MANITOBA CLEAN ENVIRONMENT COMMISSION

BIPOLE III TRANSMISSION PROJECT PUBLIC HEARING

VOLUME 7

Transcript of Proceedings Held at the Juniper Centre Thompson, Manitoba

OCTOBER 15 AND OCTOBER 16, 2012

APPEARANCES

CLEAN ENVIRONMENT COMMISSION Terry Sargeant - Chairman
Pat MacKay - Member
Brian Kaplan - Member
Ken Gibbons - Member
Wayne Motheral - Member
Michael Green - Counsel to the Board
Cathy Johnson - Commission Secretary

MANITOBA CONSERVATION AND WATER STEWARDSHIP Bruce Webb

MANITOBA HYDRO

Janet Mayor - Counsel

Shannon Johnson

MANITOBA METIS FEDERATION Julyda Lagimodiere

INDEX OF EXHIBITS	Page 1287
EXHIBIT NO. PA	AGE
THOM-1 Presentation of Mr. Parenteau 1320)
THOM-2 Presentation of Mr. Parenteau 1385	5
THOM-3 Presentation of Ms. Campbell 1385	5
THOM-4 Package of letters from Manitoba 1385 Conservation from August 2012	5
THOM-5 Court decision R versus Goodon 1385	5
THOM-6 MMF harvesting agreement 1385	5

INDEX OF PROCEEDINGS		Page 1288
Opening remarks by Chairman	1289	
Presentation by Mr. Jason Cook Metis Harvester and trapper Questions by the Panel	1292 1302	
Presentation by Mr. Norman Bignell	1306	
Presentation by Mr. Solomon Parenteau and Ms. Julyda Lagimodiere Questions by the Panel	1309 1316	
Presentation by Hydro Ms. Shannon Johnson	1321	
Presentation by Mr. Robert Parenteau Elder assisted by Jason Cook, Julyda Lagimodiere Questions by Panel	1334 1348	
Presentation by Anita Cqmpbell Metis Women of Manitoba Questions by Panel	1355 1381	

- 1 Monday, October 15, 2012
- 2 Upon commencing at 7:00 p.m.

3

- 4 THE CHAIRMAN: Good evening, we'll
- 5 come to order now. For the benefit of northern
- 6 people, my name is Terry Sargeant. I'm the chair
- 7 of the Manitoba Clean Environment Commission. I'm
- 8 also the chair of the panel conducting the review
- 9 for Bipole III.
- We are here today, or this evening and
- 11 tomorrow in Thompson as part of our review of the
- 12 Environmental Impact Statement and the
- 13 consultation process that Manitoba Hydro has
- 14 engaged in, in respect of the Bipole III project.
- 15 Tomorrow morning Manitoba Hydro will be presenting
- 16 a fairly brief overview of the project.
- 17 This evening we're going to hear from
- 18 a number of people, we have seven or eight people
- 19 who have indicated to us that they wish to make
- 20 presentations this evening.
- 21 Let me also introduce the other people
- 22 on the panel. Immediately to my left is Wayne
- 23 Motheral, at the end is Patricia MacKay.
- 24 Immediately to my right is Mr. Ken Gibbons, and
- 25 down at the end, Brian Kaplan. We also have

- 1 Commission staff with us, the Commission
- 2 secretary, Cathy Johnson, at the table just over
- 3 to my left, as well as other commission staff.
- 4 And there are a number of Manitoba Hydro officials
- 5 here this evening.
- 6 If anybody has questions of Manitoba
- 7 Hydro officials this evening, some of the
- 8 officials that are here may be able to answer
- 9 them. If they are not able to, if they are of a
- 10 technical nature that they don't have the
- 11 expertise, they will undertake to provide the
- 12 answers to the Commission at a later date, and to
- 13 the questioner, of course.
- 14 Those of you who are making
- 15 presentations, I should note that presentations,
- oral presentations, are limited to 15 minutes. I
- 17 have a couple of cards, one says five and one says
- 18 two, so I'll give you fair warning as you approach
- 19 the end of your time. At the 15 minute mark, I
- 20 will let you know that your time is up. If
- 21 everybody who indicated they were going to show up
- 22 has shown up, then we will have to be fairly
- 23 strict on the 15 minutes, otherwise some people
- 24 may get left out.
- Now, I have a list of people who had

- 1 indicated -- I will read them out in order. I
- 2 don't know if they are all here yet or if some
- 3 have changed their mind, but I'll read them out in
- 4 order. And then after I read them, I will call
- 5 the first, and if he is here, ask him to come
- 6 forward. Those of you who are making oral
- 7 presentations, please come to the front table just
- 8 on what would be your left end.
- 9 The list includes in order Solomon
- 10 Pranteau, Johnny Crait, Walter Head, Norman
- 11 Bignell, Robert Duncan, Doreen Disbrowe, Jason
- 12 Cook, and perhaps Julyda Lagimodiere. So is Mr.
- 13 Pranteau here? Okay. How about Mr. Crait? Could
- 14 you come forward please, Mr. Crait? Are you
- 15 wanting to make an oral presentation?
- MR. COOK: I am supposed to speak on
- 17 behalf of the group.
- 18 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay, Mr. Cook. So are
- 19 each of those people proposing to make
- 20 presentations or is it you speaking on behalf of
- 21 them?
- 22 If you'd come up, Mr. Cook, to the mic
- 23 at the front table. I'd ask the Commission
- 24 secretary, Ms. Johnson, to give you an oath to
- 25 tell us the truth and then you may proceed.

- MS. JOHNSON: Okay. Mr. Cook, are you 1
- aware that it is offence in Manitoba to knowingly 2
- 3 mislead this Commission?
- 4 MR. COOK: Yes.
- 5 Jason Cook: Sworn
- THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Cook. 6
- MR. COOK: Okay. First of all, I'd 7
- like to acknowledge the residents of Thicket 8
- Portage that showed up, that came with me and 9
- asked me to speak on their behalf. 10
- My involvement with the Thicket 11
- 12 Portage community is that I'm working as a
- research and consultant on the Bipole III project 13
- working directly with the fishermen and the 14
- trappers. 15
- In my previous involvement with Hydro 16
- since 2008, we have had five consultation meetings 17
- in our community. And in review of the proposed 18
- 19 policy on the -- just hold on for a minute here --
- 20 the trappers notification compensation policy for
- the transmission line development, our concern in 21
- Thicket Portage is that we have had many Hydro 22
- projects that were built in the last 25 to 30 23
- 24 years. And we're in the surrounding area of those
- hydro dams that were being built. So my concern 25

- 1 as an individual is that we have many issues,
- 2 outstanding issues that do have the adverse
- 3 effects in our community in relation to trapping
- 4 and fishing. So coming with the Bipole III line,
- 5 and some of our trappers in our traditional
- 6 territory, it's going to have the effects of the
- 7 fur bearing animals, the environment, forestry,
- 8 the water, the impact changes to the physical and
- 9 chemical and biological characters of the
- 10 environment. That's my findings on what has been
- 11 presented to me.
- 12 The other thing is the risk of injury
- 13 to health, safety and well-being, comfort and
- 14 enjoyment of life by members of the community of
- 15 Thicket Portage. That's what we're looking at.
- 16 Impact on interests in the exercise of rights,
- including the Aboriginal and Treaty rights, in
- 18 relation to land, pursuit activities,
- 19 opportunities, lifestyles, and assets of the
- 20 association members of Thicket Portage.
- 21 When I say association members, we
- 22 have the Trappers Association and the Fishermen's
- 23 Association. This comprises of members within the
- 24 community who are active members in trapping and
- 25 fishing. So I had been asked to speak on their

- 1 behalf on issues.
- We would like to have discussions
- 3 planned to conduct investigation of the
- 4 environmental scan condition in or near the
- 5 resource area which the transmission line will go
- 6 through, which is the Bipole III project.
- 7 The other thing we're looking at is
- 8 the continuous negotiations with Hydro. They have
- 9 been coming to our community, and I think one of
- 10 the guys that's working with us, his name is Ian
- 11 Blouw, he is the policy program worker. So he's
- 12 been working with us, but yet today we haven't had
- 13 a meeting with him.
- 14 THE CHAIRMAN: Is he from Hydro,
- 15 Mr. Cook?
- MR. COOK: Yes, he is.
- 17 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you.
- 18 MR. COOK: One of the things we were
- 19 looking at is the compensation package, which
- 20 includes the breakdown of the value of the catch
- 21 within the five years, but we're looking at ten
- 22 years. You know, we'd like to base the income
- 23 that each individual trapper had made in that
- 24 given period. And I think -- I do have documents
- 25 and records of the catch and the registered

- 1 trappers in our area. I have that for information
- 2 purposes. And also the information on what they
- 3 caught, the amount of monies that were made.
- 4 So the formula that was presented in
- 5 the compensation policy package from Hydro, there
- 6 is some other issues that we had as individual
- 7 trappers and fishermen in our territory. And
- 8 that's why I stress to continue the consultation
- 9 with those that are affected in our community.
- 10 We are under the jurisdiction of the
- 11 Province of Manitoba. At the current time we are
- 12 not a First Nation community under the
- 13 administration of Northern Affairs. Our community
- 14 functions under the Northern Affairs Act, which
- 15 has an elected mayor and council.
- 16 The notification in the compensation
- 17 package that was received by e-mail on October 3rd
- 18 from Ian -- I can't say the last name -- it's
- 19 B-L-O-U-W. Blouw? He's a special projects
- 20 officer, policy strategic initiative department,
- 21 Aboriginal relations division, at 360 Portage
- 22 Avenue, that's where he works out of.
- So there's much work that we have
- 24 identified that has to be done before we come to a
- 25 consensus and an agreement on how and what we

- 1 would like to see as compensation for the
- 2 individual trappers and fishermen. We are going
- 3 to work as a unit. We don't want to see
- 4 compensation going to individual trappers. We
- 5 come from the community where we want to be
- 6 unified. And when we have unity, it's a lot
- 7 stronger than an individual itself. That's my
- 8 opinion.
- 9 So in this consultation process that's
- 10 going to take place within a community with the
- 11 local trappers and fishermen, there's always a
- 12 monetary sense when you're discussing projects.
- 13 Also the environmental scan of the affected areas,
- 14 we want to gather information and data of what is
- 15 actually out there that's been affected by the
- 16 proposed project. We know what's been damaged
- 17 already because of the previous projects that were
- 18 developed by Hydro in the last 25, 30 years. We
- 19 know that because we were right in the middle of
- 20 the two lakes, like we're located between
- 21 Wintering Lake and Landing Lake. Landing Lake
- 22 branches off into the Nelson River. The Nelson
- 23 River is one of the main rivers that do provide
- 24 Hydro project dams.
- 25 So when we -- we in the community have

- 1 identified many issues that are outstanding. For
- 2 an example, we have grave sites in our community
- 3 area, our territory, which were affected by Hydro.
- 4 They are covered up with rock, 20 to 30 feet of
- 5 rock, buried. You know, that's our people that
- 6 used to live in our community. And that's another
- 7 issue that we have addressed to Hydro when they
- 8 came to our meetings in our community.
- 9 Our community is very small. We only
- 10 have about 125 people there. We try to work
- 11 within the system that's in place set by the
- 12 provincial government. So we as individuals from
- 13 the trapping and fishing industry decided amongst
- 14 ourselves to be unified and to work as a unit on
- 15 issues identified, that are issues that affect and
- 16 that are adverse effects from Hydro projects.
- 17 As I said previously, that prior to
- 18 the start of this project we had community open
- 19 house meetings. May 22, 2008, we had round one.
- 20 I think Hydro calls them by rounds I guess, I
- 21 don't know why. Maybe at round five we will be
- 22 knocked out, I don't know. Same thing in round
- 23 two, 2009, January 21st; January 27, 2010, round
- 24 three; September 23, 2010, round four.
- So we have been trying to schedule a

- 1 meeting with the people that you work with, that
- 2 are part of your department, to move forward and
- 3 address those issues. But we haven't been, due to
- 4 weather, we have no control over that. So
- 5 hopefully in the near future we can move forward
- 6 and work in collaboration, in harmony, with the
- 7 understanding, and to respect the wishes of the
- 8 people in the community.
- 9 We have an elder that was supposed to
- 10 be with us. It's unfortunate that he's not able
- 11 to make it at this time. We respect our elder.
- 12 Our elder is a person with knowledge which see --
- 13 who had many years of experience in trapping and
- 14 fishing. Due to his health, he's not able to be
- 15 with us at this meeting but he'll be here
- 16 tomorrow.
- 17 So when I say traditional beliefs, my
- 18 strong belief is that to restore that grave site
- 19 and the sites that were buried, flooded out by
- 20 Hydro, to try to retrieve those bones and set them
- in an area where there will be no more flooding,
- 22 that's a project in itself. We can get
- 23 archeologists to work with us, but it takes money
- 24 to do that. And that's one of the things we are
- 25 going to be looking at as a compensation to the

- 1 community.
- Our history of Thicket Portage was a
- 3 main base for the Thompson project, which is Inco,
- 4 for information of those who don't know. But I'm
- 5 not going to tell you more about that, because I
- 6 think some of you like me know what the things are
- 7 about Thompson.
- 8 Our traditional land territory goes as
- 9 high as Wuskwatim project. We have maps, we have
- 10 documentation that includes that last project that
- 11 Hydro developed.
- 12 I have documentation back from 1946
- 13 that states that that's our territory. Yet we
- 14 were not consulted on issues that affected the
- 15 people in our community, on that big project that
- 16 you had with Nelson House.
- So, again, being a community of
- 18 Northern Affairs under the jurisdiction of the
- 19 Province of Manitoba, I feel that we are excluded
- from any consultation, because we're not a member
- 21 of a First Nation, we're not recognized. Yet our
- 22 membership exceeds a hundred people of First
- 23 Nation ancestry. And that's where I come in with
- 24 the respect of traditional land, the use of land,
- 25 without the knowledge you're passing on to the

- 1 youth respecting Mother Earth, and use it wisely.
- 2 Because if you don't use it wisely it's not going
- 3 to help you, it's not going to take care of you.
- 4 You have to take care of it.
- I see in our northern Province of
- 6 Manitoba, you have many Hydro dams, Hydro projects
- 7 that you guys have developed. Our Mother Earth
- 8 has been wounded and it takes a long time for her
- 9 to heal.
- 10 And that's why we would like to be
- 11 involved in any other discussions that you may
- 12 have that have affected our area. We have maps of
- 13 maybe four or five trappers in the proposed line
- 14 area that this project is going to go through.
- 15 But what we need, our initial task is to do that
- 16 environmental scan, to find out what actually is
- 17 going to be damaged. That's my main focus on this
- 18 at the moment. I'm only tackling one project at a
- 19 time, but there's a lot of projects I've got to
- 20 work on, and I'm only one person.
- 21 But I get my energy from the people
- 22 that I work with. We talk about things. We
- 23 exchange information, we share ideas, regardless
- 24 of good or bad. We accept them all. That's what
- 25 makes us unique I guess, because we are always

- 1 left in the dark. I'm speaking because, from
- 2 previous projects that your corporation has
- 3 developed and built.
- 4 In closing, I respect the Commission
- 5 members, the employees of Hydro for providing me
- 6 with the time to give out my issues and concerns
- 7 in relation to your project that's going to be
- 8 developed. I'm available to be talked to on an
- 9 individual basis if someone wants to talk. I like
- 10 talking. (Voice from back of room)
- 11 THE CHAIRMAN: You'll get an
- 12 opportunity later. I just want to let Mr. Cook
- 13 finish his presentation, please.
- MR. COOK: So when we are finished
- 15 here, I'd like to mingle around and talk to
- 16 individual people to find out who they really are.
- 17 Because I see you guys -- I may not see you guys
- 18 again.
- 19 So thanks again, Mr. Sargeant. I want
- 20 to ask some of the members if they would like to
- 21 add any information to what I have just said, if
- 22 that's okay with you guys.
- 23 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, I have a couple
- 24 of questions of you. Can I ask them now?
- MR. COOK: Sure, go ahead.

