX OF EXHIBITS  EXHIBIT NO. PAGE MH 91-102Manitoba Hydro's answers to 5524 undertakings	Page
MH 91-102Manitoba Hydro's answers to 5524	
ander ountings	
TCN 1 Submission, September 17 5524	
TCN 2 Submission, November 13 5524	
TCN 2 Submission, November 13 5524	

## INDEX OF PROCEEDINGS

Tataskwyak Cree Nation Presentation
Mr. R. Lowe, Mr. S. Keating, Mr. D. Mackenzie,
Ms. M. Spence, Mr. V. Spence 5457
Cross-examination by Mr. Bedford 5480
Cross-examination by Mr. Williams 5491
Questions by Panel 5502

Answers to Undertakings - Hydro

- 1 Tuesday, November 20, 2012
- 2 Upon commencing at 9:00 a.m.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Good morning. This
- 4 morning we have a presentation by Tataskweyak Cree
- 5 Nation. I'd just like to remind people in the
- 6 audience that we don't tolerate cell phones going
- 7 off or conversations during presentations.
- 8 Commission secretary, please swear in
- 9 the witnesses.
- MS. JOHNSON: Could you please state
- 11 your names for the record?
- MR. LOWE: Ron Lowe, adviser to TCN.
- MS. SPENCE: Melanie Spence,
- 14 councillor of TCN.
- MR. KEATING: Sean Keating, advisor to
- 16 TCN.
- 17 MR. MACKENZIE: Douglas Mackenzie,
- 18 Campbell Marr Law Firm
- 19 Ron Lowe: Sworn.
- 20 Melanie Spence: Sworn.
- 21 Sean Keating: Sworn.
- 22 Douglas Mackenzie: Sworn.
- THE CHAIRMAN: You may proceed.
- 24 MS. SPENCE: Good morning. This is a
- 25 submission by TCN to the Manitoba Clean

- 1 Environment Commission public hearing on Bipole
- 2 III transmission project.
- 3 Tataskweyak Cree Nation comprises more
- 4 than 3,500 Cree people who are the original
- 5 inhabitants of a territory in north central
- 6 Manitoba. We have lived in our ancestral homeland
- 7 since time immemorial, sustaining ourselves from
- 8 the bounty of the boreal forest fed by the mighty
- 9 Churchill and Nelson rivers.
- 10 We lived in harmony with nature,
- 11 respecting the natural rhythm of the seasons and
- 12 the habits of wildlife. Our spirituality is
- 13 founded on our relationships with our ancestral
- 14 homeland, where all that exists is interrelated,
- 15 land, culture and spirituality.
- 16 TCN's expression of the Cree world
- 17 view and Hydro development. The Cree world view
- 18 reflects core beliefs that arise through countless
- 19 generations of living in harmony and balance with
- 20 Mother Earth.
- 21 TCN undertook to articulate its world
- view following the signing of the 1992 Northern
- 23 Flood Implementation Agreement, which recognizes
- 24 Split Lake Tataskweyak Resource Area, and
- 25 establishes a large portion of it as the Split

- 1 Lake Resource Management Area, as shown on the
- 2 next page. The formal articulation of our world
- 3 view was necessary in order for outside parties to
- 4 understand the effects of the hydroelectric
- 5 development on our way of life.
- 6 Split Lake Resource Management Area,
- 7 Tataskweyak Resource Area.
- 8 Our core beliefs are expressed in
- 9 relationships which we have developed with Mother
- 10 Earth, relationships that have developed over
- 11 thousands of years. The relationships centre on
- 12 spiritual, physical and emotional relationships
- 13 with the land and water and are the essence of our
- 14 culture. If these relationships are destroyed,
- 15 then we are destroyed. Our relationships include
- 16 spiritual relationships with Mother earth;
- 17 historical relationships with the land; life
- 18 sustaining relationships with Mother Earth;
- 19 caregiver relationships and the duty of respect;
- 20 hunting, fishing, gathering and trapping
- 21 relationships; educational relationships; physical
- 22 relationships, trapping, camping, meetings and
- 23 burials; emotional relationships; social
- 24 relationships within the community;
- 25 socio-political relationships with other First

25

Page 5459

Nations; socio-political relationships with 1 outsiders; and the knowledge of ecological 2 3 relationships among non-human beings. 4 See appendix one from our overview summary -- Keeyask Generating Station -- TCN --5 Overview of Water, Land, June 2002, which 6 describes these relationships in more detail. 7 The customs, practices and traditions 8 that are integral to our cultural identity are 9 reflected in these relationships. 10 For TCN, the environment cannot be 11 12 divided into component parts and assessed. It is not divisible and separate from our cultural 13 14 identity. 15 In the words of Joesph Keeper, a Cree from Norway House who has worked for Cree 16 communities much of his life, and was involved in 17 the community development movement of the 1960s: 18 19 "Inherent in the Cree culture is how 20 we placed ourselves in our relationship to the land and all of 21 nature. It was a reciprocal 22 relationship. Nature contributed by 23 caring for the Cree and the Cree 24

contributed by caring for nature.

Page 5460 Within our culture, spiritual life, 1 2 family life, and livelihood activities 3 are not separated. These values and 4 beliefs become an integral part of an individual's personality." 5 The Mother Earth ecosystem model, 6 shown following, expresses our world view by 7 demonstrating the interrelatedness of all things 8 and the ecological processes that link them. 9 10 depicts the harmony and the balance that can be achieved among spiritual, physical and emotional 11 12 relationships in a sustainably developed 13 ecosystem. 14 This is the Mother Earth ecosystem model. The OWL process. We establish our 15 Overview of Water and Land, our OWL process, in 16 2001, as a way of assessing future significant 17 resource development projects in our ancestral 18 19 homeland, judging potential adverse effects 20 through the prism of the Mother Earth Ecosystem 21 Model and assessing impacts on the relationship with Mother Earth, including the tolerability of 22 23 such impacts. In particular, the OWL process was developed to assess the potential impacts of the 24 proposed Keeyask generating station. 25

- The OWL process is the basis of TCN's
- 2 environmental impact statement on any particular
- 3 substantial development projects. The OWL process
- 4 comprises extensive consultation with our members,
- 5 elders and resource harvesters and their
- 6 knowledge, values and wisdom about potential
- 7 impacts of resource developments, particularly
- 8 Hydro projects.
- 9 We also use this process to assess the
- 10 potential impacts of Bipole III.
- 11 Ancestral Homeland Ecosystem Model.
- 12 The Ancestral Homeland Ecosystem Model, as shown
- 13 below, is a simplified version of the Mother Earth
- 14 Ecosystem Model which was developed to apply our
- 15 world view to interpret events which have impacted
- 16 upon our ancestral homeland ecosystem.
- 17 Our homeland ecosystem is depicted by
- 18 a series of circular bands, the innermost of which
- 19 contains plants, animals, the landscape, the
- 20 waterscape and TCN. They are connected by the
- 21 relationships identified above. The cumulative
- 22 strength of the relationship is represented by the
- 23 web.
- 24 The red arrow on the left represents
- 25 outside influences or historical events and

- 1 agreements which have impacted our homeland
- 2 ecosystem. The brown arrow on the right
- 3 represents demand for resources. The orange arrow
- 4 pointing towards the outer green band represents
- 5 the resilience of our homeland ecosystem. Most
- 6 significantly, the outer green band represents
- 7 harmony and balance within our homeland ecosystem.
- 8 The following two figures using the
- 9 Ancestral Homeland Ecosystem Model depict the
- 10 historical events which have impacted upon our
- 11 homeland ecosystem, and the resulting disturbance
- 12 to harmony and balance, before and after hydro
- 13 development.
- 14 It is evident that even before Hydro
- 15 development, a number of outside influences had
- 16 disturbed the harmony and balance within our
- 17 homeland ecosystem. However, our lands and our
- 18 waterways were largely unchanged, and as indicated
- 19 by the unchanged size of the orange arrows, we
- 20 were able to be resilient and maintain our
- 21 cultural identity.
- Homeland Ecosystem Model at present
- 23 before Keeyask. As indicated by the cracks in the
- outer green band, events of the last 50 plus years
- 25 substantially disrupted the harmony and balance in

- 1 our homeland ecosystem, the most profound of these
- 2 being Hydro development, which changed the
- 3 physical structure of the lands and water. Note
- 4 the weakened web and the smaller orange arrows.
- 5 As indicated by the size of the
- 6 exports arrow, our homeland ecosystem was
- 7 providing valuable resources for outsiders, but
- 8 its resilience was greatly limited.
- 9 The history and extent of hydro
- 10 development in the TCN resource area. Split Lake
- 11 is a widening of the Nelson River where it is
- 12 joined by the Burntwood River. It receives all
- 13 the water from the Winnipeg, Saskatchewan, Red,
- 14 Assiniboine, and other smaller rivers which empty
- 15 into Lake Winnipeq.
- 16 As indicated by the following excerpt
- 17 from Volume II of the Split Lake Cree Post Project
- 18 Environmental Review, History and First Order
- 19 Effects, August 1996, almost 124,000 acres of land
- in our resource area have been affected by 35
- 21 Hydro projects, including generating stations,
- 22 converter stations, transmission lines, including
- 23 Bipoles I and II, power lines, roads and rail
- 24 spurs and other related infrastructure.
- The following map from our January

- 1 2012 Keeyask Environmental Consultation Report
- 2 depicts key impacted waterways and generating
- 3 stations within our resource management area.
- 4 Key impacted waterways and generating
- 5 stations within our resource management area, and
- 6 there's the legend.
- 7 The key hydro projects included
- 8 Churchill River Diversion and Lake Winnipeg
- 9 Regulation in 1977, and the Kelsey 1960, Kettle
- 10 1970, Long Spruce 1977, the Limestone generating
- 11 station 1990. The CRD dewatered over 17,000 acres
- 12 of the Churchill River and increased flows down
- 13 the Burntwood River eightfold. LWR reversed
- 14 seasonal levels and flows on the Nelson River.
- 15 The generating stations flooded over 72,000 acres
- of land, not including the waterways, with
- 17 Stephens Lake tripled in size.
- 18 In effect, TCN was transported to a
- 19 different physical landscape without being
- 20 physically relocated.
- 21 The completely changed waterways
- 22 eroded shorelines, filled the waterways, including
- 23 Split Lake, with debris and silt, contaminated
- 24 fish with mercury, completely disrupted commercial
- 25 and domestic resource harvesting, and disturbed or