- THE CHAIRMAN: I'd just like to ask 1
- you a little bit more about these grave sites that 2
- you mentioned. You said that they had been 3
- covered by rock? 4
- 5 MR. COOK: Yes, they have.
- THE CHAIRMAN: And when was that done? 6
- MR. COOK: Well, I can ask the guy 7
- that's been in that area longer than I have, 8
- because I just returned to my community seven 9
- 10 years ago.
- 11 THE CHAIRMAN: Sure.
- MR. COOK: Johnny, do you know? 12
- MR. CRATE: 1992. 13
- 14 THE CHAIRMAN: And that was done by
- Manitoba Hydro you said? 15
- MR. COOK: By Manitoba Hydro in one of 16
- their projects I guess. I don't know what was 17
- built then. 18
- 19 THE CHAIRMAN: So was it to
- 20 accommodate for some old flooding or?
- 21 MR. COOK: You see, what happens in
- the Nelson River is that each summer, Manitoba 22
- 23 Hydro provides dollars for us to clean up the
- 24 debris that's flowing around the river, because
- once it eventually -- if we don't pick it up here, 25

- 1 it's going to go down to the dam site and get
- 2 caught in the turbines or whatever. It will do
- 3 damage to the property. So I guess that's where
- 4 the clean-up is at, the purpose of the clean-up.
- 5 So in our community we go out 20 days
- 6 in the summer months. Hydro puts out money for
- 7 the community and we go out and do the cleaning.
- 8 THE CHAIRMAN: And the clean-up is
- 9 along the Nelson River?
- 10 MR. COOK: It's on the Nelson River,
- 11 yeah.
- 12 THE CHAIRMAN: And have you had
- 13 discussions yet with Hydro about this particular
- 14 grave site?
- 15 MR. COOK: We have had, I think the
- 16 third meeting that we had in the community, there
- 17 was some technicians that did come to our
- 18 community and they identified the area through a
- 19 Powerpoint presentation and they put it on their
- 20 maps. And they provided us with five folders of
- 21 reports from their findings of those meetings they
- 22 had in Thicket. So the information is there.
- 23 They also provided on a disk, and we could have
- 24 access to it, and maps.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.

- 1 Mr. Gibbons?
- 2 MR. GIBBONS: Yes, two questions if I
- 3 may, just to clarify so I understand who you are
- 4 representing and the area that you are
- 5 representing. The Trappers Association and the
- 6 Fishers Association are separate associations?
- 7 MR. COOK: Yes, they are.
- 8 MR. GIBBONS: But nonetheless you are
- 9 consulting with both of them?
- 10 MR. COOK: Yes, I am.
- MR. GIBBONS: Okay. And the other is,
- when you talk about the community, and you're
- 13 talking about Thicket Portage, are you talking now
- 14 of the Metis community, or Metis and First Nations
- 15 community? Could you give me a little bit more
- 16 detail on what the community is that you are
- 17 representing when you are doing your consulting?
- 18 MR. COOK: The interest of the
- 19 individual trappers and the fishermen within that
- 20 community.
- MR. GIBBONS: Are those --
- MR. COOK: They are First Nation
- 23 members.
- MR. GIBBONS: There are no --
- MR. COOK: There is about a handful of

- Metis. 1
- MR. GIBBONS: A handful of Metis and 2
- 3 mostly First Nations?
- MR. COOK: Yes. 4
- 5 MR. GIBBONS: I see. Thank you.
- THE CHAIRMAN: There are a number of 6
- these people are First Nation members? 7
- MR. COOK: Yes, they are. The 8
- majority are from the Cross Lake First Nation. 9
- That's our parent band. 10
- 11 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
- Mr. Cook, are there any other -- I 12
- think you indicated you were going to consult with 13
- other people from Thicket Portage if they had 14
- 15 anything to add?
- MR. COOK: Yes, I did. I asked openly 16
- to members that are here, if they wanted to add, 17
- if I missed anything in my presentation, if they 18
- 19 had any other issues that they should let me know
- 20 and then I can --
- 21 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Does anybody
- from Thicket Portage want to come up to add to 22
- what Mr. Cook has said? 23
- 24 MR. COOK: We have a member here
- that's a trapper, and his name is Norman Bignell 25

- 1 and he's on that list.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Is he here? Mr.
- 3 Bignell, could you come to the mic, please?
- 4 Mr. Bignell, I'll ask the Commission secretary to
- 5 give the oath.
- 6 MS. JOHNSON: Could you please state
- 7 your name for the record? Could you just say your
- 8 name, please?
- 9 MR. BIGNELL: Okay, I am glad to be
- 10 here this evening. Oh, I'm sorry, I'm glad to be
- 11 here this evening. My name is Norm Bignell and
- 12 I'd like to introduce myself.
- 13 Norman Bignell: Sworn.
- 14 MR. BIGNELL: I'd just like to say a
- 15 few words. I don't want to take much time this
- 16 evening. I heard about this meeting here just
- 17 recently, maybe about four, five days ago. And
- 18 I'm glad to be here this evening, ladies and
- 19 gentlemen. I'd like to at least put a few words
- 20 for my -- well, I guess I can say my hometown.
- 21 I've been with Hydro for quite a while these past
- 22 years. I worked for Hydro in my younger days.
- I know what's been going on at Cross
- 24 Lake, you know, (inaudible), but I reckon there's
- 25 a few down there. But whatever, like back home

- 1 here in Thicket Portage, we have a little problem
- 2 here because that water level comes up sometimes.
- 3 One of the line holders from 914 in Thicket
- 4 Portage District. All I need to say is, you know,
- 5 I'd like to see someone here to have all the help,
- 6 at least all the trappers and fishermen that are
- 7 involved with Hydro and them. And I met a friend
- 8 of mine, you know, he must be a friend of mine,
- 9 he's from Hydro, everybody knows him as Hadley.
- 10 He wrote a letter to me. I'd be happy to see
- 11 trappers get involved with this, you know, before
- 12 this -- what we have here right now, this issue.
- 13 And whatever happens in the future, I'd like to
- 14 see my friends from Thicket Portage, they are the
- 15 trappers, the main ones.
- 16 You know, it really bothers me
- 17 sometimes, because I've seen my own people, you
- 18 know, what happened to them back in Nelson River.
- 19 All these years, long before that I used to trap
- 20 down there, before I took my dad's line, back in
- 21 history, I was raised there from the camp. I knew
- 22 what's been happening all these years, all these
- 23 overflows and all that. But I'd like to see, you
- 24 know, like there's -- Canada is Canada for us.
- 25 Like, you know, there's transmission line going

- through my country, not too far from Paint Lake, 1
- 2 from here down to Thicket Portage. But I'd like
- 3 to see someone do something about it, and whatever
- 4 is going to happen in the future, but I'm not here
- to argue with anybody. I'd just like to see 5
- what's going to happen in the future. You know, 6
- the future life, like Hydro will be (inaudible). 7
- Whatever happens in the future, like today and 8
- tomorrow, I'd like to hear more. Maybe I'm taking 9
- too much time. Thank you ladies and gentlemen, 10
- and pleased to meet you gentlemen from Hydro. 11
- 12 Okay, thanks.
- 13 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. Bignell.
- 14 Any other Thicket Portage people? Mr. Cook?
- 15 MR. COOK: We have Solomon Parenteau
- here right now. He was on the list of people that 16
- was supposed to make a presentation. 17
- THE CHAIRMAN: Does he wish to say 18
- 19 something?
- 20 MR. COOK: I imagine so. I can't
- 21 speak on his behalf. He's sitting right here.
- 22 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.
- 23 Mr. Parenteau, I'll ask the Commission secretary
- 24 to administer the oath.
- 25 MS. JOHNSON: Could you state your

- 1 name for the record, please?
- 2 MR. PARENTEAU: Solomon Parenteau.
- 3 Solomon Parenteau: Sworn.
- 4 THE CHAIRMAN: Mrs. Lagimodiere took
- 5 the oath the other night, so that still carries.
- 6 Go ahead, please.
- 7 MR. PARENTEAU: Okay. We'll start
- 8 with my family has been trapping and fishing,
- 9 harvesting in Thicket Portage since the '50s. We
- 10 continue to trap, fish, harvest in the area. I
- 11 currently am teaching my grandchildren, other
- 12 youth and local schools in land based training for
- 13 school credits, plus the MMF.
- 14 These are two of my grandsons which
- 15 I'm teaching. One is eight and one is ten. The
- one that's ten now, he's been with me for three
- 17 years, and he's learned a lot. He probably can --
- 18 actually, when I bring other people out, he wants
- 19 to teach. So he's picked up quite a few skills.
- 20 That's another one of my grandsons lifting our
- 21 traps.
- 22 And we had two sales this year, this
- 23 was our second sale we caught this year. The
- 24 grandson that was with me, he done most of the
- work, plus one of the other kids, he done some.

- 1 But mostly the first we caught was just between me
- 2 and him.
- This is some of the stuff we done at
- 4 high school. We brought some of the furs in to do
- 5 a presentation and show the kids how to skin. We
- 6 usually do the skinning and get kids involved.
- 7 Plus after the skin, we also get them -- how to
- 8 prepare the furs too. And this is part of the
- 9 same thing, that is with one of the other schools
- 10 with the smaller kids. We also skin with the
- 11 smaller kids -- some of the bigger kids, we also
- 12 get them involved with the skinning and the
- 13 stretching, as you can see here.
- This is a camp. We set up a camp
- 15 every day, it is either a tent or we use a tarp.
- 16 We set up a camp, like it's part of the trapline.
- 17 We set up different things. This is stuff we
- 18 teach to kids.
- 19 And there's another one that we do
- 20 some -- also we do some cooking. Usually we try
- 21 to cook wild stuff and the kids get involved, and
- 22 what we cook is eaten up with the kids and they
- 23 enjoy it.
- This is on one of our hunting trips.
- 25 We also teach the kids how to set nets. This is

- 1 also while she showed them how to set the nets in
- 2 winter. And after the fish are caught, we also
- 3 teach them how to fillet and to clean the fish.
- 4 This year we took the high school kids
- 5 out trapping. Before we took out the kids
- 6 trapping they had to, I think it was 150 hours
- 7 they have to put in, through the high school, it
- 8 was all paid for through the school. Their boat,
- 9 boat card was paid for through the school, and
- 10 their certificate for the guns, firearms. Also
- 11 they were taught CPR. And before we took the kids
- 12 out, they were taken out to the gun range and we
- 13 teach them how to shoot the guns. And this is one
- 14 of the kill we done with the kids. The kids
- 15 themselves shot the animal. That's after the
- 16 stuff is skinned, we usually hang our meat, we
- 17 usually wash it down good, then hang them.
- This is also another hunt, winter
- 19 birds. We usually take the kids out bird hunting
- 20 and also this is one of the kids plucking a goose.
- 21 This was after supper, usually every
- 22 evening we make a bonfire outside, we usually have
- 23 a wiener roast, or we do marshmallows, and we also
- 24 tell some stories. The kids enjoy that.
- The attendance too, with the kids with

- 1 the high school, we had 12 kids we took out last
- 2 year. The kids we took out with the program they
- 3 ran, they couldn't miss school. If their
- 4 attendance was dropping, they would be taken out
- 5 and somebody else would fill in. But that never
- 6 happened. When we started with the kids their
- 7 attendance was in the low 50s. By the time we
- 8 finished the program, their attendance was up to
- 9 97, and there was one kid that never missed a
- 10 class.
- 11 And that's a manmade dam. That's just
- 12 some of the traplines that are marked, that are
- 13 listed on the map.
- 14 The line we trap on is the 33, which
- is the line that's going to be coming through.
- 16 And we feel that the stuff we do with the schools,
- 17 and my grandchildren and families getting
- involved, with the line going through right now,
- 19 we're having trouble right now with people getting
- 20 into our line. They've been stealing some of our
- 21 furs, our traps. And we feel with Hydro line
- 22 coming in, it's going to open it up for more
- 23 people to get in, and right now it is having quite
- 24 a big effect on us. With the Hydro line coming
- in, we figure the stuff I'm teaching with the

- 1 schools, my grandchildren and my kids, we're going
- 2 to have a big loss here.
- And this is somebody else's pictures.
- 4 Yeah, that will be somebody else's pictures.
- 5 I'd like to mention too with my
- 6 grandsons, when we sell our furs they have been
- 7 keeping our money to put it away and they plan
- 8 on -- actually my grandson, they usually plan a
- 9 year ahead what they are going to buy with the
- 10 money they are making with their trapping. And
- 11 that's also another way of teaching the kids how
- 12 to handle their money.
- 13 My one grandson there, he planned last
- 14 year to buy himself a bike, and he spent \$700 on
- 15 the one bike. And this year he's planning on
- 16 buying something else already.
- 17 If the Hydro line comes in, that's
- 18 going to take it all away. Because right now it's
- 19 going to kind of push the animals away, and we are
- 20 afraid that it's going to affect us big time.
- Okay. Julyda is going to speak on
- 22 this part, the letter. Thank you.
- 23 THE CHAIRMAN: Could we have order in
- 24 the audience, please? Let the presenters speak.
- MS. LAGIMODIERE: Good evening and

- 1 thanks once again for the opportunity to be up
- 2 here helping to share some of the concerns that we
- 3 foresee by having Bipole III, and as you see up
- 4 there, the Keeyask dam as well. We believe it's
- 5 definitely going to change the environment and
- 6 it's going to impact the way of life as described
- 7 by Mr. Parenteau and other members of the
- 8 community of Thicket Portage, that it's going to
- 9 really impact them and change the way of life.
- 10 They are who they are, in terms of being trappers
- 11 or fishers or harvesters, because of the way of
- 12 life. And if that's threatened, I think that's a
- 13 great loss. And it's not only a loss for the
- 14 members today, but it definitely will be a loss of
- 15 opportunity for future generations.
- 16 Through the MMF, we support these
- 17 programs that Mr. Parenteau has been talking about
- 18 as presented to you, not only for individuals but
- 19 for the schools, because it's very important that
- 20 our traditional way of life is known to our youth.
- 21 And as Mr. Parenteau mentioned to you,
- 22 some of our youth who had very poor attendance
- 23 initially at the beginning of the land base
- 24 training, or the high school credit that they were
- 25 taking, their attendance improved up to 100

- 1 percent for one individual and the high 90s for
- 2 the other youth. They were very happy to be here.
- 3 In fact, some of them didn't want to go home, they
- 4 wanted to stay out on the land.
- 5 So I wanted to share that with you,
- 6 and I'll let Mr. Parenteau finish his
- 7 presentation. But one of the things that concerns
- 8 us is the inadequate accommodation or lack of
- 9 accommodation for the losses that are perceived to
- 10 be forthcoming, that on traditions and Metis
- 11 identity, or Aboriginal identity, loss of income,
- 12 and again education opportunities for our youth
- 13 and future generations.
- 14 Recommendations that we are making is
- 15 that Manitoba Hydro acknowledge the losses and
- 16 work with the people who are impacted, and come up
- 17 with a mutually agreed upon compensation package,
- 18 because it is going to change the way of life.
- 19 There's no doubt in our mind about that.
- 20 And we are asking the Commission to
- 21 direct Manitoba Hydro to resolve the problems that
- 22 are presented here today before you, before any
- 23 licence is issued.
- 24 With that I'm going to pass the mic
- 25 back to Mr. Parenteau for closing remarks, if he'd

- like to have any. 1
- MR. PARENTEAU: Yeah, I should have 2
- 3 mentioned that with the hunting, fishing, myself,
- I have been teaching my kids. I harvest my fish, 4
- my food, my wild meat, and I live on it 5
- year-round. 6
- 7 And the area we trap now was, Tolko
- was in there, they took out quite a few trees and 8
- I see a lot of our wildlife was kind of pushed 9
- out. But with the new group coming in now this 10
- year -- especially we notice it more this year, 11
- 12 especially the moose, there was quite a few moose
- 13 tracks. And this year I kind of went out to go
- hunt further out, which has cost me more money. 14
- But I see this year moose are coming in, I could 15
- have stayed in my area and hunted. 16
- Hopefully, we can keep it the way it 17
- is and I can continue teaching my kids, and with 18
- 19 the high school and the other schools with the
- 20 stuff we're doing now. Thank you.
- 21 THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Parenteau, just in
- your last comments you mentioned about the moose 22
- coming into the area. Is this fairly new? 23
- 24 MR. PARENTEAU: Just this last year
- 25 there's quite a few spots where there's tracks.

- 1 Actually, there was a couple of moose shot between
- 2 here and Wintering. And it's been a while since
- 3 we've seen that kind of movement with the moose.
- 4 THE CHAIRMAN: Are there typically a
- 5 lot of caribou in the area?
- MR. PARENTEAU: We got that somewhere
- 7 else, we got that on Landing Lake.
- 8 THE CHAIRMAN: So there weren't very
- 9 many around Thicket Portage?
- 10 MR. PARENTEAU: There's a few, it is
- 11 the same caribou that is going back and forth, but
- 12 we haven't seen them in Wintering. But some may
- 13 spot them by planes and they are in the area.
- 14 THE CHAIRMAN: And the Bipole line,
- 15 you say that it's going to go through your
- 16 trapping area. Will the entire line go directly
- 17 through your area?
- 18 MR. PARENTEAU: A good part of it, the
- 19 area we're trapping now.
- 20 THE CHAIRMAN: And how much of your
- 21 trapping area will be affected directly? I mean,
- 22 I know that there will be indirect.
- 23 MR. PARENTEAU: I would have to have a
- 24 better look at it right now, but it's probably
- 25 right now looking at it, it's probably 50 percent

- 1 or more.
- 2 THE CHAIRMAN: 50, 5-0 percent or
- 3 more?
- 4 MR. PARENTEAU: 50 percent or more.
- 5 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you.
- Anybody else? 6
- MR. PARENTEAU: Yeah, I mentioned the 7
- moose, I think I mentioned it, they had been 8
- pushed out from Tolko. I see they are back in 9
- again, and if Hydro goes through, they are going 10
- to push the moose out again. 11
- THE CHAIRMAN: How long has Tolko been 12
- 13 in the area?
- 14 MR. PARENTEAU: It's been probably a
- few years since they have moved out, but it's been 15
- years, certain areas have been cut years back, but 16
- there's new growth coming in which is getting 17
- higher for the animals in heat. 18
- 19 THE CHAIRMAN: Do they cut a lot of
- 20 trees in the area?
- 21 MR. PARENTEAU: Quite a bit, most of
- it is quite bare. When the growth comes in you 22
- can see probably a couple of miles away if you 23
- have flat ground. 24
- 25 THE CHAIRMAN: So there's a fair bit

- of bare area, is that what you are saying? 1
- 2 MR. PARENTEAU: Most of it has grown
- 3 in already, it's getting pretty thick.
- 4 THE CHAIRMAN: Sir, can you please let
- Mr. Parenteau speak? 5
- I imagine that's affected the 6
- wildlife, the cutting of trees by Tolko? 7
- MR. PARENTEAU: Yeah, but we noticed 8
- the animals are coming back, because the trees are 9
- getting higher and there's lots of new willows. 10
- Even the rabbits the last couple of years, there's 11
- been a lot of rabbits, which are coming back too. 12
- 13 THE CHAIRMAN: So is your concern that
- cutting the Bipole through will chase the animals 14
- away again? 15
- MR. PARENTEAU: Yeah, it will probably 16
- chase them out again and it will probably be years 17
- again before we see it, before they come back. 18
- 19 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. Thank you. I
- 20 don't think we have any other questions right now,
- 21 but thank you very much for your presentation
- 22 today.
- 23 MR. PARENTEAU: Thank you.
- 24 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you,
- Ms. Lagimodiere. 25

1	Are there any other people from	Page
2	Thicket Portage who wish to speak? Is there	
3	anyone else who wishes to make a presentation at	
4	this time? Anyone else in the audience want to	
5	make a presentation about the Bipole III project?	
6	Well, it's only 8:00 o'clock. We said	
7	we'd be here for a while longer. We'll take a	
8	short break, and if anybody decides in the next	
9	few minutes they want to say something, please let	
10	us know and we will give you the opportunity. So	
11	we'll take a few minutes break and we'll come	
12	back.	
13	MS. JOHNSON: Just before we break,	
14	we'll put this presentation on as THOM number 1.	
15	Thank you.	
16	(EXHIBIT THOM 1: Presentation of Mr.	
17	Parenteau)	
18	THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you.	
19	(Proceedings adjourned at 8:15 p.m.)	
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

- 1 Tuesday, October 16, 2012.
- 2 Upon commencing at 9:00 a.m.

3

- 4 THE CHAIRMAN: Good morning. We are
- 5 going to start the morning's proceedings off with
- 6 a presentation by Manitoba Hydro.
- 7 MS. S. JOHNSON: I am the department
- 8 manager of environmental licensing and assessment
- 9 for Manitoba Hydro in our transmission planning
- 10 and design area. What I'm going to do for you
- 11 today is just give you a quick overview of the
- 12 project, some of the stuff that's going on right
- 13 now so that you can get a better idea of where
- 14 we're going.
- So what does our system look like?
- 16 Basically, you've got two types of electrical
- 17 systems. You've got a HVDC system as well as an
- 18 AC system. Basically, the HVDC system is supplied
- 19 by the largest generators in Manitoba Hydro's
- 20 fleet, which is Kettle, Long Spruce and Limestone.
- 21 And if you look up on our map here, you can see
- 22 them. They are these guys up here. And basically
- 23 what they are connected to is Dorsey.
- 24 So what's important to understand is
- 25 if we lose this, all we have left is the AC system

- 1 to rely upon in order to provide the energy for
- 2 Manitoba.
- 3 So let's have a look at the
- 4 transmission lines in a bit more detail. We have
- 5 a lot of transmission lines and we have a lot of
- 6 transmission expertise. As you can see, we have
- 7 installed 18,500 kilometres of AC transmission
- 8 lines from 33 kV to 500 kV in the last 60 years.
- 9 Now, with that expertise in
- 10 transmission lines, we have also got expertise in
- 11 licensing and environmental assessment. The
- 12 Environment Act was proclaimed in force in March
- 13 31, 1988. And essentially what that meant was
- 14 that you had to have assessment of transmission
- 15 lines of 115 kV and over. As you can see in the
- 16 list here, we have been involved in a fair amount
- 17 of licensing endeavours.
- 18 Within the department that I manage,
- 19 we have ten professionals with a variety of
- 20 expertise in environmental science and we also
- 21 engage with several different consultants with
- 22 additional expertise.
- Now, why are we here today? In the
- 24 Manitoba Hydro Act, the purpose and objective of
- 25 this Act are to provide for the continuance of a

- 1 supply of power adequate for the needs of the
- 2 province. Now, what are those needs and what do
- 3 they look like? This chart basically shows you,
- 4 on the bottom, which is in the blue, the load that
- 5 Manitoba Hydro could supply without Bipole I and
- 6 Bipole II, including imports. What we see up here
- 7 at the top is the peak load that would have to be
- 8 served in a catastrophic failure of Dorsey or
- 9 Bipole I and Bipole II. It's difficult to see the
- 10 dates here, but essentially what you can see is
- 11 when we get to 2020, we are going to have a
- 12 1500-megawatt deficiency if we lose them.
- Now, why are Bipole I and Bipole II so
- 14 vulnerable? Basically, we've got two Bipole lines
- that are approximately 900 kilometres long, and
- 16 they're on the same right-of-way. These two lines
- 17 and the southern Dorsey Station transmit
- 18 70 percent of northern hydro generation.
- 19 Essentially, Dorsey has the most eggs in one
- 20 basket. And there's no other utility in the world
- 21 that transmits so much power through one critical
- 22 facility.
- 23 And we have had some close calls. I'm
- 24 not going to go through all of these, but
- 25 essentially I'll talk a little about the downburst

- 1 in Dorsey, the tornado, as well as another event
- 2 we had in Dorsey. There are a couple of different
- 3 events that happened. The one that you might find
- 4 interesting is the forest fires, because it's not
- 5 actually the fire at the towers that cause the
- 6 problem, it's the smoke. And essentially what
- 7 happens is that the air becomes a conductor when
- 8 you have smoke and it can cause your lines to
- 9 trip. And that's why when you talk about forest
- 10 fires in around our towers, we are so vulnerable.
- 11 So let's have a first look at the
- 12 September 1996 downburst. Basically, what a
- downburst is, it's a wind event that can cause
- 14 structural damage due to its intense low level
- 15 outflows. This storm had winds of approximately
- 16 100 kilometres an hour, and ran 75 kilometres from
- 17 Poplar Point to Stony Mountain. There was a
- 18 microburst that ran anywhere from 150 to 180, that
- 19 actually took one of the HVDC towers down. And
- 20 due to the pressure from that, we wound up losing
- 21 another 18 towers, which resulted in 19 towers
- 22 down. This was a huge wake-up call for Manitoba
- 23 Hydro with some of the risks.
- Now, we were lucky, the next day the
- 25 weather was good, it had dried up, we had the

- 1 equipment and we could access these lines. And
- 2 within four and a half days we had power back up.
- 3 But we were lucky.
- 4 The tornado in Elie was also another
- 5 major challenge for us. Basically, June 2007, it
- 6 touched down on the TransCanada Highway at about
- 7 6:30 p.m., picked up speed, headed towards Elie,
- 8 and did a fair amount of damage there. It
- 9 basically travelled for about six kilometres, at
- 10 its widest berth it was about 300 kilometres and
- 11 lasted for about 40 minutes.
- 12 Now, the reason this is so scary is
- 13 that this tornado was only about 25 kilometres
- 14 from Dorsey. And if it had been that much closer,
- 15 we would have been in a whole lot of trouble.
- 16 Speaking of Dorsey, we also had some
- 17 lightning strikes in Dorsey in August 2007. The
- 18 result of this, as you can see, was a fair amount
- 19 of damage to our equipment. We lost
- 20 1348 megawatts of power, seven valve groups
- 21 tripped off, and we had three transmission lines
- 22 tripped. The result of this was we had to call
- 23 MISO, which is the Midwestern Independent System
- 24 Operator, to ensure we could get enough power from
- 25 there. We had to look to Bipole II and increase