- 1 destroyed recreational, cultural and sacred sites.
- 2 These adverse effects occurred in the
- 3 past, and we continue to live with the accumulated
- 4 effects everyday.
- 5 The four generating stations are
- 6 responsible for approximately 75 percent of hydro
- 7 generated electricity in Manitoba. However, it
- 8 was not until the 1992 agreement that it was
- 9 formally recognized that TCN could also receive
- 10 benefits from the products of its ancestral
- 11 homeland.
- The 1977 Northern Flood Agreement and
- 13 the 1992 agreement were the culmination of years
- 14 of persistence by the TCN leadership to have the
- 15 effects of existing hydro development adequately
- 16 addressed. The NFA represented a first step
- 17 towards reclaiming the power and authority we once
- 18 held.
- The 1992 agreement was a large step
- 20 forward, giving substance to the promises under
- 21 the NFA, and for the first time, giving our
- 22 ancestral home a formal recognition through the
- 23 establishment of the joint Tataskweyak/Manitoba
- 24 Split Lake Cree Management Board which has the
- 25 mandate to advise the Tataskweyak and Manitoba

- 1 governments on land and resource allocations.
- 2 The 1992 agreement gave TCN the power
- 3 and authority to meaningfully engage Hydro in the
- 4 planning and development of the proposed Keeyask
- 5 generating station.
- 6 The disturbance within the TCN
- 7 resource area caused by the Bipole III
- 8 transmission project.
- 9 The 500 kV HVDC transmission line will
- 10 fragment 215 kilometres of the Split Lake resource
- 11 management area, and a further 16.6 kilometres of
- 12 the broader resource area, for a total of 236.6
- 13 kilometres. While a portion of the preliminary
- 14 preferred route was adjusted by Hydro to parallel
- 15 PR 280, in response to TCN concerns expressed in
- 16 its 2010 report, most of the route proceeds
- 17 through relatively pristine territory, including
- 18 the Stephens Lake area of special interest.
- 19 The five AC collector lines and the
- 20 construction power line cumulatively proceed for
- 21 84.5 kilometres through our RMA, and a further
- 22 105.5 kilometres through our resource area, for a
- 23 total of 190 kilometres.
- 24 The Keewatinoow converter station site
- 25 and the ground electrode site will require about

- 1 440 hectares of our resource area, and the ground
- 2 electrode line will traverse 10.5 kilometres of
- 3 our resource area.
- 4 The transmission line, collector
- 5 lines, construction power line and the ground
- 6 electrode line are about 437 kilometres in length
- 7 across our resource area, out of a total length of
- 8 1,584.5 kilometres.
- 9 In these terms, TCN will be the
- 10 community most impacted by Bipole III.
- 11 Our March 2011 report on Bipole III
- 12 Right-of-way and Expected Impacts, which forms
- 13 part of the Bipole III EIS, focused on the
- 14 transmission line and provided several maps
- 15 depicting physical interferences with TCN
- 16 commercial and domestic harvesting activities from
- 17 the line.
- 18 The transmission line proceeds just
- 19 north of TCN reserve number 171, and at one point
- 20 gets very close to the reserve.
- 21 The transmission line corridor will
- 22 traverse 11 TCN registered traplines.
- It is apparent from our March 2011
- 24 report that a high level of activity occurs within
- 25 the local study area of the transmission line.

- 1 Many traditional cultural sites and cabins are
- 2 within or close to the local study area, numerous
- 3 access trails are intersected by the line, and the
- 4 line proceeds through areas of hunting, trapping
- 5 and fishing activity.
- It is also apparent that the likely
- 7 impacts of the transmission line will comprise at
- 8 least nine interferences with relationships
- 9 reflecting the exercise of the customs, practices
- 10 and traditions which comprise our cultural
- 11 identity.
- 12 See appendix 2 comprising an excerpt
- 13 from our March 2011 report providing an analysis
- 14 of impact issues and interferences.
- 15 Negotiations with Manitoba Hydro to
- 16 address attendant impacts of the Bipole III
- 17 transmission projects on TCN.
- 18 Consultation with our members over
- 19 2010 and 2011 included 160 interviews. There was
- 20 overwhelming opposition to the Bipole III
- 21 transmission project, Bipole III, being built in
- 22 our resource management area.
- However, TCN could support Bipole III
- 24 if four conditions were met.
- Two of TCN's four conditions of

- 1 support for Bipole III included reaching agreement
- 2 with Hydro regarding: Compensation for the
- 3 impacts of the collective rights and interests
- 4 arising from the construction and operation of
- 5 Bipole III within our resource area; and business
- 6 training and employment opportunities associated
- 7 with the construction, operation and maintenance
- 8 of Bipole III.
- 9 TCN's view is that our 1992 agreement
- 10 sets out processes to address anticipated adverse
- 11 effects of hydro development, including required
- 12 second order components of hydroelectric
- 13 generation like transmission lines, specifically
- 14 Bipole III. However, TCN and Hydro have not
- 15 reached accord on the specific applicability of
- 16 the 1992 agreement provisions.
- 17 Initial negotiations commenced and
- 18 drafting of an AIP began. However, there have
- 19 been no meetings since July 2012 and many issues
- 20 are unresolved.
- Nonetheless, TCN and Hydro have made
- 22 some progress towards fulfilling the above noted
- 23 conditions, particularly in the area of business
- 24 opportunities for TCN companies. However, further
- 25 negotiations are needed to satisfy Hydro

- 1 obligations to TCN to fully address potential
- 2 adverse impacts of Bipole III.
- 3 See appendix 3 comprising a legal memo
- 4 of TCN's legal counsel, which analyses the
- 5 relationship of the TCN/Hydro negotiating process
- 6 to the Crown's section 35 duties, and to past
- 7 agreements between TCN and Hydro.
- 8 TCN's two other conditions for
- 9 supporting the Bipole III transmission project, as
- 10 identified in the March 2011 report, included
- 11 participating in and contributing to the Bipole
- 12 III EIS; and, conducting a consultation process
- 13 regarding the Keewatinoow converter station and
- 14 ground electrode site.
- 15 We acknowledge the fulfillment of the
- 16 first condition, TCN's two self-directed studies
- 17 funded by Hydro, the 2010 report entitled Bipole
- 18 III preferred route selection, which provided
- 19 comments on the alternative Bipole III routes, and
- 20 the aforementioned March 2011 report on expected
- 21 impacts form part of the EIS. Although, as will
- 22 be subsequently note, it is not clear to what
- 23 extent the 2011 report was used to determine
- 24 potential residual effects.
- 25 Section 35, consultation with respect

- 1 to the Keewatinoow converter station and ground
- 2 electrode site is anticipated to soon commence.
- 3 TCN's perspectives on the Bipole III
- 4 transmission project EIS. TCN has identified a
- 5 number of issues in the EIS pertaining essentially
- 6 to the identification and assessment of potential
- 7 adverse effects from Bipole III, mitigation and
- 8 monitoring of such effects, and compensation and
- 9 benefits.
- 10 Baseline data and TCN, ATK
- 11 incorporation.
- 12 It is unclear to what extent the ATK
- 13 contained in the TCN March 2011 report on Bipole
- 14 III expected impacts informed the EIS assessment
- 15 of impacts on domestic harvesting. Although it is
- 16 described at some length in the EIS chapter on
- 17 consultation, and ATK technical report number 2,
- 18 there is no reference in the EIS assessment of
- 19 impacts to the 2011 report. The maps produced
- 20 with the 2011 report were the product of
- 21 interviews with 60 TCN resource users, indicating
- 22 TCN's domestic resource harvesting activity within
- 23 the local study area of the transmission line.
- 24 The EIS assessment appears somewhat generic in
- 25 approach.

- 1 Fragmentation. As noted above, the
- 2 500 kV HVDC transmission line proceeds 236
- 3 kilometres across our resource area, while the AC
- 4 collector lines construction power line and the
- 5 ground electrode line intersect a further 190
- 6 kilometres. Much of the transmission line
- 7 proceeds through forested areas.
- 8 The habitat fragmentation technical
- 9 report stated that given that many wildlife
- 10 species, including woodland caribou, are sensitive
- 11 to habitat fragmentation and the associated
- 12 effects of habitat fragmentation, including
- increased grey wolf presence, edge effects and
- 14 increased public access to forested areas, habitat
- 15 fragmentation is considered a strong negative
- 16 effect.
- 17 The report further states: Mitigation
- 18 measures for the effects of fragmentation are
- 19 limited with the majority of mitigation measures
- 20 existing at the planning and routing stage of the
- 21 project.
- The EIS acknowledges fragmentation
- 23 from the transmission line is non mitigable and
- 24 effects may be long-term and uncertain with
- 25 particular respect to woodland caribou.