- 1 it, Brandon Generating Station, as well as Grand
- 2 Rapids to make up for some of the deficiencies
- 3 that this caused.
- 4 Now, let's talk a little about what
- 5 this project actually looks like. Essentially, as
- 6 you can see up here in Keewatinoow, we have our
- 7 northern converter. And this is about 79
- 8 kilometres away from Gimli. What it does is
- 9 converts the AC power to DC so we can move it down
- 10 the line. At the bottom you'll see we've got
- 11 Riel, and that's essentially the southern
- 12 converter. It's just outside of Winnipeg and it
- 13 converts back that DC power into AC. And then in
- 14 between we've got our transmission line. So let's
- 15 talk about that transmission line just a bit more.
- In the north we've got what are called
- 17 guyed towers. And essentially it's a little
- 18 difficult to see, but there's wires coming down on
- 19 each side of these. And the reason why we use
- 20 those in the north -- and there's a good example
- 21 of them at the back, or there was last night there
- 22 somewhere, those are what the towers look like.
- 23 And the reason why we use them in the north is
- 24 because of the permafrost in the ground, the guyed
- 25 wires allow you to create a bit more stability and

- 1 you can adjust them.
- Now, when we move into the south, we
- 3 can use free standing or self-supporting
- 4 structures. And this gives you an idea of some of
- 5 the different ones.
- Now, what's important to note here is
- 7 whether or not you use a guyed tower or a
- 8 self-supporting, your right-of-way is still 66
- 9 metres. So the amount of land we have to clear,
- 10 even if we've got the guyed wires, is still 66
- 11 metres.
- Now let's talk about the converter
- 13 stations that attach these. In Keewatinoow, which
- 14 again as you can see, is up north. We have
- 15 developed access but undeveloped site. Due to the
- 16 remote area, we are requiring full scale worker
- 17 accommodation, and we are under the
- 18 Burntwood/Nelson labour agreement.
- 19 For Riel, the area is partially
- 20 developed and there's no camp requirements.
- 21 For those of you that aren't familiar
- 22 with the Burntwood/Nelson labour agreement,
- 23 basically it's a no strike walk-out bargaining
- 24 agreement which covers major Northern Manitoba
- 25 Hydro projects, sets out hiring preferences,

- 1 including priority for northern Aboriginal
- 2 residents, wages and certain benefits.
- Now, we've talked about all the
- 4 different sections. This gives you a quick
- 5 overview of what everything looks like when you
- 6 put it together. Essentially, you start at your
- 7 generating station, you use AC lines to go to your
- 8 converter, and then you convert it to DC and run
- 9 it down your line, and take it back to your other
- 10 converter.
- Now, for those of you curious why we
- 12 converted to DC, when you're running a line this
- 13 long, it makes more sense to run a DC line because
- 14 you have less loss. And that's the reason why we
- 15 convert it. It arrives at Riel, we convert it
- 16 back to AC, which is what we use when we plug in
- 17 electronics, and we distribute it to the homes.
- Now, let's talk a little more about
- 19 the environmental assessment process. The
- 20 environmental assessment for this project has
- 21 entailed going through a comprehensive site
- 22 selection and environmental assessment process.
- 23 If you look on the yellow section here, this is
- 24 essentially the area that we started with and it
- 25 encompasses 20 percent of the area of the Province

- 1 of Manitoba. We embraced engagement through
- 2 public engagement, we had four rounds of
- 3 consultation, and we used the input from those
- 4 rounds of consultation in order to adjust the
- 5 route.
- Now, let's have a little better idea
- 7 of exactly what that consultation process looked
- 8 like, which was a very big part of the assessment
- 9 process. Essentially, we had four rounds of
- 10 consultation. And as you can see, there are
- 11 different stages, and we came out with different
- 12 decisions at the end of each one of them, and then
- 13 came out with a map of a preliminary preferred
- 14 route, which we presented, and then in the end, a
- 15 final preferred route. We believe that we have
- 16 selected the route with the least impact on the
- 17 environment, communities and residents along the
- 18 proposed path, while meeting Hydro's needs for
- 19 reliability and technical feasibility.
- Now, how are we going to build this?
- 21 Essentially, you've got your converter station in
- the north, and then as we go down the transmission
- line, we're going to have eight construction
- 24 segments. We're going to work with stakeholders
- 25 all along the way. And in regards to tower

- 1 locations, they are not actually committed to in
- 2 the design right now. We'll do fine-tuning in
- 3 terms of exact tower spotting in the field, taking
- 4 into consideration accounts for ground constraints
- 5 and construction logistics.
- Now, throughout this process, how do
- 7 we ensure that we're protecting the environment?
- 8 Through the site selection process, we did
- 9 everything we could to avoid impacts wherever it
- 10 was feasible through this routing. Then we have
- 11 an environmental protection program. And
- 12 essentially what that is, it's almost an umbrella
- 13 that provides a framework for the delivery,
- 14 management and monitoring of environmental
- 15 mitigation measures. And then within that, we've
- 16 got the specific environmental protection plans.
- 17 These are prescriptive general protection
- 18 measures, they ensure compliance with regulatory
- 19 requirements, and they identify and prescribe
- 20 mitigation for specific sensitive sites.
- In regards to stakeholders, finding
- 22 those specific sites is important, and the EPP or
- 23 Environmental Protection Plans will work
- 24 throughout the process to ensure that we talk to
- 25 communities to make sure we avoid some of those

- 1 sites.
- It's a work in progress and we will do 2
- 3 whatever we can to ensure we maintain integrity
- and work with all our different partners and 4
- stakeholders. Thank you. 5
- THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Ms. Johnson. 6
- Does anybody in the audience have any specific 7
- questions of Ms. Johnson? I quess not. So thank 8
- you for your presentation this morning. 9
- 10 We have at least one person who has
- indicated he wishes to make a presentation, and 11
- 12 that's Mr. Robert Parenteau senior. He's here
- with Jason Cook who will introduce him. So 13
- 14 Mr. Cook and Mr. Parenteau, if you can come to the
- 15 mic?
- MR. COOK: First I would like to thank 16
- the panel for providing us with this opportunity 17
- to give our elder, our uncle and our friend in the 18
- 19 community of Thicket Portage. Mr. Parenteau has
- 20 been a long-time resident of Thicket Portage. He
- moved from Camperville in the late '40s due to 21
- hunting and fishing, trapping, and made his 22
- residence in Thicket Portage. 23
- 24 Mr. Parenteau is 78 years of age, and
- currently his health has taken him down quite a 25

- 1 bit. And his experience in this area as a
- 2 frontiersman, trapper, fisherman and a geology
- 3 worker for INCO. Earlier in the days it was
- 4 called Canaco. And he did some exploration work
- 5 in this area. He has many stories to tell about
- 6 Thompson, on how Thompson came to be the city it
- 7 is right now.
- 8 So Mr. Parenteau is an elder with the
- 9 Manitoba Metis Federation. And Mr. Parenteau has
- 10 been trapping in Thicket Portage, our traditional
- 11 land area, until his health has stopped him.
- We were supposed to wait for Julyda,
- 13 Julyda had some briefing notes for Mr. Parenteau,
- 14 but we didn't want to hinder the presentations and
- 15 the agenda process that the Commission has taken
- 16 upon --
- 17 THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Cook, if you wish
- 18 to wait, we can accommodate you later this morning
- 19 or this afternoon. It's not a real problem.
- 20 Would you prefer that? I don't see Julyda here
- 21 yet, so if you would prefer to wait till later on,
- 22 that's fine with us.
- MR. COOK: Okay. Maybe about
- 24 11:00 o'clock would be good, because we don't want
- 25 to keep Mr. Parenteau here too long.

- THE CHAIRMAN: No, I can understand 1
- that too. So if Mr. Parenteau is fine with 2
- 3 waiting until Julyda comes, we'll accommodate
- 4 that.
- 5 MR. COOK: Thank you. He said it's
- okay with him. You can proceed now. 6
- THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. So we'll see you 7
- again then in an hour and a half or so, whenever. 8
- If Julyda shows up earlier, we can go then. 9
- 10 MR. COOK: Okay.
- 11 THE CHAIRMAN: Is there anyone else in
- the audience who wishes to make an oral 12
- presentation today? Well, nobody is leaping 13
- 14 forward to make a presentation, so we will be
- here, we'll take a break, and if anybody shows up 15
- and wishes to make a presentation, we'll 16
- reconvene. And of course we'll reconvene when 17
- Mrs. Lagimodiere shows up. 18
- 19 (Proceedings recessed at 9:20 a.m. and
- 20 reconvened at 9:38 a.m.)
- THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. We'll come to 21
- order. We have a presentation. Mrs. Lagimodiere 22
- has arrived and she will be introducing and 23
- 24 assisting Mr. Parenteau. Mr. Parenteau hasn't
- been sworn in, so I'll ask the Commission 25

- secretary to attend to that. 1
- 2 MS. JOHNSON: Could you please state
- 3 your name for the record?
- MR. PARENTEAU: Robert Parenteau from 4
- Thicket Portage. 5
- Robert Parenteau: Sworn. 6
- 7 THE CHAIRMAN: You may proceed.
- MS. LAGIMODIERE: Good morning 8
- everybody. Please allow me to introduce Metis 9
- elder, Robert Parenteau senior. He's a registered 10
- trapline holder. His traplines are numbers 7 and 11
- 16, and he's used the land since he moved to the 12
- 13 Thicket Portage area with his parents.
- 14 On this map you will note the
- 15 traplines assigned to him, or that he's registered
- as number 7 and 16, that's on the map and on your 16
- handout. And the Bipole III goes through 33, but 17
- it will have residual effects as to being on the 18
- 19 radius of that.
- 20 THE CHAIRMAN: Can one of you, maybe
- 21 Mr. Cook, can you show us where the Bipole line
- will go through? Can you come up and just point 22
- it out? Perhaps you can go back a slide, 23
- Mrs. Lagimodiere? 24
- 25 MS. LAGIMODIERE: While he's preparing

- 1 to do that, yesterday you heard from
- 2 Mr. Parenteau's brother, Solomon, and he's gone to
- 3 get a map that we're hoping is going to have a
- 4 more visual effect than what you have up to the
- 5 side here. Because it will show the rivers and
- 6 the creeks that are going to -- how it's going to
- 7 affect Mr. Parenteau's, Elder Parenteau's
- 8 trapline. Go ahead, Jason.
- 9 MR. COOK: On this map here we have
- 10 the Thompson, between here and Thicket Portage in
- 11 here. The proposed line is just south of Paint
- 12 Lake. This is Paint Lake here. And the line that
- 13 we see from the presentation that Hydro has given
- 14 us through is number 33, then down through 14, and
- 15 number 11.
- In our community, Thicket Portage, we
- 17 have trapline owners in those areas and the names
- 18 are on there. That's where we have -- and from
- 19 that line, I don't know what radius that the Hydro
- 20 has indicated to us, or what the effects may be.
- 21 It may be within five kilometres, I'm not sure.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Thirty-three, 14 and
- 23 11?
- MR. COOK: Yes.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you. Go

- 1 ahead, Mrs. Lagimodiere.
- 2 MS. LAGIMODIERE: Thank you. In this
- 3 next slide here, this is -- what do you call that?
- 4 MR. COOK: This one is a manmade dyke
- 5 put in by Conservation. It's on Wintering River.
- 6 It's one of the trapline holder's area, noting
- 7 that the water, when it fluctuates, it has effects
- 8 on the fur bearing animals within that surrounding
- 9 area. So this is one indication that shows that
- 10 if the water goes up or down, then it has the
- 11 effects on the animals within that area.
- MR. PARENTEAU: Yeah. That dam has
- 13 been there for as long as I could remember. When
- 14 the fish, you go there in the spring, sometimes
- 15 that dam would be full of pickerel there. Once
- 16 they get across there, they go to Portage crop,
- 17 and you never get the fish back because that dam
- 18 is there. It's good for 214, but it's no good for
- 19 us.
- MS. LAGIMODIERE: And just maybe,
- 21 Jason, you want to explain what 214 means?
- MR. COOK: 214 is one of the names
- 23 that we use for the community of Pikwitonei. It's
- 24 on the Hudson Bay railroad line and it's 214 miles
- 25 from The Pas. That's why we call it 214. And

- 1 this flooding area is in the Nelson River. I took
- 2 this photo of some of the things that do happen in
- 3 that area when the water is being raised by Hydro
- 4 from their dam, either Jenpeg or up north by
- 5 Norway House. So you can see the effects that it
- 6 has on, when water is being raised and the dams
- 7 are being built. And from that you will note that
- 8 there's always, I guess the summer clean-up, a
- 9 request to our community to go clean up the mess
- 10 that's been there by the raise of the water. That
- 11 has the effects also on the animals in that
- 12 surrounding area. So that's what we're concerned
- 13 about.
- 14 And also the fishing, you know, it
- does move high or low, then you know there's
- 16 damage to the fisherman's props and boats. And it
- 17 could be dangerous because you have debris
- 18 floating in the rivers and the lakes.
- MR. PARENTEAU: Like what Jason said,
- 20 I had this trapline since 1956. I had one river
- 21 there, you will see it on my map, that's where I
- 22 started with my beavers. But when Hydro moved in,
- 23 when I go set my traps -- I go, you go and look at
- 24 beaver traps everyday, at least every second day,
- 25 sometimes your trap is way up in the bush. They