- 1 TCN acknowledges the two route
- 2 adjustments bring the transmission line closer to
- 3 PR 280 and substantial portions of the line still
- 4 proceed through undeveloped lands.
- 5 Significance of Bipole III residual
- 6 effects.
- 7 TCN members find that the EIS
- 8 determination that Bipole III will not cause any
- 9 significant residual effects very difficult to
- 10 understand or accept.
- We do not understand the incorporation
- 12 of the federal guidance where initially a residual
- 13 effect is only significant if effects are
- 14 long-term, greater than 50 years, have a large
- 15 magnitude, easily observed, measured and
- 16 described, and have a high geographic extent,
- 17 extend into the project study area.
- For TCN, the fragmentation and the
- 19 resulting cascading range of impacts caused by 437
- 20 kilometres of transmission lines through our
- 21 ancestral homeland will cause, in any ordinary
- 22 sense of the word, significant impacts.
- 23 Determination of cumulative effects.
- 24 We do not agree with the Federal guidance that
- 25 there will be only be cumulative effects from

- 1 Bipole III if its effects overlap temporally and
- 2 spatially with past projects. The 35 Hydro
- 3 projects in our RMA have been determined to have
- 4 no temporal effects and are largely included in
- 5 the environmental baseline. To TCN, these
- 6 projects may have occurred in the past but their
- 7 effects are felt everyday. To us, they are
- 8 cumulative in the understood sense of the word.
- 9 Each project has caused additional effects which
- 10 have accumulated over the last 50 plus years.
- 11 Bipole III will cause additional impacts.
- We are concerned about hundreds of
- 13 outside workers simultaneously constructing Bipole
- 14 III, the Keeyask generating station/transmission
- 15 project, and the Conawapa generating station, and
- 16 the potential impacts upon our community and
- members.
- 18 Environmental protection plan.
- 19 TCN acknowledges that the mitigation,
- 20 monitoring and management measures in the draft
- 21 environmental protection plan, EPP, go some way
- 22 towards redressing the potential impacts of Bipole
- 23 III upon relationships with Mother Earth, thereby
- 24 helping to maintain harmony, balance, in our
- 25 ancestral homeland.

- 1 We understand that Hydro has been
- 2 consulting with communities in the north to get
- 3 feedback on the draft EPP. We also understand
- 4 that there is reasonable flexibility in finalizing
- 5 the draft EPP to ensure the nature and scope of
- 6 monitoring and management, particularly access,
- 7 reflects community concerns and provides for
- 8 meaningful participation in monitoring activities.
- 9 We understand that biophysical
- 10 monitoring will likely be expanded to include
- 11 moose and fur bearers. We agree with this.
- 12 TCN also believes that socioeconomic
- 13 monitoring should be expanded to include domestic
- 14 harvesting.
- 15 Project benefits and compensation.
- 16 TCN believes that adverse effects of
- 17 Bipole III, which cannot be mitigated, must be
- 18 offset by replacements, substitutions, or
- 19 opportunities, and to the extent that adverse
- 20 effects remain addressed by compensation.
- 21 The community development initiative,
- 22 identified as a project benefit in EIS, is a
- 23 potential source for identifying and implementing
- 24 community measures to offset the damage to TCN
- 25 relationships with Mother Earth. However,

- 1 50 million divided among 60 communities over 10
- 2 years with no indication as to how the criteria
- 3 will be weighted does not allow for TCN to develop
- 4 meaningful measures to address adverse effects.
- 5 Moreover, TCN has consistently held that the
- 6 impacts from Bipole III will last as long as it is
- 7 in place. Compensation will need to be provided
- 8 for more than 10 years.
- 9 We understand that the northern
- 10 Aboriginal hiring preferences in a transmission
- 11 line agreement to be developed that will be used
- 12 to implement training, employment and business
- 13 opportunities. As noted above, we will be
- 14 negotiating contracts with Hydro with respect to
- 15 certain Bipole III components and are hopeful that
- 16 satisfactory arrangements can be concluded.
- 17 It would appear that, as the EIS has
- 18 determined there will be no significant residual
- 19 adverse effects from Bipole III, then no
- 20 compensation is identified. As we have already
- 21 pointed out, this is not a defensible position.
- TCN requirement of harmony and balance
- 23 in respect of the Bipole III transmission project.
- It is apparent to TCN that there will
- 25 be significant negative residual impacts from

- 1 Bipole III on ecological processes, which will
- 2 necessarily cause negative impacts on our
- 3 relationships with Mother Earth, upsetting harmony
- 4 and the balance in our ancestral homeland.
- 5 A range of measures, comprising
- 6 mitigation, offsetting measures, and compensation
- 7 is required to redress these negative impacts to
- 8 make any damages tolerable, to sustain our
- 9 relationships and to improve overall harmony and
- 10 balance in our ancestral homeland.
- 11 Doug Mackenzie, our legal counsel of
- 12 TCN, will speak about the legal opinion that is
- 13 attached.
- 14 MR. MACKENZIE: Good morning, members
- of the Commission, Manitoba Hydro proponents, and
- 16 fellow participants. The legal opinion that I
- 17 offered is attached as an appendix, which for this
- 18 part of the presentation I will not read. The
- 19 Commission members and others will have an
- 20 opportunity to review it.
- I will, though, make a couple of
- 22 summary comments with respect to it. TCN, like
- 23 other First Nation members, has constitutional
- 24 rights under section 35 of the Constitution Act
- 25 established in 1982, as you would well know.

- 1 TCN also has a number of unique
- 2 agreements that it has made over the years with
- 3 Manitoba Hydro, and in some cases with other
- 4 parties, specifically the Government of Canada,
- 5 the Government of Manitoba. These include the
- 6 1977 Northern Flood Agreement, the 1992 agreement
- 7 which implemented a number of measures,
- 8 significantly implemented measures that were
- 9 contained in the 1977 agreement, more recently a
- 10 2009 joint Keeyask development agreement, and
- 11 collateral to that an adverse effects agreement.
- 12 And there is an interrelatedness of TCN's section
- 13 35 rights and many of those agreements.
- 14 Interestingly, the 1977 agreement of course
- 15 predated those constitutional provisions.
- 16 However, if we were to move to the
- 17 most recent of the agreements that I mentioned,
- 18 the adverse effects agreements arising out of the
- 19 2009 joint Keeyask development agreement, TCN,
- 20 through many years of negotiations, worked with
- 21 Manitoba Hydro, identified from the TCN
- 22 perspective those many things that would be done
- 23 to impact adversely their Aboriginal rights, most
- of which are identified in the appendix which
- 25 talks about the relationships that Tataskweyak

- 1 members have and the relationships that exist
- 2 within their resource area.
- 3 And although the Crown has the major
- 4 responsibilities under the Constitution when it is
- 5 taking actions to allow an infringement of
- 6 Aboriginal rights, TCN and Hydro, in the case of
- 7 the Keeyask adverse effects agreement, were able
- 8 to address measures relating to the adverse
- 9 effects that would be caused upon TCN and its
- 10 members, such that TCN is of the view, which we
- 11 believe Hydro shares, that if and when Keeyask is
- 12 the subject of licensing decisions, Tataskweyak
- 13 will be able to say we considered our Aboriginal
- 14 rights, we worked through procedures with Hydro
- 15 that satisfy our concerns, and we are ready to
- 16 disclose to you what they are.
- 17 That's the process that Tataskweyak is
- 18 hopeful will still unfold. But as we sit in front
- 19 of you today, it is not fully unfolded. There is
- 20 more work to be done, certainly from Tataskweyak's
- 21 position.
- 22 And so the legal position that we have
- 23 put forward to complement the Tataskweyak
- 24 presentation that you have heard this morning from
- 25 Councillor Spence is to enforce that Tataskweyak

- 1 believes it has Aboriginal rights that are being
- 2 and will be impacted by Bipole III, and that those
- 3 rights are best resolved by working through a
- 4 process with Manitoba Hydro to address those
- 5 rights.
- 6 And as we have said in concluding the
- 7 legal opinion, more needs to be done. As
- 8 Councillor Spence advised in the closing of her
- 9 paper today, there is a range of measures that are
- 10 necessary to allow the damages to be tolerable to
- 11 sustain their relationships and to improve the
- 12 overall harmony and balance in their ancestral
- 13 homeland.
- 14 Those are my comments, thank you.
- 15 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you,
- 16 Mr. Mackenzie.
- 17 Are there any other presentations to
- 18 be made? Okay, we'll have an opportunity for some
- 19 cross-examination. Manitoba Hydro?
- MR. BEDFORD: Good morning panel,
- 21 Mr. Lowe, Mr. Keating and Mr. Mackenzie, we have
- 22 met many times in the past so you know who I am.
- 23 But, Ms. Spence, I don't think you and I ever met.
- 24 My name is Doug Bedford. I work at Manitoba
- 25 Hydro, and my role at this particular hearing is

- 1 legal counsel to Manitoba Hydro.
- MS. SPENCE: Oh, okay. Hello.
- 3 MR. BEDFORD: I listened, I'll tell
- 4 you with great interest to the presentation. I
- 5 was particularly attracted to how it begins, a
- 6 focus on all of the important relationships that
- 7 the members of Tataskweyak Cree Nation have with
- 8 each other and the environment that surrounds
- 9 them. I understand that events, particularly in
- 10 the last I'll say 60 years, have disrupted, I
- 11 understand, the harmony and balance of those
- 12 relationships which are important to Tataskweyak
- 13 Cree Nation.
- 14 Can one of you, it doesn't matter to
- 15 me which one, confirm my understanding that if the
- 16 four conditions that are described later in the
- 17 presentation are met, particularly a condition
- 18 regarding compensation, and particularly a
- 19 condition regarding sharing of opportunities,
- 20 which I understand to be construction, could be
- 21 realized, that meeting those conditions helps to
- 22 restore some of the harmony and balance to all of
- 23 these relationships that have been disrupted?
- 24 MS. SPENCE: I want to talk about the
- 25 highway, highway 280. It should be paved. We

- 1 have 11 dams, nine directly affected to Split
- 2 Lake. That highway should be paved. And Conawapa
- 3 is on the table? You know, it should be paved
- 4 already. There's too much dust, there's too many
- 5 accidents. And the construction, I don't know,
- 6 this was the worst we have ever seen it this year.
- 7 And I'd hate for us to lose anyone on that
- 8 highway. There's too many accidents. There's too
- 9 many washboards, you know. The road was washed
- 10 out already. And it affects other communities,
- 11 surrounding communities.
- 12 You know, my husband is a fisherman
- 13 and their compensation hasn't even been looked at
- 14 or considered, and it's not in any of those
- 15 agreements, the JKDA or anything. Fishermen, they
- 16 haven't been included in any of agreements. And
- 17 past claims of Bipole I and II, they haven't been
- 18 considered, they haven't been fulfilled. There
- 19 are people that passed on already.
- 20 Manitoba Hydro can't continue, you
- 21 know, to bring, to develop in our area, and for
- 22 First Nations to be ignored. We will work as
- 23 community members, the surrounding communities,
- 24 Fox Lake, War Lake, we will work together to work
- 25 with Manitoba Hydro on this transmission line on

- 1 our terms, in agreement with TCN members, I mean
- 2 our First Nation.
- MR. BEDFORD: Could I suggest
- 4 Ms. Spence, at the risk of making Ms. Johnson to
- 5 my immediate right and Mr. Neufeld a little
- 6 further to my right quite nervous, that the topics
- 7 of perhaps paving highway 280 and dealing with one
- 8 or two of the other concerns you mentioned could
- 9 perhaps become part of a discussion about
- 10 compensation and how compensation monies might be
- 11 practically used, in addition to opportunities and
- 12 what opportunities could flow from perhaps paving
- 13 a highway.
- MS. SPENCE: Well, we need more
- 15 ongoing jobs, which would lead to more class one
- 16 drivers and crane operators, you know. What is
- 17 happening now in our First Nation, monies are
- 18 coming in but they are not being utilized
- 19 properly. The people of TCN aren't being trained
- 20 the way they should be. You know, our joint
- 21 ventures need to be revised. Like I don't know if
- 22 I'm going off topic here, but we have got a lot of
- 23 concerns where we are inviting Manitoba Hydro to
- 24 come speak to the First Nation of Split Lake.
- There's just so many things that we

- 1 have to talk to you about, like the company.
- 2 MR. BEDFORD: If I may, I think you
- 3 are right on topic, because I well know that the
- 4 objective of my company that I work for is
- 5 ultimately to try and restore harmony and balance.
- 6 And that is very much a part of the presentation
- 7 you gave us this morning, is that Tataskweyak Cree
- 8 Nation is not in harmony and balance because of
- 9 all the disruption to all of the relationships.
- MS. SPENCE: Yeah.
- MR. BEDFORD: So I can suggest to you
- 12 that my client often becomes frustrated when
- 13 compensation is paid and the results don't seem to
- 14 reflect any restoration of harmony and balance.
- 15 So it's certainly not adverse to paying
- 16 compensation, and it certainly wants to work with
- 17 Tataskweyak Cree Nation, but its ultimate
- 18 objective I think is exactly the same as that of
- 19 Tataskweyak Cree Nation, to restore harmony and
- 20 balance.
- MS. SPENCE: Yes.
- MR. BEDFORD: So, personally, I would
- 23 certainly look forward to future meetings with you
- 24 and your fellow members, and with the assistance
- of perhaps the gentlemen who surround you, but

- 1 with that ultimate focus in mind, restoring
- 2 harmony and balance.
- I have one further question, and you
- 4 have partially touched on the answer already, I
- 5 would think, but if you would look at page 14,
- 6 please, of your presentation? I'm going to reveal
- 7 to you that as you spoke, and as I read on page
- 8 14, I took my red pen which always accompanies me
- 9 to hearings like this, and I circled the words
- 10 "our RMA," our resource area. And at the bottom,
- 11 "most impacted by Bipole III." And I respect the
- 12 fact that other than Mr. Keating, the three of you
- 13 haven't been present throughout this hearing. But
- 14 I'll tell you that we had a presentation from the
- 15 members of Fox Lake First Nation who assured us
- 16 all, and if we glance at the map for a moment,
- 17 that this area where my client proposes to build
- 18 the Keewatinoow converter station, the collector
- 19 lines, the construction power line, the electrode
- 20 line, and the Bipole III line itself, are also in
- 21 the traditional territory of Fox Lake Cree Nation.
- 22 And it is greatly concerned about the disruptions
- 23 in its past relationships, and it's insistent that
- 24 it play a role and have opportunities in this
- 25 project.

- 1 And secondly, I can tell you that we
- 2 have all heard a presentation by the Manitoba
- 3 Metis Federation on behalf of the Metis people of
- 4 Manitoba, and they produced a map, same part of
- 5 Manitoba, and I recall they had a large oblong
- 6 circle. And they assured us that the locations of
- 7 the Keewatinoow converter station, the Bipole III
- 8 line, the construction power lines, the electrode
- 9 line, are all of great concern to the Metis people
- 10 of Manitoba because this area they told us is also
- 11 a traditional territory where Metis people gather
- 12 resources, they hunt, and they gather plants.
- 13 And I'm not sure that we will, in this
- 14 hearing, have a presentation from York Factory
- 15 First Nation, or War Lake First Nation, but I know
- 16 personally from my past meetings with members of
- 17 those communities that were they to come to this
- 18 hearing, I am convinced they would also tell us
- 19 that, in that part of Manitoba, this project my
- 20 client proposes to build is also within the
- 21 traditional territories of York Factory First
- 22 Nation and War Lake First Nation.
- 23 So can you help me perhaps, any one of
- 24 the four of you, tell me what advice would you
- 25 have for my client, Manitoba Hydro, as to how to

- 1 restore harmony and balance to its relationships
- 2 with Fox Lake Cree Nation, the Metis people of
- 3 Manitoba, York Factory First Nation, War Lake
- 4 First Nation, and at the same time meet the
- 5 conditions that you set for us, without doing the
- 6 reverse of what I think needs to be done, which is
- 7 restore harmony and balance to all of those
- 8 relationships, not restore harmony and balance to
- 9 perhaps one of the relationships with the result
- 10 that we make it worse for the relationships with
- 11 all those other peoples?
- 12 THE CHAIRMAN: Sir, I'm sorry?
- MR. MACKENZIE: Mr. Victor Spence, who
- is not introduced, is Manager of Future
- 15 Development for Tataskweyak Cree Nation and has
- 16 often been a spokesperson.
- 17 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. We'll have to
- 18 swear him in.
- 19 Victor Spence: Sworn.
- 20 MR. SPENCE: My name is Victor Spence,
- 21 Manager of Future Development, Tataskweyak Cree
- 22 Nation. I'm sorry, I am currently recovering from
- 23 pneumonia, so a little struggle when I speak.
- I have with us Councillor Melanie
- 25 Spence. She was recently elected about three

- 1 weeks ago. So, unfortunately, she is unable to
- 2 directly respond to the questions because she has
- 3 not really been totally emerged in the process on
- 4 Bipole III. And our relationship with the other
- 5 First Nations is a working relationship at this
- 6 time. We do speak with the other nations, meet
- 7 with them. Unfortunately, we haven't had any
- 8 dialogue with Manitoba Metis Federation.
- 9 In regards to our territory, we have
- 10 an agreement with Manitoba Hydro, Manitoba
- 11 Government and the Federal Government of Canada,
- 12 which goes back to 1977, which is called the
- 13 Northern Flood Agreement. It's a modern day
- 14 Treaty. And there it recognized our RMA, and we
- 15 have under the '92 agreement affirmed that RMA
- 16 with both levels of government and Manitoba Hydro.
- 17 It's a legislated document. And Fox Lake is
- 18 working with TCN on matters pertaining to Keeyask.
- 19 On Bipole III with respect to our
- 20 territory, we only speak for TCN. We don't
- 21 profess to speak for the other parties. We
- 22 understand that they have their positions and we
- 23 can respect that. However, Manitoba Hydro is very
- aware, as we have about a 50-year relationship
- 25 with Manitoba Hydro in regards to our territory.

- 1 We assert our rights and our interests within our
- 2 territory and we are quite protective of it.
- 3 The four conditions that we talk
- 4 about, we mention, is a negotiation that needs to
- 5 happen with Manitoba Hydro. And that has not been
- 6 undertaken by the party, Manitoba Hydro. We are
- 7 currently holding discussions with them.
- 8 However, all I wanted to say at this
- 9 time was that we are going to negotiate with
- 10 Manitoba Hydro if they come to the table. In
- 11 regards to Bipole III, we believe very strongly
- 12 that it will adversely impact the nation, TCN,
- 13 Tataskweyak Cree Nation.
- 14 The very mention of hydroelectric
- 15 development within our resource area causes an
- 16 impact, it's not a physical impact on the
- 17 terrestrial or the aquatic, it's an impact on our
- 18 members. The very being of TCN is impacted. It
- 19 does not require studies. We call it stress. In
- 20 the medical world they call it stress, medical
- 21 science. People die from stress. That's an
- 22 impact. People cry, and the little kids wonder
- 23 why granny is crying? That is impact in human
- 24 nature.
- So when we deal with hydroelectric

- 1 development, people study the western science, the
- 2 fish, the animals, the vegetation, plants. They
- 3 overlook us. They say we'll compensate you.
- 4 There's more than just being compensated, we need
- 5 to be respected as human beings and dealt with as
- 6 a nation. Thank you.
- 7 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Spence.
- 8 That's all, Mr. Bedford?
- 9 MR. BEDFORD: Yes, thank you.
- 10 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
- 11 Yes, Ms. Spence, go ahead.
- 12 MS. SPENCE: Hi, sorry. I just want
- 13 to add to what he said. What this Bipole III is
- 14 going to do to our community is take away our
- 15 spirituality. It's like what happened, it's
- 16 similar to what happened in residential school.
- 17 It's like you don't have a choice, you have to do
- 18 it or you have to go. It's taking away a piece of
- 19 us. You know, the surface that's going to be, you
- 20 know, the trees that are going to be destroyed,
- 21 those are traplines, those are traditional land
- 22 users, those are family's homes. They are not
- 23 just traplines. And I don't know, it affects us
- 24 as human beings, as Native people of the north.
- 25 And everyone has to be consulted, and that's it.