- 1 let the water down and your trap is not -- and
- 2 your trap, they are there where you put them but
- 3 the water is gone, hey. One time they give us a
- 4 job there to cut that, to cull cross Portage.
- 5 When we got across, I was with Johnny Crait, he is
- 6 around here some place -- there's high ground
- 7 there. We knew there was a burial ground there.
- 8 When we got across there, there were bones laying
- 9 all over, there were bones laying there all over,
- 10 and they just had to pile the bones up, and Hydro
- 11 came in there with the helicopter with all the
- 12 cement and just covered it up there. And they are
- 13 still there. Johnny Crait seen that himself.
- 14 They were from Cross Lake.
- MR. COOK: Yeah, I mentioned this
- 16 yesterday at my presentation on the grave site.
- 17 So clearly you can see on the screen, that's
- 18 freshly laid out gravel. And that's the works of
- 19 the Hydro, because just about maybe 150 feet from
- 20 the shore, there's three cabins there. So that
- 21 shows that there was people living in that
- 22 surrounding area.
- 23 And prior to -- in our tradition when
- 24 we lose someone, they usually bury them in that
- 25 surrounding area because that's their land, that's

- out of respect for the individual. So they put a 1
- cross there to mark or keep people aware that 2
- 3 there is a cross and some grave sites in that
- area. That's why it's still standing. And that's 4
- an issue that we would like to work on to restore 5
- the bones. 6
- 7 THE CHAIRMAN: Where is that?
- MR. COOK: It's on the Nelson River. 8
- 9 THE CHAIRMAN: That's on the Nelson,
- 10 that picture?
- 11 MR. COOK: Yeah.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Okay, thank you. 12
- 13 MR. PARENTEAU: Now, there's a lot of
- graveyards. Like I remember there was guys 14
- trapping there, they were trapping in Cauchon, 15
- three of them, George Evans, Halgerson was there, 16
- and Ben Larson. And they died over there. And I 17
- was in Thicket Portage and when they -- to go and 18
- 19 get the body, they just buried them. They asked
- 20 me, them young guys, like where their dad is
- 21 buried? You see, a long time ago they never
- called -- that was never called that Cauchon Lake, 22
- 23 everybody called it Clearwater Lake. I don't know
- why they changed it to Cauchon lake. I think that 24
- is where he's buried up there some place in 25

- 1 Cauchon lake. So they don't know where their
- 2 dad's buried.
- There's lots of graveyards, though.
- 4 You go down that Nelson River, you'll see lots of
- 5 graveyards. Sometimes you'll go on a little
- 6 island, you will see just one grave. And we
- 7 happen to ask -- it was Johnny Crait's mom, we
- 8 were telling them about these graves there. There
- 9 was some kind of sickness that came through there,
- 10 just wiped them right out, some kind of a flu.
- 11 But she did remember him. She died when she was
- 12 about 80 years old, but she still remembered that
- 13 sickness went through there.
- 14 And you could still see, when you go
- 15 across, where the people had gardens and houses.
- 16 That's where they would spend the summer, live off
- 17 the land up there.
- 18 And we done the same thing in Comorant
- 19 before we move to Thicket Portage. So only the
- 20 good thing that was in Thicket Portage, we move
- 21 into Seaforth Lake. We had sturgeon, that's the
- 22 first time I ever seen a sturgeon. We had
- 23 sturgeon. We lived right off the land. But you
- 24 don't see that anymore.
- MR. COOK: Yeah. On the screen you'll

- 1 note that there is a floating island, we call it a
- 2 floating island because it's still sitting there.
- 3 And that's one of the areas that our elders have
- 4 indicated that there was a burial site there at
- 5 one time. But you will note that the water is so
- 6 high. Water has done a lot of damage in our
- 7 traditional land and territory. It's unfortunate
- 8 that this happens, but we as residents and
- 9 traditional land users have to go with what's
- 10 being presented or developed. So we strongly
- 11 believe that we need to restore what was lost.
- 12 And that's my project that I would undertake. I
- 13 have addressed this issue to many Hydro employees
- 14 in the past, and I will continue to try to restore
- 15 some of those grave sites that we have lost due to
- 16 flooding and previous Hydro projects.
- 17 THE CHAIRMAN: How would you like to
- 18 see that done? How would they be restored?
- MR. COOK: Well, there is technicians
- 20 that we could get from the archeologists, and
- 21 there's ways and means of recovering grave sites.
- 22 We don't have that expertise, but I have some
- 23 contact names that I could work on. But there
- 24 again, when you want to work ahead and move on
- issues, it always takes money, and that's the

- 1 thing we don't have. But that's the thing I'll be
- 2 working on, is trying to get some funding so we
- 3 could get this project on the go, so we could
- 4 retrieve those bones that are under water. And
- 5 those are dear friends of ours, relatives, that
- 6 live in the area.
- 7 This was back in the early '50s, so
- 8 after Hydro started building dams, that's when we
- 9 lost them. It's unfortunate that happens but
- 10 that's -- I guess that's development, I guess.
- 11 MR. PARENTEAU: There's lots of these
- 12 islands that we used to be able to see them
- 13 before, but a lot of them are under water now.
- 14 You don't see them until you break your motor,
- 15 then you know you hit something. Because I
- 16 remember one time I was with Johnny Crait, we were
- 17 fishing sturgeon, and I hit a rock and I broke my
- 18 motor in half. I never did get anything out of
- 19 it.
- There is a lot of places you go there,
- 21 you see where they had camps, you could see where
- 22 people long ago had gardens in there. There's a
- lot of graveyards along there. You can see where
- 24 Cauchon Lake comes into the Nelson River, just
- 25 across there. I was wondering, I couldn't figure

- 1 that out. When we were fishing sturgeon, we
- 2 didn't use corks and leads, we went in the bush
- 3 and got some dry sticks for our corks and little
- 4 rocks for our leads. And I went there, oh, you
- 5 should see the graveyard there, there's a lot of
- 6 that. Just a bunch of little white flags on it,
- 7 but there's no names on it. But then you'll see
- 8 some of them that -- you will see Metis signs on
- 9 them. So they must have been Metis in there too.
- 10 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes, Mr. Kaplan.
- 11 MR. PARENTEAU: I knew guys came from
- 12 Cross Lake one time, they wanted to find out about
- 13 those graveyards. And they come and see me, and I
- 14 showed them on the map. I seen them later and
- 15 they say they found them. That's the ones they
- 16 were looking for.
- 17 MR. KAPLAN: If I can ask a question,
- 18 I'm not sure which of the three of you to put it
- 19 to, but any one of you may wish to answer. As far
- 20 as the grave sites, what, if any, discussions have
- 21 you had up to this point with Hydro officials?
- MR. COOK: I mentioned that yesterday.
- 23 I think it was the third community round table
- 24 meeting. I indicated to the employees of Hydro
- 25 that we were concerned about those grave sites,

- 1 and they had put them on their map. They have
- 2 some technical system that they used to log it on
- 3 their map that they used. So we have that
- 4 presentation that was given to us from Hydro in
- 5 our community. It's just a matter of finding it,
- 6 and we could make it available to whoever wants to
- 7 actually see where we indicated to them where the
- 8 sites are. I can't tell you right now because I
- 9 don't have a map in front of me. But when we have
- 10 an organization or a group of people that are
- 11 trying to work with us, then we will make those
- 12 available to them.
- MR. KAPLAN: And have you been to
- 14 these sites in the recent past to see what has
- 15 been done, I assume by Hydro?
- MR. COOK: I was there two years ago,
- 17 two summers ago I was there, and I took some
- 18 pictures. These are the pictures that I have
- 19 taken. And it will show that -- you know, it
- 20 caught my interest and I was very concerned about
- 21 that. And that's why I'm making it an issue and a
- 22 concern and I'm going to work on it.
- Okay. This area here that we were
- 24 talking about, where that cross is, that's a
- 25 registered trapper from our community of Thicket

- 1 Portage. They just put that gravel on there now,
- 2 and they just sort of buried their evidence I
- 3 guess you want to call it. But it's not a good
- 4 thing.
- 5 MR. KAPLAN: I'm not sure I understand
- 6 that answer. Who put gravel on?
- 7 MR. COOK: Cross Lake community
- 8 members. They were hired by Hydro. Hydro had
- 9 given them some funds to put some crushed rock
- 10 there.
- 11 MR. KAPLAN: What was your
- 12 understanding of the purpose behind that?
- MR. COOK: Well, for me personally, I
- 14 think they just wanted to cover it up so the
- 15 people wouldn't see or do anything about it. But
- 16 we have a history that that's where they buried
- 17 their loved ones. So you know, when you have
- 18 history, and you can't doubt anybody when you say
- 19 it's that area, when they actually know that was
- 20 where they buried their father or their uncle.
- 21 MR. PARENTEAU: Like when he's talking
- 22 about those graves, they were buried and it was
- 23 high ground where they were buried. When you get
- 24 a good south wind, it seemed like it would be
- 25 washing down the ground, hey. And all of a sudden

- 1 we went there, we were cutting the road -- I was
- 2 with Johnny Crait. Johnny Crait can tell you, we
- 3 went across, we were clearing the road. That's
- 4 where all those bones, all that ground slid down.
- 5 And then they put the rocks right around that
- 6 island, because that island was drifting away.
- 7 Because I didn't believe my brother-in-law. My
- 8 dad was trapping there just above the Nelson
- 9 River, and he had a camp there. And he lost that
- 10 camp, it floated away. And he couldn't find it.
- 11 And then my -- but he's still alive, Joe, my
- 12 brother-in-law. My dad told me, I lost my camp he
- 13 said, it floated away. Yeah, I seen it going down
- 14 there, he said I could still see smoke coming out
- 15 of your chimney. So there was lots of camps like
- 16 that that drift away.
- 17 MR. COOK: Okay. This picture here is
- 18 just on the same shore as the one where the cross
- 19 was. So you go around the point. So if you walk
- 20 on the left-hand side of the cross there, you go
- 21 around that area, this is what you would see. So
- 22 you could see by the trees that they are not very
- 23 old, they are freshly green. So the flooding is
- 24 new. So it's within that same year that the water
- 25 has risen and it's damaging the environment, and

- that's a concern of ours. 1
- 2 MS. LAGIMODIERE: And now concluding,
- 3 Elder Robert Parenteau is concerned that Bipole
- III will affect the hunting, fishing and trapping 4
- negatively, and it will impact his trapline. And 5
- there's been no proper consultation with him or 6
- his family. And trapping, hunting and fishing is 7
- a way of life for his family. It is affecting 8
- current land users and, of course, will affect 9
- future generations. 10
- And on that note, I'd like to hand the 11
- 12 mic to Elder Parenteau and he can say his closing
- 13 remarks.
- 14 MR. PARENTEAU: Yeah. We all depend
- on fishing and trapping. Because at one time 15
- that's all there was at Thicket Portage was fish 16
- and trap. The only job you could find, you had to 17
- go to CN, and that would only be a summer job. 18
- 19 Wait for the summer job, then as soon as fall
- 20 come, you go trapping. But now since Hydro has
- 21 come in, it's pretty hard to trap. It's not like
- before. Before when I started to trap, there was 22
- 23 only leg-hold traps. And all of a sudden they
- 24 come out, we couldn't use them. Out comes out the
- 25 Connor bear traps. I hear some of the old

- 1 trappers, how am I going to set this trap? He
- 2 didn't even know how to set a Connor bear trap.
- 3 Well, I didn't too. That's just like starting to
- 4 trap all over again, because you couldn't use the
- 5 leg-hold. If they catch you with it, no matter if
- 6 you had a mink in it, they will take everything,
- 7 mink and all in your trap. So we had to stick
- 8 to -- but then we knew better after we got going
- 9 with the Connor bear traps, that was the best
- 10 traps we ever had. Because the poor mink or
- 11 martin or whatever, if it's worn, you'll cut its
- 12 foot off, he'll just chew it off and he's gone one
- 13 leg short. But you get him with a Connor bear
- 14 trap, it kills him dead, hey. But first they
- 15 promised us that they were going to trade us with
- 16 the leg-hold and give us Connor bear traps, but
- 17 they didn't do it.
- 18 That's about it.
- 19 THE CHAIRMAN: We have a couple of
- 20 questions for whoever wishes to answer them.
- 21 MR. GIBBONS: This is for
- 22 Mr. Parenteau and it's a very quick question. You
- 23 said they promised to trade the traps and they
- 24 didn't do it. When you say they, who are you
- 25 referring to?

- MS. LAGIMODIERE: Conservation? 1
- 2 MR. PARENTEAU: Yes, because we
- 3 weren't allowed to -- well, we were allowed to use
- 4 leg-hold but that's for muskrats under water, hey,
- or beavers. 5
- MR. GIBBONS: But in terms of who is 6
- going to do the trade --7
- MS. LAGIMODIERE: Game wardens. 8
- MR. GIBBONS: Was it the game wardens? 9
- 10 MS. LAGIMODIERE: Well, we will say
- Conservation. 11
- 12 MR. GIBBONS: Okay. Thank you for
- 13 that.
- 14 MR. KAPLAN: I have a question perhaps
- more directed to Mr. Cook for an answer, if 15
- possible. This Commission, I understand, can make 16
- recommendations to the Minister whether or not to 17
- grant the licence to Hydro or not. Based on what 18
- 19 you are saying and what I've heard over the last
- 20 few weeks, is it your recommendation that no
- 21 licence be granted to Hydro? Is that what you are
- asking for or hoping for? I'd just like to get a 22
- 23 sense of where you're coming from?
- 24 MR. COOK: No, we're not here to
- oppose the development of this Bipole project, 25

- 1 we're here to address our issues to the Commission
- 2 to hopefully pass them on to the rightful
- department heads, so that they may work with us to
- 4 deal with the stuff that we have in our community.
- 5 We're not opposing the development of this line.
- 6 We want to work with you guys.
- 7 The other thing too is, you will note
- 8 on my previous remarks that as a community we
- 9 would like to sort of work on a community
- 10 compensation for the residents of Thicket Portage,
- 11 which would include the trappers and the
- 12 fishermen, and those previous trappers and
- 13 fishermen that we have in our community.
- 14 The system, the way it's been going,
- is that the fathers, the grandparents, are passing
- on their equipment to their grandsons and nephews.
- 17 So that keeps the cycle of trapping and fishing
- 18 going in our community. And it's pretty hard now
- 19 to make a decent living from that when we have to
- 20 look at, watch out for the debris that's in the
- 21 river, waterways. Because once we damage, then
- 22 it's a big expense for us. And that would be one
- 23 of the things that we would be looking at, is
- 24 compensating the trappers and the fishermen with
- 25 equipment, because that's what they use for their

- livelihood and making a living for their families. 1
- That would be one of the items that we would 2
- 3 include in the compensation for the residents.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. 4
- 5 MR. PARENTEAU: When we are using
- those leg-hold, when we set them along the 6
- lakeshore, or sometimes you are back in the bush 7
- and set them in the bush, but then Hydro will say 8
- they are going to raise the water 2 inches, the 9
- water is going to go up 2 inches. But we knew 10
- that. We knew how much to expect the water would 11
- 12 go up 2 inches. We knew that. But all of a
- 13 sudden you listen to the radio, it's the opposite
- way. The water is going to go down, I can't say 14
- that word, not inches -- centimetres. Well, 15
- nobody knew what that was. Then they give us a 16
- two-way radio. You should have heard those guys 17
- in Split Lake -- would listen to them in the 18
- 19 evening, swearing at Hydro. They don't know what
- 20 that meant. Lots of us didn't know that water was
- 21 going to raise. So what we done is we put a nice
- log right in the water and we'd measure it 22
- 23 everyday. That's when we'd know the water is
- 24 going up or going down.
- 25 THE CHAIRMAN: Mr. Parenteau, you're

- 1 not the only one, many of us have trouble with
- 2 many of the things in the metric system. I still
- 3 think in miles.
- 4 MR. PARENTEAU: Yeah, I know,
- 5 everybody does.
- 6 THE CHAIRMAN: At least us older
- 7 folks.
- 8 MR. PARENTEAU: They should have
- 9 sticked to that. If they would have raised our
- 10 water 2 inches or 3 inches, we knew we could
- 11 expect that they were going to go up 3 inches.
- 12 But when you say the other one, I can't pronounce
- it, we don't know if it's going to be 4 inches or
- if it's going to be a foot, we don't know.
- 15 And like when you go in the fall
- 16 there, you go start setting your traps and it will
- 17 snow, well, you've got snow on top of the ice
- 18 pushing it down, then you raise the water, now
- 19 you're pushing the ice up and the snow is pushing
- 20 it down. That ice is bound to crack. Then you're
- 21 going to get slush. Because I've seen a lot of
- them in Thicket Portage, when they take off I go
- 23 behind them. You only go a few miles, you're
- 24 already, you're short of belts. Well, you're
- 25 stuck all the time in slush. You see the ice is

- 1 pushing down the -- the snow is pushing down the
- 2 ice, and you are raising the water up and pushing
- 3 it up. Well, that ice is going to crack and that
- 4 water has got to go some place, and you run right
- 5 into it with your skidoo. And a lot of times,
- 6 that's where you'll stay.
- 7 Because I've seen that, I don't know
- 8 if they are here, Louis and Marcel, I know they
- 9 trap harder than I do. I call them up, they are
- 10 only gone about 3 miles in. Lucky thing they had
- 11 four belts or they would have had to walk home,
- 12 ran out of belts, too much slush. You see the
- 13 snow is pushing that ice down and you are raising
- 14 the water, you are pushing it up. Well, that ice
- 15 has got to crack.
- MS. LAGIMODIERE: Thank you very
- 17 kindly for listening to Mr. Parenteau's
- 18 presentation, and with Jason and I assisting him.
- 19 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, thank you, all
- 20 three of you very much. Thank you, Mr. Parenteau,
- 21 for coming out here this morning. It was
- 22 interesting to hear your stories and it was
- 23 helpful to us in our deliberations as we consider
- 24 some of these issues. I'd like to thank Mr. Cook
- 25 and Mrs. Lagimodiere for their assistance, but

- 1 also for the presentations you made last evening,
- 2 and we will certainly consider what you have said
- 3 last evening and this morning in our
- 4 deliberations. So thank you to the three of you
- 5 and the other people from Thicket Portage.
- 6 MS. LAGIMODIERE: Mr. Chairman, just
- 7 for the record, because this is Mr. Parenteau's
- 8 presentation, I do want it noted, but I don't want
- 9 to expand on it. MMF's position is slightly
- 10 different than what Mr. Cook presented, but
- 11 because it's not our presentation, I'm here out of
- 12 respect to our Metis elder, I'm not going to, you
- 13 know, expand on my comments.
- 14 THE CHAIRMAN: I understand what
- 15 you're saying and thank you for that
- 16 clarification. So thank you all.
- 17 Is there anyone else in the audience
- 18 who wishes to make a presentation at this time?
- 19 Well, if not, we'll have an informal recess. And
- 20 if anybody arrives who wishes to make a
- 21 presentation, we'll reconvene. Thank you.
- 22 (Proceedings recessed at 10:17 a.m.
- and reconvened at 1:15 p.m.)
- 24 THE CHAIRMAN: The one presentation we
- 25 had scheduled for this afternoon is now here, so

- we should move on. 1
- 2 Ms. Campbell, you are ready to go?
- 3 Come to the front table, please? Thank you.
- We'll ask you to take an oath. The Commission 4
- secretary will administer it. 5
- MS. JOHNSON: Could you please state 6
- your name for the record? 7
- MS. CAMPBELL: Anita Campbell. 8
- 9 Anita Campbell: Sworn.
- 10 THE CHAIRMAN: You may proceed.
- MS. CAMPBELL: Thank you. They told 11
- 12 me this was a non threatening environment.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Well, we like to think 13
- 14 it is. We try our best to keep it at that.
- 15 MS. CAMPBELL: Good afternoon, my name
- is Anita Campbell. I am a Metis person who has 16
- lived up north for the majority of my adult life, 17
- actually about 31 years. Currently I live in 18
- 19 Thompson. I am the elected spokesperson for the
- 20 Metis women of Manitoba, which is a part of the
- 21 Manitoba Metis Federation's governance structure.
- I am also the MMF's minister responsible for 22
- 23 Manitoba Hydro. In that capacity, I am here today
- 24 to present to the Commission on behalf of the MMF.
- 25 So even though we are in Thompson, my

- 1 presentation is going to focus on key issues that
- 2 are relevant to my role as the MMF's Minister for
- 3 Manitoba Hydro. Other Metis presenters here today
- 4 are going to speak about their specific concerns,
- 5 or have spoken about their specific concerns about
- 6 the impacts of Bipole III on Metis in the north,
- 7 as a part of the larger Manitoba Metis community.
- 8 As a part of my presentation, I am
- 9 providing the Commission a copy of the recently
- 10 produced MMF Bipole III update report, which has
- 11 been sent via e-mail, based on the MMF's
- 12 province-wide consultations with our people. This
- 13 document provides a high level overview of what we
- 14 heard in our community consultations that were
- 15 held in Dauphin, Swan River, Brandon, Binscarth,
- 16 St. Ambroise, Thompson, Gillam, Cranberry Portage,
- 17 The Pas, Mafeking, Thicket Portage and Pikwitonei,
- 18 as well as other internal MMF engagement
- 19 activities since the Bipole III Environmental
- 20 Impact Statement.
- 21 The MMF has also provided more
- 22 detailed concerns to the Crown and Manitoba Hydro
- 23 through direct engagement, as well as through the
- 24 information request process. Unfortunately, none
- of these concerns have been addressed to date.

While Manitoba Hydro claims to be 1 meeting with the MMF to discuss our concerns, it 2 3 is not. We currently have no meaningful process 4 in place with Manitoba Hydro. Recently, all Manitoba Hydro has provided to the MMF is a high 5 level Powerpoint presentation on a, to be 6 developed, environmental protection plan that is 7 inadequate and incomplete. We also have not had a 8 meaningful process in place with Manitoba Hydro 9 throughout the development of the Bipole EIS, 10 despite written commitments that we would be 11 involved. Manitoba Hydro has consistently ignored 12 the MMF concerns about EIS deficiencies, routing 13 concerns, and the impacts Bipole III will have on 14 the Metis community. We want the Commission to 15 know this, because from the MMF's perspective, 16 Manitoba Hydro is creating a smoke and mirrors 17 narrative in this hearing process that Aboriginal 18 19 engagement and consultation on the Bipole III EIS 20 was significant and meaningful. It was not. 21 It is worthy to note that all the 22 Aboriginal community groups participating in the CEC are at least united on this. Nicely printed 23 Powerpoint presentations and thousands of pages of 24 EIS filings cannot mask a willfully lacking 25

- 1 engagement and consultation process with
- 2 Aboriginal people generally, and Metis
- 3 specifically.
- 4 The MMF is participating in this
- 5 hearing process to scratch underneath Manitoba
- 6 Hydro's claims, but also to make the Crown aware
- 7 that these claims are fiction.
- 8 In my presentation I am going to
- 9 outline how Manitoba Hydro has not met its
- 10 requirements in the Bipole III EIS scoping
- 11 document. We want the Commission to know that it
- 12 cannot trust or rely on Manitoba Hydro's
- assertions, and that the company's claims must be
- 14 scrutinized in this public review.
- 15 Before I detail the MMF's concerns, I
- 16 want to raise two preliminary points about our
- 17 concerns with this ongoing review. The MMF's
- 18 legal counsel has raised these concerns in his
- 19 opening comments, but I want to restate them so
- 20 that they are on record as evidence.
- 21 First, we want to restate our concerns
- 22 that the current EIS is deficient and does not
- 23 provide the Commission or the government with
- 24 sufficient information to make reasonable
- 25 decisions about this project in relation to the

- 1 impacts on Metis rights, interests, and way of
- 2 life.
- More specifically, essential and
- 4 required information about socio-economic impacts,
- 5 addressing areas of significance to Aboriginal
- 6 communities, Aboriginal resource youths, and the
- 7 implementation of adequate measures is missing
- 8 from the EIS. We would note that this is not just
- 9 the MMF's perspective. We want to draw the
- 10 Commission's attention to the letter from Ron
- 11 Missyabit of Manitoba Conservation dated August
- 12 17, 2012, which is attached to my presentation.
- 13 In this letter Mr. Missyabit makes a
- 14 series of requests in relation to socio-economic
- issues and Aboriginal resource information in
- 16 order for Manitoba Conservation to complete its
- 17 review of the EIS. Clearly, Manitoba Conservation
- 18 does not believe Manitoba Hydro's EIS is complete
- 19 either.
- We also want to highlight for the
- 21 Commission that the information being requested by
- 22 Manitoba Conservation is not specific to the
- 23 Crown's duty to consult and accommodate.
- 24 If you look at the second paragraph of
- 25 Mr. Missyabit's letter, he is requesting this

- 1 information based on the information Manitoba
- 2 Hydro committed to collecting in their Bipole III
- 3 transmission project environmental assessment
- 4 scoping document.
- 5 So we ask the question, how can the
- 6 EIS be deemed by Manitoba Conservation as
- 7 deficient in relation to important filing
- 8 requirements under the scoping document on
- 9 August 17, but then deemed sufficient for public
- 10 review on August 31st, without any acknowledgment
- of these outstanding information requests?
- 12 The current situation leaves the Metis
- 13 community in an untenable and prejudiced position
- 14 in this hearing. While we can appreciate that
- 15 environmental assessment process can be somewhat
- 16 iterative in nature, we do not believe that it is
- 17 so iterative that it abandons the rules of
- 18 fairness and common sense to the Aboriginal
- 19 peoples who are participating in good faith.
- It is now two months since this
- 21 information was formally requested from Manitoba
- 22 Hydro by Manitoba Conservation, yet we still have
- 23 no answers to these fundamental issues that go to
- 24 the completeness of the EIS we are currently
- 25 reviewing. We also have no idea when this

- 1 information will be provided.
- 2 Similarly, the MMF wants it noted that
- 3 we object to this public review process continuing
- 4 when there may be important changes to the route
- 5 in four areas that are of fundamental concern to
- 6 the Metis community. It is simply unfair and
- 7 impossible to meaningfully review and test a
- 8 project based on a proposed route that may
- 9 ultimately change. This is not consistent with
- 10 the principles of natural justice or fairness.
- Just because Manitoba Conservation
- 12 calls the changes minor, that does not make it so.
- 13 In particular, when hundreds of kilometres of the
- 14 route is in question and the discussions on this
- 15 re-routing is held behind closed doors. The
- 16 public, including Aboriginal groups whose
- 17 traditional territories will be impacted, have a
- 18 right to know what the final project route that is
- 19 being reviewed actually is.
- 20 Based on Manitoba Conservation's
- 21 August 31st letter, the route may change in some
- 22 of the most sensitive areas of our traditional
- 23 territories, but we are essentially having to
- 24 guess where the line may end up. This is not
- 25 fair, nor is it honourable.