- 1 Like we really have to, it's not just about the
- 2 money. Nobody cares about money. Money doesn't
- 3 buy everything. Thank you.
- 4 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
- 5 Participants? Pine Creek? Coalition,
- 6 Mr. Meronek?
- 7 MR. MERONEK: No, sir.
- 8 THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Williams?
- 9 MR. WILLIAMS: Good morning, members
- 10 of the panel, and good morning to the Tataskweyak
- 11 Cree Nation panel, Councillor Spence, Mr. Spence,
- 12 and other panel members. Just so we have not all
- 13 met, my name is Byron Williams and I'm a lawyer
- 14 for the Consumers Association of Canada, the
- 15 Manitoba branch. And you probably won't know this
- 16 unless Mr. Keating has been briefing you every
- 17 day, but our clients have had a great deal of
- 18 interest in issues such as cumulative effects, and
- 19 also health impacts such as stress, more from a
- 20 western science perspective than from your
- 21 community's perspective. So we certainly thank
- 22 you on behalf of our clients for that information.
- 23 And I have a few questions, they can
- 24 go to any of the panel members. A couple,
- 25 Councillor Spence, I will address to you because

- 1 they refer to some of your specific statements,
- 2 and feel free to answer them, or if you want to
- 3 refer them to other panel members.
- 4 Councillor Spence, just in terms of
- 5 you had a bit of a discussion with Mr. Bedford,
- 6 the Hydro lawyer, in terms of highway 280 and the
- 7 need to pave it. And I believe you said words to
- 8 the effect that there is too much dust, too many
- 9 accidents, and this is the worst year ever?
- MS. SPENCE: Yes.
- 11 MR. WILLIAMS: And I wonder if you can
- 12 elaborate a little bit on why you consider this to
- 13 be the worst year ever in terms of this particular
- 14 highway?
- 15 MS. SPENCE: Since they started the
- 16 construction of the camp site road, you know, the
- 17 actual work, the continuous semis, the big
- 18 vehicles, you can just tell that it was ruining
- 19 the highway. I don't know how to -- but it was
- 20 wearing it down a lot faster, and it's just a
- 21 hazard to the people driving to town. You know,
- 22 we have to go to Thompson to shop, and I don't
- 23 know, it's just a hazard. And if there was
- 24 pavement, we wouldn't have to, you know, worry
- 25 about the dust. And it's not just on highway 280,

- 1 it's our community. You know, we should be the
- 2 richest community up north in Split Lake. I think
- 3 we're the poorest. If you come to our community,
- 4 you'd want to fly in, in a helicopter. That's how
- 5 bad it is. It's embarrassing actually.
- 6 And I think our main roads in the
- 7 community need to be paved as well. You know, I
- 8 have watched Split Lake grow, but it needs to be
- 9 developed.
- 10 MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you for that.
- 11 And if I could, in the presentation, I'm going to
- 12 use TCN as a shorthand if that's permissible.
- Page 21 of your presentation, there's
- 14 a few questions I'd like to ask you with regard to
- 15 that. And the second last paragraph from the
- 16 bottom, TCN makes the point that you don't believe
- 17 Manitoba Hydro can defend its position that there
- 18 are no significant residual effects from this
- 19 project. That's the point you are trying to make
- 20 there?
- MR. LOWE: Ron Lowe, adviser for TCN.
- Yes, that's TCN's position is that in contrast to
- 23 Hydro's assertion that there will be no
- 24 significant residual effects, TCN's view is
- 25 derived from its world view, which is quite

- 1 different from a western world view obviously, and
- 2 you have seen a very brief articulation through
- 3 the Mother Earth ecosystem model that there is
- 4 a -- and I have heard members and elders, and
- 5 Victor and councillors speak about this many
- 6 times. And it's taken me some length of time to
- 7 gather an understanding of how different TCN
- 8 members, and I gather, well, I'll just speak of
- 9 TCN members, do view the world and projects such
- 10 as this in quite different terms. And it really
- 11 does come down to the fundamental relationships
- 12 that comprise the TCN world view and when
- 13 disruptions are caused to them. Those disruptions
- 14 have not been measured by Manitoba Hydro in its
- 15 assessment of this project. And it's those kinds
- of disruptions and impacts that will endure well
- 17 beyond the -- as long as the project is in place.
- 18 MR. WILLIAMS: Mr. Lowe, thank you for
- 19 that. I'm going to, in a couple moments, come
- 20 back to that statement that those disruptions have
- 21 not been measured. So I'll come back to that in
- 22 just a second.
- On the same page at the very top of
- 24 the first paragraph, you indicate that, TCN
- 25 indicates that it believed that there are adverse

- 1 effects which cannot be mitigated. I'll just ask
- 2 you to confirm that?
- 3 MR. LOWE: Yes.
- 4 MR. WILLIAMS: And certainly from your
- 5 report at page 18, I noted that habitat
- 6 fragmentation, I'll suggest to you is one of those
- 7 impacts which in the view of TCN is one that
- 8 cannot be mitigated?
- 9 MR. LOWE: I believe that's true.
- 10 MR. WILLIAMS: And are there other
- 11 effects that in the position, from the perspective
- 12 of TCN, that cannot be mitigated or fully
- 13 mitigated?
- MR. LOWE: You heard Victor Spence
- 15 speak of the impacts on people, you heard
- 16 Councillor Spence speak about that. If you took
- 17 an opportunity to read the two TCN reports that
- 18 were appended to the Bipole III EIS, based on
- 19 interviews with 160 some members, that's a message
- 20 that came through very, very clearly from all of
- 21 those interviews, is the human impacts, the
- 22 stress. The one, perhaps as an example, I have
- 23 heard members speak of, and the obligation that
- 24 they have to care for the land and the waters, and
- 25 the sense that having not done so, or to not do so

- 1 is an impact of the highest order. And it's an
- 2 obligation that they feel to the land and waters,
- 3 and to future generations. And I would say that
- 4 there's some very deep feelings around that.
- 5 MR. WILLIAMS: Okay. Thank you. And
- 6 I appreciate that. And our client certainly have
- 7 reviewed with interest the reports that you
- 8 reference.
- 9 In terms of, staying with that top
- 10 paragraph on page 21, TCN indicates or believes
- 11 that there are adverse effects which cannot be
- 12 mitigated and must be offset by replacement
- 13 substitutions or opportunities, and to the extent
- 14 that adverse effects remain addressed by
- 15 compensation. And I want to just get a bit more
- 16 insight as to what TCN means by replacements,
- 17 substitutions or opportunities?
- 18 MR. LOWE: Replacements, substitutions
- 19 and opportunities, I can give you a parallel to
- 20 that, which would be those that form part of the
- 21 Keeyask adverse effects agreement. A number of
- 22 programs were set in place which allowed, for
- 23 example, access to areas of the resource area that
- 24 would be unaffected by Keeyask. And therefore, it
- 25 would allow traditional activities, pursuits,

- 1 practices to continue. And that is a topic that
- 2 has at least been raised in discussions with
- 3 Manitoba Hydro.
- 4 MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you for that.
- 5 And just, and if this isn't part of the issue,
- 6 you'll -- we don't need to pursue it further. But
- 7 recognizing habitat fragmentation is an issue
- 8 obviously from the perspective of TCN. In terms
- 9 of replacement or substitutions, does TCN have
- 10 anything specifically in mind with regard to that?
- 11 MR. LOWE: Nothing that we'd talk
- 12 about today.
- MR. WILLIAMS: Okay. Mr. Lowe, in
- 14 your initial response to one of my earlier
- 15 questions to Councillor Spence, you made a
- 16 statement something to the effect that these
- 17 disruptions have not been measured by Manitoba
- 18 Hydro. Which disruptions specifically were you
- 19 speaking of, sir?
- 20 MR. LOWE: I was speaking of the
- 21 psychological, social effects on the community.
- MR. WILLIAMS: Thank you. Just a few
- 23 questions to wrap up. Mr. Bedford, I think asked
- 24 this question. I wasn't sure that he got an
- 25 answer, so if you did answer and I missed it,

- 1 you'll forgive me. But I am presuming that TCN is
- 2 taking the position that a licence should not
- 3 issue on Bipole III until your four conditions are
- 4 met. Would that be accurate?
- 5 MR. LOWE: TCN has been engaged with
- 6 Manitoba Hydro in discussions about Bipole III
- 7 business opportunities, training, employment and
- 8 compensation for some time. And we haven't set a,
- 9 to my knowledge there's been no setting of a
- 10 deadline or something like that. TCN has had a
- 11 longstanding relationships with Manitoba Hydro,
- 12 many very difficult obstacles have been overcome
- in the course of that relationship. There is good
- 14 faith on both sides. And I believe that that
- 15 would be how TCN would intend to proceed.
- MR. WILLIAMS: Okay, fair enough. I'm
- 17 going to reference a statement by Councillor
- 18 Spence, I'm not sure you'll want to answer, or you
- 19 may wish to refer to your advisers. But
- 20 Councillor Spence, you spoke very eloquently of
- 21 how the 35 hydro projects have cumulatively
- 22 affected your community, its balance, and changed
- 23 the physical structure of the lands and waters.
- 24 And I wonder, does TCN take the position that a
- 25 proper cumulative effects assessment is an

- 1 essential component of the significance analysis
- 2 under the Act and under the terms of reference?
- 3 I'm not sure if you can answer that or not. And
- 4 if your lawyer wants to answer it, that would be
- 5 fine with me as well.
- 6 MS. SPENCE: I have heard comments
- 7 from community members where this Bipole III is a
- 8 permanent structure, so is the Bipole I and II.
- 9 So what TCN would like to see is something
- 10 permanent on a document, an agreement for as long
- 11 as that Bipole III is going to stand. That's one
- 12 thing I know the community will ask.
- 13 Mercury levels haven't even been
- 14 considered. What is the maximum before the
- 15 fishermen cannot fish anymore? They need to be
- 16 consulted as well.
- Our beaches are destroyed, we'll no
- 18 longer have them back. Our children can't swim
- 19 anymore. And the people of Split Lake have asked
- 20 for wading pools, or possibly a pool but, you
- 21 know, they can't swim in the water anymore, it's
- 22 contaminated. It will never be, you know, the way
- 23 it was.
- People are getting sick, they are
- 25 getting rashes, the children. And this is just

- 1 one person. I'm only one person, and I know there
- 2 are a lot of people, you know, they have concerns
- 3 of their own.
- I keep thinking of the water every
- 5 time, to your question. The question will, I
- 6 don't know -- I mean, sorry, the water, you know,
- 7 the water is high and low and it's dangerous. You
- 8 don't know when is it safe to cross? We fear for
- 9 the trappers. I don't know.
- 10 MR. WILLIAMS: And Councillor Spence,
- 11 I appreciate the questions aren't difficult, but
- 12 the answers are painful, so I appreciate your
- 13 courtesy in sharing them, these powerful answers
- 14 with us.
- 15 In terms of the context of cumulative
- 16 effects, you have mentioned a couple times today
- 17 Bipoles I and II.
- MS. SPENCE: Yeah.
- 19 MR. WILLIAMS: And I wonder if you can
- 20 comment on the impacts of Bipoles I and II on
- 21 your, whether it's harvesting or other practices,
- 22 and on the fragmentation of your landscape, of
- 23 your world?
- 24 MR. SPENCE: I missed your name there,
- 25 I'm sorry?