- 1 Again, we ask the Commission to
- 2 adjourn this hearing on its own initiative until
- 3 we receive answers to these routing and
- 4 outstanding information requests. We object to a
- 5 review of Bipole III being pushed through to meet
- 6 Manitoba Hydro's artificial timelines, while the
- 7 public, including Aboriginal people, are left
- 8 wondering what is actually being reviewed in this
- 9 process. If this is not done, it is almost a
- 10 certainty that future delays will ensue because
- 11 parties will be left with no other option but to
- 12 seek remedies from the courts. This is not in the
- 13 interest of the Commission, the Crown, Manitoba
- 14 Hydro, the public or Aboriginal peoples.
- 15 While we acknowledge that the Minister
- 16 has discretion on the Environmental Act and
- 17 related legislation in relation to the reviews of
- 18 major infrastructure projects such as Bipole III,
- 19 this discretion must be exercised in a manner that
- 20 ensures meaningful public review of the actual
- 21 project based on a complete EIS. This is not what
- 22 is happening in this process.
- Moreover, in relation to the
- 24 constitutional duties owing to impacted Aboriginal
- 25 peoples, the Minister's discretion under the

- 1 Environmental Act and related legislation must be
- 2 exercised consistent with the honour of the Crown.
- 3 The current process which leaves the Aboriginal
- 4 people guessing about what was actually being
- 5 reviewed, with no meaningful Crown consultation
- 6 process in place, fails to meet these legally
- 7 enforceable duties owing to the Metis community.
- 8 With that said, I now want to talk
- 9 about the MMF's specific concerns on the Bipole
- 10 III project and Manitoba Hydro's EIS. You are
- 11 going to hear a lot from the Manitoba Metis over
- 12 the next few weeks on why we are urging the
- 13 Commission to not recommend this project move
- 14 forward based on its current form and EIS.
- We ask that the panel listen with open
- 16 minds to the real concerns of the Metis people who
- 17 will most directly be impacted by Bipole III. We
- 18 may not be consultants, environmental experts or
- 19 lawyers, but we have an understanding of the on
- 20 the ground and multi-generational impacts projects
- 21 like Bipole III have on our people, who rely on
- these lands for our cultural, economic and social
- 23 well-being.
- We respect and have faith in the
- 25 independence of the Clean Environmental Commission

- 1 process. We understand that you are mandated to
- 2 listen to what we, the public, have to say. We
- 3 want you to hear our collective voice, not just
- 4 the voices of Manitoba Hydro, the consultants,
- 5 experts and lawyers. That is why we are here.
- I want to start by outlining MMF's
- 7 overarching concerns with the EIS in relation to
- 8 consultation with Aboriginal communities. My
- 9 presentation will hopefully illustrate that
- 10 Manitoba Hydro's EIS is built like a house of
- 11 cards, where its initial flawed approaches
- 12 essentially corrupt the environmental assessment
- in relation to Aboriginal communities. Just to be
- 14 clear, I am talking about the consultation
- 15 required under the June 2012 EIS scoping document,
- 16 not the Crown's duties to consult and accommodate.
- 17 The MMF's legal counsel has and will
- 18 continue to make submissions on the Crown
- 19 consultation issue. I am focusing on the
- 20 requirements of the June 2012 Bipole III EIS
- 21 scoping document, wherein Manitoba Hydro was
- 22 directed to obtain, collect, assess, and consider
- 23 information from Aboriginal communities.
- 24 Specifically, I would point to sections 5.2, 6.0,
- 25 7.2 and 7.4.3 of the scoping document.

- 1 Unfortunately, Manitoba Hydro has not provided any
- 2 clear descriptions or detailed information within
- 3 the EIS on the Aboriginal communities it engaged,
- 4 even though it was required to do so pursuant to
- 5 the scoping document.
- 6 Moreover, the limited information that
- 7 has been provided by Manitoba Hydro was confusing
- 8 at best, misleading at worst, in particular in
- 9 relation to the impacted Metis community as
- 10 represented by the MMF.
- 11 We want to provide some background
- 12 information on these issues because most people's
- 13 knowledge on Aboriginal issues generally is mainly
- 14 about First Nations, Indian Treaties and the
- 15 Indian Act, which established Indian bands and
- 16 reserves. Information about the Metis people, our
- 17 rights and our governance structures is not as
- 18 well known and is often misunderstood.
- 19 These issues are not just relevant
- 20 because of the EIS, they are also relevant because
- 21 this Commission has already indicated that it will
- 22 consider the impacts of Bipole III on Aboriginal
- 23 rights. Specifically, the chair acknowledged this
- 24 at a pre-hearing conference. As such, the MMF
- 25 believes that a general understanding of those

9

10

16

Page 1366

- rights and who holds them will be of assistance 1 and is required. 2 3 A helpful starting point is to look at 4 what our constitution actually says about Aboriginal peoples, specifically section 35 of the 5 Constitution Act 1982 states: 6 "1. The existing Aboriginal and 7 Treaty rights of the Aboriginal 8 peoples of Canada are hereby
- 11 2. In this Act, Aboriginal peoples of Canada includes the Indian, Inuit 12 and Metis peoples of Canada." 13

recognized and affirmed.

14 It's important to highlight that the term Aboriginal is inclusive of Indian, First 15

Nation, Inuit and Metis peoples. Aboriginal is

- essentially a term of art that includes First 17
- Nations, Inuit communities and Metis communities 18
- 19 under it.
- 20 However section 35 does not support an
- 21 interpretation that it creates a new Aboriginal
- peoples or new Aboriginal communities. The term 22
- Aboriginal in section 35 simply recognizes that 23
- 24 already existing Indian, Inuit and Metis peoples,
- and Indian, Inuit, and Metis communities 25

- 1 respectively are Aboriginal.
- 2 For example, while a First Nation or
- 3 Metis community can be correctly described as an
- 4 Aboriginal community, the plain text of section 35
- 5 does not support that proposition that simply
- 6 combining First Nation and Metis individuals
- 7 together create a new Aboriginal people or
- 8 Aboriginal community. Moreover, judicial
- 9 decisions on section 35 do not support such an
- 10 interpretation either.
- 11 Unfortunately, this is exactly what
- 12 Manitoba Hydro attempts to do through the
- 13 definition of Aboriginal community it uses within
- 14 its EIS. Specifically, the EIS states that an
- 15 aboriginal community is, A, community where most
- of the residents are Aboriginal, i.e., Indian
- 17 Metis or Inuit, and it has a separate form of
- 18 government, provides some level of service to its
- 19 residents and has clear community boundaries.
- 20 This definition flies in the face of
- 21 the Constitution, the law and common sense. It
- 22 also does not reflect the perspective of Metis.
- 23 The use of this definition results in information
- 24 about Aboriginal communities being purportedly
- 25 collected, assessed and incorporated into the EIS,

- 1 but is not from actually impacted aboriginal
- 2 communities.
- 3 So you may be asking, why is this an
- 4 issue important to the Commission's role? It goes
- 5 back to my house of cards analogy. Instead of
- 6 engaging directly with or waiting for the
- 7 self-directed Aboriginal traditional knowledge
- 8 studies from actual First Nation and Metis
- 9 communities in order to integrate into the site
- 10 selection environmental assessment, the SSEA
- 11 process, and used in the EIS, ATK information from
- 12 various Manitoba Hydro created "Aboriginal
- 13 communities" that include a hodgepodge of
- 14 Aboriginal individuals who are paid to participate
- in various workshops is used.
- 16 This ATK information is not from
- 17 methodologically sound and representative
- 18 samplings of rights-bearing First Nations and
- 19 Metis communities that will be impacted by Bipole
- 20 III. It is from random interviews with
- 21 individuals who may be First Nation, Metis or non
- 22 Aboriginal, which is then passed off as legitimate
- 23 ATK from rights-bearing communities. Nothing
- 24 could be further from the truth.
- So while Manitoba Hydro makes it sound

- 1 all wonderful about how ATK was collected and
- 2 integrated into the SSEA and the EIS, it is a
- 3 fallacy and the house of cards quickly falls apart
- 4 when you scrutinize the information that is passed
- 5 off as ATK for impacted First Nations and Metis
- 6 communities.
- 7 Again, we would highlight that it's
- 8 not just the MMF who takes this position. I would
- 9 like to go back to Mr. Missyabit's August 17th
- 10 letter. You will note that he is asking Manitoba
- 11 Hydro for ATK information from First Nations and
- 12 Metis, not amorphous Aboriginal communities
- 13 created by Manitoba Hydro. We would submit that
- 14 this is why Manitoba Hydro is having such a
- 15 problem and delay in responding to these
- 16 outstanding information requests.
- 17 With respect to actually collecting
- 18 ATK information from the impacted Metis community,
- 19 the MMF began to engage with Manitoba Hydro in
- 20 2009. We had hoped the company was sincere in
- 21 changing the way it dealt with the Manitoba Metis,
- 22 or lack thereof.
- We assume that this new willingness
- 24 came from the Manitoba Provincial Court's decision
- in Goodon and direction from the government, not

- 1 any real desire to work with Metis, since Manitoba
- 2 Hydro's work with the Metis is one of neglect and
- 3 indifference.
- 4 In May 2009, Manitoba Hydro entered
- 5 into a work plan with the MMF to engage on Bipole
- 6 III and undertake a self-directed ATK study. The
- 7 MMF called its ATK study a traditional land use
- 8 and knowledge study, or TLUKS for short.
- 9 Unfortunately, contrary to the rosy
- 10 picture put forward by Manitoba Hydro's
- 11 presenters, the MMF wants the Commission to know
- 12 that the spirit and intent of the work plan was
- 13 not achieved, nor were many of its commitments in
- 14 the executed work plan. Specifically, the
- 15 following work plan objectives have not been
- 16 fulfilled despite repeated requests from the MMF
- 17 for engagement on these issues. One; establish
- 18 and maintain an ongoing working relationship
- 19 between MMF and Manitoba Hydro with respect to the
- 20 project.
- 21 Two; support the MMF by engaging Metis in relation
- 22 to the project in order to identify issues,
- 23 concerns and opportunities related to the project.
- 24 Three; provide a collaborative process for MMF and
- 25 Manitoba Hydro to work together to attempt to

- 1 identify, share and address issues and concerns
- 2 related to impacts and opportunities associated
- 3 with the project.
- 4 Four; create a process between the MMF and
- 5 Manitoba Hydro in order to develop an ongoing
- 6 respectful and mutually beneficial relationship on
- 7 the project.
- 8 Five; Identification of issues arising from the
- 9 SSEA process, the TK study and the MMF's community
- 10 engagement process and the discussions of
- 11 measures, if any, required to address these
- 12 issues.
- 13 Six; Discussion and identification of economic
- 14 opportunities for Metis arising from the project.
- 15 Instead of meaningfully engaging with
- 16 the MMF, Manitoba Hydro developed its EIS in
- 17 isolation. It did not respond to the MMF's
- 18 request to be meaningfully involved in aspects of
- 19 the EIS such as the identification of heritage and
- 20 archeological sites, nor did it even meet with the
- 21 MMF during the SSEA process. Essentially all
- 22 Manitoba Hydro did was simply append the MMF's
- 23 TLUKS into the EIS. It did not integrate our
- 24 TLUKS findings into the final preferred route
- 25 selection as it was required to do pursuant to the

- 1 scoping document. In fact, Manitoba Hydro did not
- 2 have any TLUKS information for the Metis community
- 3 until after the final preferred route was
- 4 selected.
- 5 Manitoba Hydro representatives openly
- 6 admitted this in their testimony already provided
- 7 to the Commission. So essentially no Metis
- 8 traditional knowledge or land use information was
- 9 incorporated into the SSEA. Again, we want to
- 10 emphasize that Manitoba Hydro has no verification
- 11 or credibility that the Metis individuals it
- 12 interviewed as a part of its ATK study were
- 13 actually Metis or part of a contemporary
- 14 rights-bearing Metis community. The MMF also
- 15 wants to stress the point of its TLUKS was not
- 16 designed to show specific impacts from routing, it
- 17 was designed to generally show land use patterns
- 18 in areas of importance to the Manitoba Metis that
- 19 could then be integrated into the SSEA process.
- 20 Unlike First Nations with concentrated
- 21 populations of a few hundred to thousands of
- 22 people who live on common reserve lands, the
- 23 Manitoba Metis constitutes on large and expansive
- 24 community of tens of thousands of people standing
- 25 throughout Bipole III's study area. The

- 1 geographic extent of this Metis community, along
- 2 with the MMF's mandate to represent this
- 3 rights-bearing Metis community, has been
- 4 recognized by the Manitoba courts in a case called
- 5 R versus Goodon, as well as more recently in the
- 6 signed MMF Manitoba Harvesting Agreement.
- 7 For the Commission's information, I am
- 8 attaching a copy of the Goodon decision as well as
- 9 our harvesting agreement. These have also been
- 10 emailed. We believe these documents will be
- 11 helpful in relation to understanding the rights
- 12 and governance structures of the impacted Metis
- 13 community. So we designed a TLUKS that fit our
- 14 unique community and would further require
- 15 discussions and collaborations work with Manitoba
- 16 Hydro in order to truly integrate our knowledge
- 17 and use into the SSEA process. Of course, this
- 18 was not done because Manitoba Hydro had selected
- 19 the route before it even considered or received
- 20 the MMF's TLUKS. We would note that this is
- 21 similar to what Manitoba Hydro did with most of
- 22 the self-directed studies from other
- 23 rights-bearing Aboriginal communities for that
- 24 matter.
- 25 Based on all of this, we believe

- 1 Manitoba Hydro's claims that it integrated ATK
- 2 into the SSEA process are false. Manitoba Hydro
- 3 does not get to make up its own definitions of
- 4 aboriginal communities to serve its process, and
- 5 then attempt to portray it met the requirements of
- 6 the scoping document in relation to integrating
- 7 ATK into the SSEA and the EIS.
- 8 We ask this Commission to reject
- 9 Manitoba Hydro's attempts to pass off its ATK
- 10 information from unknown Aboriginal communities as
- 11 a legitimate substitute for actual ATK information
- 12 from the impacted First Nations and Metis
- 13 communities. We say Manitoba Hydro's approach
- 14 does not meet the requirement of the EIS scoping
- 15 document.
- 16 It is the MMF's opinion that Manitoba
- 17 Hydro must be directed to go back and consider its
- 18 current routing based on the actual traditional
- 19 knowledge of impacted First Nations and Metis
- 20 communities in the study area.
- 21 As the MMF will continue to raise in
- 22 more detail throughout this hearing process, the
- 23 current preferred route threatens the meaningful
- 24 exercise of Metis harvesting rights in the name of
- 25 avoiding landowners or increasing costs for the