- 1 MR. WILLIAMS: It's Byron.
- 2 MR. SPENCE: In regards to Bipole I
- 3 and II, and you're talking -- what is the question
- 4 again, I'm sorry?
- 5 MR. WILLIAMS: It probably wasn't that
- 6 good of a question, Mr. Spence, so I'll try and
- 7 ask it a little bit better there. I have heard
- 8 Councillor Spence today speak about cumulative
- 9 effects very powerfully, and she has referenced a
- 10 couple times the impacts of Bipoles I and II. And
- 11 certainly that's something of interest to my
- 12 clients, certainly as it relates to Bipole III as
- 13 well, but the cumulative impact of Bipoles I and
- 14 II in terms of land use, the habitat, et cetera.
- 15 I was just looking for a bit more information from
- 16 TCN in that regard?
- 17 MR. SPENCE: Well, we have to look at
- 18 the total picture, when we talk about Bipole I and
- 19 II, in terms of its impact on our nation. We do
- 20 have past agreements that have dealt with some of
- 21 the impacts in regards to trappers program. And I
- 22 guess I'm dealing with harvesting. So we try to
- 23 deal with it from that perspective, in terms of
- 24 the resources that are somewhat changed and
- 25 altered, the access to those resources.

- 1 On Bipole III, when we talk about
- 2 cumulative effects, some can be compensated in
- 3 terms of, like I said, by programs, and by some
- 4 form of an agreement, resource management area.
- 5 However, we have to negotiate with Manitoba Hydro
- 6 to deal with Bipole III itself, and we're not
- 7 there yet. But how are we going to deal with
- 8 them? That is -- well, TCN will talk to Manitoba
- 9 Hydro on that. So I do not have a concrete answer
- 10 to that.
- MR. WILLIAMS: Okay.
- MR. SPENCE: But there are certain
- impacts that cannot be compensated.
- 14 MR. WILLIAMS: Okay. I thank the TCN
- 15 panel for their responses. Thank you, CEC, for
- 16 the opportunity.
- 17 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you,
- 18 Mr. Williams. Mr. Dawson?
- MR. DAWSON: No thank you.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Panel members?
- 21 Mr. Kaplan?
- MR. KAPLAN: Perhaps I can ask my
- 23 first question of you, Mr. Spence. I'm not sure I
- 24 understood the answer to Mr. William's question,
- 25 and let me put it in simple terms. As far as the

- 1 effects of Bipole I and Bipole II, would you say
- 2 that the effects caused a problem with the harmony
- 3 and balance as far as the TCN community over the
- 4 years?
- 5 MR. SPENCE: I can answer the
- 6 question, but when you speak of balance, what do
- 7 you mean? I'm not trying to be funny or anything
- 8 like that, I just want an understanding on the
- 9 word balance?
- 10 MR. KAPLAN: Well, I think that term
- 11 has been used quite a few times. For example, in
- 12 the cross-examination by Manitoba Hydro of some of
- 13 the panel members talking about restoring balance
- 14 and harmony to the community, to TCN community. I
- 15 think you heard that.
- MR. SPENCE: When we used the word
- 17 balance, we speak of harmony. Harmony is with
- 18 nature and the land and us, Inninwak, the people.
- 19 We also talk about balance, which again is
- 20 resources. We see our resources being exploited.
- 21 And that is not balance. We are told by our
- 22 members to harvest what we need, but then we have
- 23 become dependent on the white man's way of life.
- We deal with electricity.
- 25 Electricity, as one elder put it back in 1970, is

- 1 good and evil. She said I get up in the morning,
- 2 I can tell my husband, put it in, meaning to plug
- 3 it in, and there we have tea. But then it also
- 4 impacts the fishing grounds and disturbance among
- 5 our environment, the terrestrial, the resources.
- 6 So balance, as you understand it, to
- 7 western science it's segregated, divided. We do
- 8 not see it that way. Everything is interrelated,
- 9 interconnected.
- Where we talk about balance and
- 11 harmony is the very being of being who we are, our
- 12 beliefs, our emotions, our feelings, like I said,
- 13 stress. But that is the impacts that we
- 14 encountered and faced these last 50 years with
- 15 Hydro related development. Of course, we have the
- 16 churches that impact our culture, our way of life,
- 17 the north and the Hudson Bay. But when we talk
- 18 about balance again, I was just going to say the
- 19 human aspect of it, our understanding of that
- 20 environment has changed. So we have to somehow
- 21 adapt and use it. So balance is not just a word
- 22 where the scales are even, balance is in our very
- 23 understanding of our lands, our waterways, and how
- 24 we use them.
- We may not be able to use this as

- 1 such, but that is where grandpa was, that is near
- 2 where grandpa will be. Grandpa's gone, but
- 3 knowledge is there, his knowledge, that gives
- 4 balance.
- I don't know if I can give you,
- 6 without saying in Cree, (Cree spoken), it's
- 7 understanding of us. You will never understand us
- 8 when we say, one is, if I tell you the very being
- 9 of me, you will destroy me.
- 10 So balance is unique to us. It's not
- 11 just in the Oxford dictionary where scales are
- 12 even. It's the resources that the land, Aski, and
- 13 how we use it, how it fed our people, how it
- 14 sustained our culture, how we play and cry on that
- 15 land and our territory. It's in our heart, it's
- 16 knowledge, it's power. That's balance to us. And
- 17 I know -- we have always used the term balance and
- 18 harmony, it's how we used the resources, if
- 19 there's ten rabbits running around, we take two,
- 20 and tomorrow we take another two, and then we move
- 21 on to the next spot. It's not overexploiting the
- 22 resources. That's balance.
- 23 But when there is -- when you harness
- 24 the resources, put on transmission, use our fixed
- 25 structures, and they are there for a hundred years

- 1 or more. Now, we are here to say, let's talk
- 2 Hydro, let's talk Manitoba, let's talk Canada.
- 3 How are we going to deal with this impact? Ekosi.
- 4 MS. SPENCE: The resource area is what
- 5 we have left it seems, and we're trying so hard to
- 6 preserve that area, and it just seems that
- 7 development, you know, the development is slowly
- 8 taking that resource area away from us. It's
- 9 making it smaller. And there's provincial parks
- 10 in there because -- just because there has to be
- 11 provincial parks in our resource area. I know
- 12 it's half -- half of it belongs, there's a
- 13 partnership there where half of it belongs to,
- 14 it's Crown land I guess. And it just feels like
- 15 the resource area that we have left is just going
- 16 to be smaller to a point, are we ever going to be
- 17 able to preserve it anymore? That's where this
- 18 transmission line is going to be set, possibly.
- 19 You know, TCN at this point are not
- 20 happy. The youth in our community, they don't
- 21 even know what their culture is anymore, they
- 22 don't even know how to speak their language. And
- 23 we're trying so hard to keep that alive in the
- 24 schools. Even our school needs support. There's
- 25 not enough money coming to our school.

- I am a teacher, you know, I'm a
- 2 licensed teacher to teach anywhere I want. I went
- 3 back to school. I went back to school to prove to
- 4 the white culture that we're just as strong as
- 5 they are, you know, the dominant society, we are
- 6 just as strong. That nobody is going to tell us
- 7 that we are not equal.
- 8 At the same time, I want to hold onto
- 9 our culture. My husband is a trapper, a
- 10 fisherman, and I want him to teach our children
- 11 those values that we should all hold. Our
- 12 children can't even bead, they can't even sew.
- 13 Our elderly are passing on. And all we really see
- 14 in our community is drinking and alcohol. I
- 15 stopped drinking in 2008 to prove to the community
- 16 of, you know, our First Nation brothers and
- 17 sisters that we need to be clean. I want to be
- 18 that role model for children and for other people
- 19 that alcohol and drugs cannot, you know, they
- 20 shouldn't be a factor in our lives.
- There is a community that was
- 22 displaced, I think it was Pukatawagan. They were
- 23 moved to Churchill. And what happened there? It
- 24 was just drugs and alcohol. That's what I see in
- 25 TCN. There's nothing for our youth, there's no

- 1 recreation facility. We have an arena but, you
- 2 know, that's limited to what we should offer our
- 3 children.
- 4 My son went to a baseball game, he was
- 5 part of a baseball team this summer. He went to
- 6 Cross Lake. Cross Lake, they had baseball
- 7 uniforms. And he said, Cross Lake compared to our
- 8 hometown is more, I don't know how he said it, he
- 9 said our home looks like a dump. It hurts me, it
- 10 hurts me to talk about Split Lake like that. But
- 11 the point I'm trying to make is our culture is
- 12 lost, and we need to regain that back, we need to
- 13 hold onto it, and we need to preserve the resource
- 14 area of Split Lake.
- 15 Yes, Hydro has been our partner for so
- 16 long, and I hope that continues.
- 17 MR. GIBBONS: I'd like to thank the
- 18 panel for their presentation today. I have found
- 19 it very informative and very helpful in my own
- 20 deliberations.
- I have a question about the document
- 22 itself, and I'm hoping that someone could
- 23 elaborate and clarify for me so I have a better
- 24 idea of what it is that Tataskweyak is looking for
- 25 in this regard, because I think it's an