- 1 company. This is unacceptable and Manitoba Metis
- 2 won't accept their rights being sacrificed because
- 3 Manitoba Hydro did not do what the scoping
- 4 document directed it to do.
- 5 Similarly, the MMF wants to raise
- 6 other deficiency concerns about the EIS. For
- 7 example, Manitoba Hydro did not consider the
- 8 Manitoba Metis as a distinct Aboriginal community
- 9 for the purposes of its socioeconomic impact
- 10 analysis. It did not include our input in
- 11 relation to its archeological and heritage site
- 12 analysis. It did not consider our rights based
- 13 claims in areas that Bipole III will impact such
- 14 as our lands claims within the "old postage stamp
- 15 Province of Manitoba" that is currently before the
- 16 Supreme Court of Canada.
- 17 Collectively, the results of this is
- 18 an EIS that is deficient as it relates to
- 19 obtaining and assessing information from the
- 20 Manitoba Metis, specifically, as well as other
- 21 Aboriginal communities.
- 22 For these reasons alone, the MMF
- 23 believes the project should not be recommended in
- 24 its current form. Even more troubling than the
- 25 glaring deficiencies on Aboriginal consultation in

- 1 relation to the scoping document is the fact that
- 2 Manitoba Hydro's multitude of mitigation measures,
- 3 promises and commitments throughout the EIS are
- 4 inconsistent, incomplete and lack the required
- 5 baseline and scientific evidence to effectively
- 6 monitor mitigation.
- 7 As the Commission has already
- 8 recognized in its recent letter to Manitoba Hydro
- 9 dated September 28, 2012, there are
- 10 inconsistencies between these mitigation measures,
- 11 promises and commitments throughout the EIS and in
- 12 the technical reports. We are concerned that
- 13 Manitoba Hydro will rely on this confusion in the
- 14 EIS in the future in order to not follow through
- 15 on these commitments.
- 16 It is also troubling to the MMF that
- 17 Manitoba Hydro is asking this Commission to
- 18 recommend one of the largest infrastructure
- 19 projects in Manitoba's history based on a lot of
- 20 promises but no concrete plans on how all these
- 21 promises will be achieved.
- 22 Essentially, Manitoba Hydro is asking
- 23 this Commission, the Metis community and all
- 24 Manitobans to trust them that they will follow
- 25 through on all of their EIS commitments. While we

- 1 cannot speak for others, we do not trust Manitoba
- 2 Hydro to follow through on its promises. The
- 3 broken promises in our existing Bipole III work
- 4 plan with Manitoba Hydro demonstrates to the MMF
- 5 that Manitoba Hydro's commitments are not worth
- 6 much, even when they are in writing. The MMF
- 7 wants to make this point very clear to the
- 8 Commission: If we don't have a legally
- 9 enforceable, meaningful and cost effective way to
- 10 hold Manitoba Hydro to account for the multitude
- 11 of EIS promises it makes in order to get its
- 12 approvals, those promises will essentially be
- 13 meaningless. Simply put, in future battles to get
- 14 Manitoba Hydro to uphold those promises, the
- 15 company will always win against Aboriginal
- 16 communities with limited capacity, internal
- 17 environmental expertise and funding. This reality
- 18 should not be able to be used as an advantage for
- 19 a Crown agent such as Manitoba Hydro.
- While it is the MMF's position that
- 21 the current Bipole III project should not be
- 22 recommended in its current form, throughout this
- 23 hearing we will also be making suggestions for the
- 24 Commission to consider if it does recommend the
- 25 project. For example, we believe that prior to

- 1 granting a licence, Manitoba Hydro must provide
- 2 concrete plans on how it will put its various
- 3 mitigation measures, promises and commitments in
- 4 place. In order to achieve these commitments,
- 5 Manitoba Hydro must be directed to enter legally
- 6 binding contractual arrangements with impacted
- 7 Aboriginal communities in relation to mitigation
- 8 measures. These agreements must be in place prior
- 9 to Crown authorization or construction. This is
- 10 the only way the MMF will be provided certainty
- 11 that it can hold Manitoba Hydro to account.
- 12 We also want to stress that including
- 13 various commitments in a provincial licence is not
- 14 sufficient because the MMF will then have to rely
- on the Manitoba Government to enforce these
- 16 commitments. Increasingly, Manitoba Conservation
- 17 does not appear to have the desire or internal
- 18 capacity to monitor and enforce these licensing
- 19 conditions, so proponents such as Manitoba Hydro
- 20 end up self-policing themselves and ignoring
- 21 interventions and efforts from impacted Aboriginal
- 22 communities such as the MMF.
- 23 As the MMF will outline in greater
- 24 detail, in MMF president David Chartrand's
- 25 presentations that will be held in November, these

- 1 commitments to Aboriginal communities on
- 2 provincial licences have proven to be worthless.
- 3 Specifically, the MMF's recent experience with
- 4 respect to the Victory Nickel Mine is just one
- 5 example.
- 6 We also believe that if a licence is
- 7 ultimately to be granted to Manitoba Hydro, it
- 8 must be a conditional or staggered licence. This
- 9 means that while Manitoba Hydro will be allowed to
- 10 proceed with some of the initial stages of Bipole
- 11 III, it will be required to have certain approved
- 12 plans, re-routing, negotiated agreements or other
- 13 conditions in place before it can begin to move to
- 14 subsequent stages of Bipole III's construction.
- The MMF notes that Manitoba Hydro has
- 16 acknowledged that it will not begin construction
- on all parts of Bipole III at the same time. So
- 18 this type of licensing approach will be consistent
- 19 with the Manitoba Hydro's overall plan. More
- 20 importantly, instead of giving Manitoba Hydro
- 21 carte blanche with respect to Bipole III and
- 22 hoping Manitoba Conservation has adequate capacity
- 23 to monitor and protect Aboriginal interests, a
- 24 meaningful check and balances can be put in place
- 25 through a conditional or staggered licence. So,

- 1 for example, if Manitoba Hydro does not put into
- 2 place an access management plan or adverse effects
- 3 agreement with the MMF prior to beginning
- 4 construction on the west side corridor, Manitoba
- 5 Hydro could not proceed with that phase of the
- 6 project. Similarly, if Manitoba Hydro had not
- 7 completed agreements with Metis and First Nations
- 8 in the north prior to construction, the project
- 9 would not be authorized to proceed.
- In the MMF's opinion these types of
- 11 conditions are the only way to ensure that
- 12 Manitoba Hydro fulfills its commitments as set out
- in the EIS. From the MMF's perspective, when it
- 14 comes to Manitoba Hydro the saying, fool me once,
- shame on me, fool me twice, shame on you, is apt.
- 16 Unfortunately, from the MMF's experience, the
- 17 fooling of our community on the part of Manitoba
- 18 Hydro has continued for generations.
- 19 We ask the panel to assist us by
- 20 recommending that we have the necessary tools in
- 21 order to make sure Bipole III doesn't become one
- 22 more chapter in Manitoba Hydro's long history of
- 23 broken promises to Aboriginal people generally and
- 24 the Metis people specifically.
- I want to thank the Commission for the

- 1 opportunity to speak to you today. You play a
- 2 fundamental role in this process, and we are here
- 3 to make full use of the opportunity. We hope you
- 4 truly hear our concerns and stop Bipole III from
- 5 being one more chapter in the long history of
- 6 Manitoba Hydro's neglect and indifference to the
- 7 Metis people in this province. Thank you.
- 8 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you,
- 9 Ms. Campbell.
- 10 Questions? Just give me a moment. Go
- 11 ahead, Mr. Gibbons.
- 12 MR. GIBBONS: Yes, Ms. Campbell, it's
- 13 a question just of clarification, because I think
- 14 we have heard this once before when we were in
- 15 Winnipeg, and it was a reference to individuals
- 16 who were paid to participate in various workshops.
- 17 Could you elaborate just briefly as to what the
- 18 concern was? Was this more than just a token
- 19 payment, for example, and why it might be of
- 20 concern to the public, to the Metis community, of
- 21 course, but also to the public more generally?
- MS. CAMPBELL: My understanding from
- 23 the process that had occurred was that individuals
- 24 were separately identified to attend a workshop
- 25 and were paid to attend this workshop, to come and

- 1 say that they were consulted on impacts that the
- 2 Bipole III project would have on them. And so it
- 3 wasn't to the general community or the general
- 4 area that people were invited to, but rather that
- 5 there were certain individuals that were either
- 6 identified as Aboriginal, to come and attend this
- 7 workshop.
- 8 MR. GIBBONS: Just as a quick
- 9 follow-up, is it your understanding that this
- 10 payment was more than just a token of gratitude
- 11 for talking part? Was it something more than
- 12 that?
- MS. CAMPBELL: I think the problem
- 14 that we had with it was that it was individuals
- 15 that were paid to attend the workshop and not so
- 16 much over and above what they normally should have
- 17 been paid in terms of their travel. We were
- 18 trying to get the information in terms of the
- 19 amounts and how this was broken down and we still
- 20 haven't been able to get that yet. So we're still
- 21 waiting for the detailed information on that. But
- 22 the individuals did give us an amount, they just
- 23 didn't know how they got it, like what it broke
- 24 down to.
- MR. GIBBONS: Thank you.

- 1 THE CHAIRMAN: Could you just -- the
- 2 Victory Nickel Mine, what was the situation there,
- 3 can you describe it?
- 4 MS. CAMPBELL: The Victory Nickel
- 5 Mine, from my understanding was -- an agreement
- 6 was reached and we thought everything was lined up
- 7 to go, and it didn't transpire. And so I think,
- 8 from my understanding in speaking with our legal
- 9 counsel, the reference was made in the
- 10 presentation only as a show of, sometimes you tend
- 11 to sign agreements and you think that the
- 12 agreements, because they are a written document,
- 13 that that's what's going to happen. Not
- 14 necessarily is that the case with some instances.
- 15 For example, with Victory Nickel, we
- 16 had signed an agreement with them to hire -- we
- 17 would train so many Metis individuals and they
- 18 would hire them. I guess the kicker to that was
- 19 they would only hire them for short periods of
- 20 time and then let them go. So it wasn't -- it was
- 21 more the capacity for them to get the licensing to
- 22 say that they partnered with a Metis group, a
- 23 Metis community, and therefore getting the
- 24 licence.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Well, I

- 1 don't think we have any other questions this
- 2 afternoon. I know for myself that when we hear
- 3 from President Chartrand and the other
- 4 presentations made by the -- brought forward by
- 5 your counsel in Winnipeg, I know I will have more
- 6 questions and others may as well. But I think for
- 7 me I'd like to hear the rest of the presentations
- 8 that we're going to hear in other communities as
- 9 well as from President Chartrand before I turn to
- 10 those questions.
- 11 So thank you very much for making a
- 12 very informative presentation this afternoon, and
- 13 you can rest assured that your presentation and
- 14 others we hear from, other representatives of your
- 15 community, will be part of our deliberations when
- 16 we get to that phase of this review. So thank you
- 17 again for coming out this afternoon.
- MS. CAMPBELL: Thank you.
- MS. JOHNSON: Mr. Chairman, I would
- 20 like to put some of the documents on record. The
- 21 presentation from Mr. Parenteau this morning will
- 22 be THOM number 2; Ms. Campbell's presentation
- 23 number 3; the package of letters from Manitoba
- 24 Conservation from August 2012 will be number 4;
- 25 the court decision R versus Goodon is number 5;

Page 1385 and the MMF Harvesting Agreement will be number 6. 1 2 (EXHIBIT THOM 2: Presentation of Mr. 3 Parenteau) 4 (EXHIBIT THOM 3: Presentation of Ms. 5 Campbell) (EXHIBIT THOM 4: Package of letters 6 from Manitoba Conservation from August 7 2012) 8 (EXHIBIT THOM 5: Court decision R 9 10 versus Goodon) 11 (EXHIBIT THOM 6: MMF harvesting 12 agreement) THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Is there 13 anybody else in the audience who hasn't made a 14 presentation who would like to make a presentation 15 at this time? 16 17 I'll try one more time. Anybody else wishing to make a presentation today? 18 19 Well, as we did this morning, we'll 20 take an informal break, and if anybody who hasn't 21 spoken wishes to make a presentation, please let either me or the Commission secretary know. And 22 if anybody else comes in who wishes to make a 23 24 presentation, we will very quickly reconvene. So we're not leaving the room but we stand down for 25

- 1 however long.
- 2 (Proceedings recessed at 1:50 p.m. and
- 3 reconvened at 3:00 p.m.)
- 4 THE CHAIRMAN: I call the proceedings
- 5 back to order, although probably only for a moment
- 6 or two. I'll give one last chance, if there's
- 7 anybody in the audience who hasn't said his or her
- 8 piece and would like to make a presentation, as
- 9 far as Thompson goes, this is the last
- 10 opportunity. So going, going, gone.
- 11 So we will adjourn. We will reconvene
- 12 tomorrow evening in The Pas at 7:00 p.m. at the
- 13 Kikiwak Inn. Anything else we need to deal with,
- 14 madam secretary? If anyone wishes to make a
- 15 submission in writing, they become as much a part
- 16 of the record as any oral presentation, and we
- 17 would like them submitted by November 1st, so
- 18 another couple of weeks.
- 19 Again, let me thank all of the people
- 20 who did come out here today, particularly I note a
- 21 number of people from Thicket Portage as well as
- 22 from the Manitoba Metis Federation. Thank you for
- 23 coming out and sharing your thoughts and concerns
- 24 and a little bit of your lifestyle with us. And
- 25 we will -- we may not give you all that you want

Page 1387 but, believe me, all that you've said to us in the last couple of days will certainly be taken into serious consideration. So again, thank you and we are now adjourned. (Adjourned at 3:10 p.m.)

		Page 1388
1	OFFICIAL EXAMINER'S CERTIFICATE	
2		
3		
4		
5	I, CECELIA J. REID, a duly appointed Official	
6	Examiner in the Province of Manitoba, do hereby	
7	certify the foregoing pages are a true and correct	
8	transcript of my Stenotype notes, to the best of	
9	my skill and ability, as taken by me at the time	
10	and place hereinbefore stated.	
11		
12		
13		
14		
15	Cecelia J. Reid	
16	Official Examiner, Q.B.	
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

This document was created with Win2PDF available at http://www.win2pdf.com. The unregistered version of Win2PDF is for evaluation or non-commercial use only. This page will not be added after purchasing Win2PDF.