- 1 interesting idea. It has to do with the
- 2 monitoring.
- 3 And the top of the page starts off
- 4 with the idea that TCN recognizes the draft
- 5 environmental protection plan may go some way,
- 6 perhaps not far enough, but go some way towards
- 7 redressing the potential impacts. And further on,
- 8 I take what follows from that then to indicate
- 9 that one of the ways that this could do that job
- 10 better is if, and I'm referring now to the second
- 11 paragraph on page 20, if in fact the monitoring
- 12 and management aspects reflect community concerns
- 13 and provides for meaningful participation in
- 14 monitoring activities. I'm wondering what the
- 15 meaningful participation might be. Because I can
- 16 think of several possibilities. One is, if I were
- 17 good in Latin, and I'm not, I would say this in
- 18 Latin, there's a famous Latin phrase that says
- 19 what I'm going to say in English. And that is,
- 20 who guards the guardians, or in this case who
- 21 monitors the monitors? I can see in one case that
- 22 TCN might want to monitor the monitoring activity
- 23 that Manitoba Hydro carries out, but I could also
- 24 see a scenario where through training and
- 25 employment opportunities, TCN members could do the

- 1 monitoring.
- 2 MS. SPENCE: Yes.
- 3 MR. GIBBONS: Is that what you have in
- 4 mind when you talk about this? The monitoring of
- 5 both biophysical and socioeconomic is what you're
- 6 mentioning here. Is that what you had in mind?
- 7 It's a little vague right now, and so if you can
- 8 clarify just a little, it would be helpful.
- 9 MR. LOWE: Yes. That's something that
- 10 has been discussed with Manitoba Hydro,
- 11 discussions have been initiated on that, that TCN
- 12 would participate in more than just an employment
- 13 kind of a role, but in a larger role. TCN has
- 14 expressed to Manitoba Hydro that they would like,
- 15 they have a vision of a monitoring agency that is
- 16 a TCN company, that could develop capacity in
- 17 association with the various Hydro projects and
- 18 other projects, other resource development
- 19 projects, that are under way in Northern Manitoba.
- 20 And that they could take some ownership for
- 21 monitoring the monitors. So that is something
- that has been broached with Manitoba Hydro and
- 23 could turn into something.
- 24 MS. SPENCE: I'd just like to add to
- 25 that. My husband, Robert Spence, mentioned that

- 1 North/South, you know, had been doing the
- 2 monitoring for fisheries and so on. And he
- 3 questioned who, you know, who watches them?
- 4 Aren't they, you know, aren't they employed by
- 5 Manitoba Hydro? Where does that protect us if
- 6 there's something that we, you know, we want to
- 7 oppose anything that North/South says?
- For example, my husband, his trapline
- 9 is located at the Churchill River where the
- 10 sturgeon are. And he's been very vocal about that
- in the community, where the sturgeon, because of
- 12 the low water there, because of the Diversion,
- 13 he's afraid that the sturgeon will become extinct.
- There wasn't enough water for the
- 15 sturgeon to flow. They were actually in a pool,
- 16 they couldn't go up or down river. So he was
- 17 really upset about that. And he opposed the
- 18 decision that they weren't -- North/South said
- 19 they were spawning in different areas and my
- 20 husband said they weren't. And they weren't.
- 21 Those eggs weren't found on certain rivers. If he
- 22 was here, he'd tell you in detail because he knows
- 23 the rivers, he knows where the spawning areas are,
- 24 he knows that area. And you know, the knowledge
- 25 has been passed down to him. So his heart is

- 1 really with the sturgeon there. But he did bring
- 2 up North/South, and that's what I just wanted to
- 3 add to your question.
- 4 MR. GIBBONS: And if I could, a
- 5 follow-up. You mentioned the people doing the
- 6 monitoring now, North/South, when they file
- 7 reports, we presume of course they are filed with
- 8 Manitoba Hydro, but does TCN get copies of the
- 9 reports? Do they get to see what North/South is
- 10 saying about the impacts that the earlier projects
- 11 have had in your area?
- MS. SPENCE: TCN should be involved in
- 13 those matters and, I don't know, I don't know how
- 14 to -- there are issues in our community where
- 15 there's not enough information is coming to TCN
- 16 members, period. You know, all of the meetings
- 17 are being held in Thompson and Winnipeg, and how
- do you transport over 3,000 people to these areas?
- 19 There has nothing been done in Split Lake. So to
- answer to your question, I haven't seen any, but
- 21 I'm pretty sure they are available, but I haven't
- 22 personally seen any.
- MR. GIBBONS: Okay. Thank you for
- 24 that.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. I just have

- 1 a comment for Ms. Spence, and about a year from
- 2 now the Clean Environment Commission will be
- 3 looking at the Keeyask generating station, and I
- 4 understand that sturgeon will be one of the issues
- 5 we look at, so hopefully we'll hear from your
- 6 husband at that time.
- 7 MS. SPENCE: I hope so too.
- 8 THE CHAIRMAN: Most of the questions
- 9 that I had have been addressed, but I have one for
- 10 Mr. Mackenzie. And I read your brief, I found it
- 11 very interesting and informative. But I'm not
- 12 sure what the Clean Environment Commission is to
- 13 take out of that, other than to perhaps inform us
- 14 in our deliberations on this?
- 15 MR. MACKENZIE: I think the latter is
- 16 all that I can ask of you, take it as information
- 17 from us. We're not specifically asking the Clean
- 18 Environment Commission to do something. But at
- 19 this juncture we had to explain the TCN position,
- 20 and we believe that that assists in at least
- 21 explaining the position.
- THE CHAIRMAN: I think it does, yes.
- 23 So thank you very much for that.
- 24 That brings us to the end of your
- 25 presentation. I want to thank all of you. And

- 1 Mr. Spence, I hope he recovers soon. I don't envy
- 2 him.
- I want to thank all of you for coming
- 4 out here this morning and also for putting
- 5 together an excellent brief that will inform us in
- 6 our overall deliberations, but certainly in
- 7 respect of Aboriginal issues and your community in
- 8 particular. So thank you.
- 9 We'll take a 15 minute break and come
- 10 back at 11:00 o'clock.
- 11 (Proceedings recessed at 10:45 a.m.
- and reconvened at 11:05 a.m.)
- 13 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Let's reconvene.
- 14 I'm sad to inform you that we may not have full
- 15 days for the next two to three days.
- Manitoba Hydro, in a moment or two, is
- 17 going to present a number of undertakings, and
- 18 that will probably be it for today. Tomorrow, we
- 19 have, so we'll probably be finished here in about
- 20 a half an hour. Tomorrow we have a fairly full
- 21 line-up of public presentations, until at least
- 22 3:00 or so in the afternoon. Thursday
- 23 Mr. Williams will conclude his presentation of
- 24 evidence in the morning. Following that, if
- 25 Mr. Beddome is here, he didn't get an opportunity

- 1 to cross-examine Mr. Osler. He will have that
- 2 opportunity if he is here on Thursday. And also
- 3 on Thursday, the panel members haven't had an
- 4 opportunity to ask questions of a number of Hydro
- 5 officials, so the panel will be doing that. And
- 6 that will perhaps fill out Thursday. If not, we
- 7 will adjourn when we're finished. And then we
- 8 will adjourn until, right now the target date is
- 9 March 4th. Hopefully we can achieve that.
- 10 So, Ms. Mayor is handing out her
- 11 stacks of paper right now. Once she's done, we'll
- 12 proceed.
- MS. MAYOR: Thank you. Sorry,
- 14 Mr. Meronek was concerned he wasn't going to get a
- 15 big bedtime reading package, so I wanted to make
- 16 sure that he had it in front of him.
- 17 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, now he's got the
- 18 afternoon to read it.
- 19 MS. MAYOR: Okay. I'm a little
- 20 disappointed that the room was full yesterday and
- 21 it was full this morning up until we announced we
- 22 were going to answer our undertakings, and it
- 23 appears to have cleared the room.
- I'll just go through the list, a
- 25 number of them are verbal, a number of them are

- 1 written. I know that there had been requests for
- 2 the entire list of undertakings, and when we
- 3 finish them, we have an ExCel spreadsheet that has
- 4 just a very brief summary of what the question
- 5 was, who asked it, what pages it was asked, what
- 6 page it was answered on, and what exhibit number
- 7 it is. So when we finish at the end of this week,
- 8 within the next couple of weeks, I will have that
- 9 sent out to everyone as well, so there will be a
- 10 complete listing. And if they're looking to where
- 11 the answer was provided, they will have that quick
- 12 reference. So we will do that in the next couple
- of weeks as well.
- On October 5th, in Winnipeg
- 15 Mr. Williams had asked Mr. McGarry about
- 16 continuity issues on route selection. That was
- 17 found on pages 943 and 946 of the transcript. It
- 18 was answered earlier, on October 29th at page
- 19 2023, but just to provide the additional
- 20 information that was being looked at, we have in
- 21 fact got a document before you which will be filed
- 22 as an exhibit on that answer.
- 23 On October 22nd, in Portage,
- 24 Mr. Sargeant asked a question of Mr. Joyal and the
- 25 panel members about fertilization application and

- 1 its effect on conductivity. That is found at page
- 2 1775 of the transcript, and a written answer is
- 3 being provided and will be filed as an exhibit
- 4 today.
- 5 On October 26th in Niverville,
- 6 Mr. Gibbons asked if anyone knew whether manure
- 7 regulations would be enforced against landowners
- 8 requiring extra applications. That is found at
- 9 page 1931 and 32. That's not an answer that
- 10 Manitoba Hydro can provide, but it is seeking the
- 11 assistance of the Province for this information,
- 12 and if it can be obtained, we will provide it. I
- 13 thought I would provide an update. It was one of
- 14 those questions that Mr. Gibbons had looked out at
- 15 the crowd and had asked if someone can answer it.
- 16 So we're on it for you.
- 17 On October 29th, in Winnipeg,
- 18 Mr. Madden asked Ms. Zebrowski where the
- 19 definition of Northern Affairs came from that was
- 20 used in the glossary. This was found at page
- 21 2051, 52. Manitoba Hydro has not been able to
- 22 make the determination as to the source of that
- 23 definition.
- On November 5th, in Winnipeg,
- 25 Mr. Meronek asked Mr. Berger if there were any

- 1 discrete ptarmigan studies that were done. This
- 2 was found at page 3148 of the transcript. And
- 3 there were not any discrete ptarmigan studies
- 4 done.
- 5 On November 5th, in Winnipeg,
- 6 Mr. Meronek asked Mr. Berger to provide a list of
- 7 the studies on birds that were referenced in their
- 8 discussion. And that's found at page 3149. And
- 9 then as well, he asked for the studies or the
- 10 information that showed bird strikes reduced with
- 11 the use of bird diverters. That particular
- 12 question is found at page 3154. I'm sure
- 13 Mr. Meronek will be pleased that in writing there
- 14 is an extensive list of bird studies that he can
- 15 now also review. And so those two have been
- 16 combined into one filing as an exhibit, but it
- 17 answers the two separate undertakings.
- On November 5th, in Winnipeg,
- 19 Mr. Beddome asked Mr. Osler about the ten-year
- 20 time frame affecting VECs, and in particular if
- 21 there were others than the American Martin. That
- 22 was found at page 3182 and 83 of the transcript.
- 23 The other VEC that might change from not
- 24 significant to potentially significant, using this
- 25 different sensitivity screening, would be the VEC

- 1 known as aesthetics and the Keewatinoow impact.
- 2 Just by way of update, on
- 3 November 5th, in Winnipeg, Mr. Gibbons asked
- 4 Mr. Berger and Mr. Schindler to provide some
- 5 detailed information on patch densities, mapping
- 6 of core communities and fragmentation, linear
- 7 developments and upland forest habitat. Those
- 8 questions are found between pages 3307 and 3316.
- 9 A number of maps and documents have been prepared.
- 10 They are just in the final vetting stage and
- 11 hopefully we'll be able to provide that additional
- 12 information by the end of the week. The mapping
- 13 we may not provide in writing, we may provide it
- 14 by way of a memory stick instead, because there's
- 15 a number of maps and it would not be easy to
- 16 reprint.
- On November 6th, in Winnipeg,
- 18 Mr. Madden asked Mr. Osler what was meant by
- 19 winter construction for the purposes of the
- 20 presentation. And that was found at page 3410.
- 21 As Mr. Osler indicated on the record, clearing and
- 22 construction will take place when there are winter
- 23 conditions or frozen ground conditions. That, of
- 24 course, is weather dependent. Mr. Penner further
- 25 advised that opening and packing of access trails

- 1 will then begin. And once there is sufficient ice
- 2 cover on a packed trail, the additional work will
- 3 begin, that could take two to four weeks. Then
- 4 the heavier equipment comes on site and work
- 5 continues until the ground starts to thaw and
- 6 access then becomes too difficult. So in terms of
- 7 defining winter construction onset dates, that's
- 8 not possible. It's weather dependent.
- 9 On November 6th, in Winnipeg,
- 10 Mr. Mills had asked Mr. Osler if tower placement
- 11 will be discussed with First Nations. That
- 12 question is found at page 3527. Mr. Penner
- 13 advises that Manitoba Hydro will meet with Pine
- 14 Creek to review the Environmental Protection Plan
- 15 for their specific region and to determine
- 16 specific boundaries of sensitive sites. Specific
- 17 tower placement will not be discussed for every
- 18 location, but if there are specific concerns, they
- 19 can be discussed at those EPP meetings.
- 20 On November 6th, in Winnipeg,
- 21 Ms. Whelan Enns asked Ms. Zebrowski whether ATK
- 22 information is still being held at MMM Group.
- 23 That question is found at page 2585 of the
- 24 transcript. ATK is still being held
- 25 confidentially by MMM Group. MMM Group has asked

- 1 Manitoba Hydro for direction. Manitoba Hydro is
- 2 in the process of requesting that information be
- 3 transferred to Manitoba Hydro.
- 4 On November 7th, in Winnipeg,
- 5 Mr. Meronek asked Mr. McLeod to provide the
- 6 property acquisition costs for the project. And
- 7 that's found at pages 3688 to 3690. The approved
- 8 capital project justification amount is
- 9 \$34,947,000, approximately, inclusive of land
- 10 easements, land acquisition, survey and drafting.
- On November 7th, in Winnipeg,
- 12 Mr. Meronek also asked Mr. McLeod to provide a
- 13 number of documents related to Manitoba Hydro's
- 14 compensation policy and the work of Evolve. Those
- 15 questions are found at pages 3695 to 3705. In
- 16 answer to that, we are filing six documents.
- 17 There is a compensation manual on crop damage and
- 18 impact payment schedule for steel two poles 230 kV
- 19 that's dated January 2012, and that's the thick,
- 20 thick document. There's also a compensation
- 21 manual on crop damage and impact payment schedule
- 22 for Bipole III dated July of 2012.
- There is a package that is sent to
- landowners when they do not wish to meet with
- 25 Evolve. You will notice that there is redacted

- 1 information in those packages, as the copy that
- 2 was provided to us contained an actual landowner
- 3 and some information, that landowner having asked
- 4 some information at one of the presentations, but
- 5 we wanted to redact that information, so personal
- 6 information wasn't disclosed.
- 7 There is also the topic tool kit used
- 8 by Evolve, which was the script or guidelines that
- 9 Mr. Meronek asked for. Along with that is a
- 10 reference to the legal guideline that is mentioned
- 11 in the tool kit document.
- 12 And finally, Mr. Meronek had asked the
- 13 method by which Evolve employees were paid. And
- 14 there is a letter from Evolve with respect to that
- 15 payment.
- On November 7th, in Winnipeg,
- 17 Mr. Mills asked the water panel that made its
- 18 presentation for modeling on the route revision,
- 19 that question was asked at page 3783 to 3784, and
- 20 that document has been provided and filed as an
- 21 exhibit this morning.
- 22 As well on that date, Mr. Williams
- asked the water panel for its bibliography of
- 24 peer-reviewed literature, at page 3885 of the
- 25 transcript, and that list has already been

- 1 provided by way of a document.
- On November 7th as well, Mr. Beddome
- 3 asked Mr. Elder for the explanation of person
- 4 years that is used. And that's found at page 3900
- 5 to 3903, and an explanation with a flow chart is
- 6 provided in written form today.
- 7 And lastly, on that same date,
- 8 Mr. Beddome asked Ms. Hicks if the number for
- 9 traffic increases on PR 280 was just for Bipole
- 10 III or if it was a cumulative effect? That
- 11 question was asked at page 3917, and the answer
- 12 that the number she had provided was just for
- 13 Bipole III.
- 14 And those are our answers today.
- 15 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Mayor.
- 16 I note your guidelines for legal fees, one of the
- 17 lawyers on the panel asked me if he could get paid
- 18 at that rate.
- MS. MAYOR: Well, I can certainly
- 20 advise that the Manitoba Hydro lawyers in-house do
- 21 not get paid at that rate.
- 22 THE CHAIRMAN: You need a better
- 23 union.
- Do you want to register these?
- MS. JOHNSON: Yes. I'm just going to

25

think.

```
register these as a block, and then I will
1
 2
    circulate the list by the end of the week.
 3
                 So we started at MH 91, as their first
    undertaking to Mr. Williams, and the last one is
 4
 5
    MH 102. And we also have TCN documents. TCN
    number 1 will be the submission that was provided
6
    on September 17th, and number 2 is the submission
7
    that was provided on November 13th.
8
9
                 (EXHIBIT MH 91-102: Manitoba Hydro's
10
11
                 answers to undertakings)
                 (EXHIBIT TCN 1: Submission, September
12
13
                 17)
14
                 (EXHIBIT TCN 2: Submission, November
15
                 13)
16
                 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Any other
    business that needs doing today? Mr. Meronek?
17
                 MR. MERONEK: Is there going to be an
18
19
    opportunity to ask questions on these
20
    undertakings?
21
                 THE CHAIRMAN: Are you prepared to
    respond to questions on the undertakings? It
22
    would depend on whether you're debating what's in
23
24
    them or if it's just process questions, I would
```

- 1 MR. MERONEK: Well, for example, in
- 2 terms of the bird wire collisions, I don't see any
- 3 reference to any studies on the Dodo bird -- no,
- 4 that wasn't one of the questions. But there are a
- 5 lot of thick documents, I mean, I don't know
- 6 whether there will be any follow-up questions or
- 7 not. But if there is, I wonder if there is a
- 8 forum to do that?
- 9 THE CHAIRMAN: I think that it's
- 10 always open to you. If Manitoba Hydro hasn't
- 11 fully responded to the undertaking, to bring that
- 12 to our attention.
- MR. MERONEK: Okay. Thank you, sir.
- MS. MAYOR: Manitoba Hydro also
- 15 certainly welcomes, if Mr. Meronek wants to ask us
- 16 the questions, we can provide them in another
- 17 forum.
- 18 THE CHAIRMAN: So you can contact them
- 19 directly as well. Send copies to everybody,
- though.
- 21 Any other questions or matters we need
- 22 to deal with this morning?
- Okay. Thank you. Then we get an
- 24 afternoon, probably not off for any of us, but to
- do other things, and we'll be back here tomorrow

```
Page 5526
     morning at 9:00 a.m.
 1
 2
                  (Proceedings adjourned at 11:20 a.m.)
 3
 4
 5
 6
 7
 8
 9
10
11
12
13
14
15
16
17
18
19
20
21
22
23
24
25
```

1	OFFICIAL EXAMINER'S CERTIFICATE	Page 5527
2		
3		
4		
5	I, DEBRA KOT, a duly appointed Official Examiner	
6	in the Province of Manitoba, do hereby certify the	
7	foregoing pages are a true and correct transcript	
8	of my Stenotype notes as taken by me at the time	
9	and place hereinbefore stated.	
10		
11		
12		
13		
14	Debra Kot	
15	Official Examiner, Q.B.	
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

This document was created with Win2PDF available at <a href="http://www.win2pdf.com">http://www.win2pdf.com</a>. The unregistered version of Win2PDF is for evaluation or non-commercial use only. This page will not be added after purchasing Win2PDF.