MANITOBA CLEAN ENVIRONMENT COMMISSION	Page 1
LAKE WINNIPEG REGULATION REVIEW	
UNDER THE WATER POWER ACT	
* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *	
* * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * * *	

APPEARANCES

CLEAN ENVIRONMENT COMMISSION Terry Sargeant - Chairman

Edwin Yee - Commissioner

Neil Harden - Commissioner

Cathy Johnson - Commission Secretary

Joyce Mueller - Administrative Assistant

Bob Armstrong - Report Writer

Page 3 INDEX OF PROCEEDINGS

Opening by the Chair

4

Community members:

Carl Cochrane

Darrell Thaddeus

Dion McKay

Walter Sinclair Jr.

Doroty Crate

Walter Sinclair Sr.

Steve McKay

Leslie McKay

- 1 MONDAY, JANUARY 26, 2015
- 2 UPON COMMENCING AT 11:00 A.M.
- 3 MR. THADDEUS: I want to welcome you
- 4 here this morning to the Clean Environment
- 5 Commission, the Lake Winnipeg hearings for the
- 6 final licence of Manitoba Hydro. I want to
- 7 welcome everyone here today. I want to welcome
- 8 the panel here who will be taking a recording of
- 9 what you have to say, the history of our
- 10 community, and the effects of the lake. But
- 11 before we get started, I'm going to ask Elder
- 12 Dorothy Crate here to say opening prayer.
- 13 (Opening prayer)
- MR. THADDEUS: So, we are gathered
- 15 here today to gather information on Lake Winnipeg,
- 16 you know, the effects of the lake, how it has
- 17 changed in past years until today. And we
- 18 encourage you to come up and just give your story,
- 19 the history, and it will be recorded here.
- 20 First I'm going to ask them to
- 21 introduce themselves here.
- MR. YEE: Edwin Yee with the Manitoba
- 23 Clean Environment Commission.
- 24 THE CHAIRMAN: Terry Sargeant, I'm the
- 25 Chair of the Manitoba Clean Environment

- 1 Commission.
- 2 MR. HARDEN: I'm Neil Harden, I am
- 3 with the Clean Environment Commission as well.
- 4 THE REPORTER: Cecelia Reid, recorder.
- 5 MR. ARMSTRONG: I'm Bob Armstrong, I'm
- 6 the report writer.
- 7 MR. THADDEUS: Okay. So, I will hand
- 8 it over to the Chair on how this is going to work
- 9 here. Again, I encourage you to share your
- 10 information.
- 11 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Councillor.
- 12 Good morning and welcome. We have already
- introduced ourselves so I can skip over that part.
- 14 As I noted, I'm the Chair of the Clean Environment
- 15 Commission. I'm also the Chair of this particular
- 16 panel which is conducting the review of Lake
- 17 Winnipeg Regulation.
- 18 At the outset, I would like to
- 19 acknowledge that we are meeting today in the
- 20 traditional territory of the Fisher River Cree
- 21 Nation, a Treaty 5 nation.
- I would like to thank the leadership
- 23 of your community for accepting our invitation to
- 24 host the Commission, so that we may hear from as
- 25 many of you as wish to share your thoughts with

- 1 us.
- We had some introductions, there are
- 3 some other staff people with us who I will note;
- 4 our Commission secretary, Cathy Johnson; our
- 5 administrator, Joyce Mueller, and our community
- 6 liaison person, Melissa Hotain.
- We are here today, and the Councillor
- 8 in his introductory comments told you a little bit
- 9 about why we are here. A bit more specifically,
- 10 we are here today because in 2011 the Minister of
- 11 Conservation and Water Stewardship asked the Clean
- 12 Environment Commission to provide a forum to hear
- 13 evidence from the public about the impacts of
- 14 Manitoba Hydro's regulation of Lake Winnipeg. We
- 15 were asked to hold meetings in communities that
- 16 surround both the north and south basins of the
- 17 lake, as well as to have meetings in the City of
- 18 Winnipeg, which will occur later this winter.
- We've not been asked to provide an
- 20 opinion on whether or not a licence should be
- 21 issued, or whether or not Lake Winnipeg Regulation
- 22 should have been implemented in the first place.
- 23 We realize Lake Winnipeg Regulation is a key
- 24 overall part, or a key part of the overall
- 25 Manitoba Hydro regime, but we have not been asked

- 1 to look at other parts of that system of Hydro
- 2 throughout the province. We have been asked
- 3 specifically to look into why Lake Winnipeg
- 4 Regulation came into being with the issuance of
- 5 the first licence in 1970. We have been asked to
- 6 look at whether Lake Winnipeg Regulation has
- 7 succeeded or failed in meeting those goals. And
- 8 we have also been asked to look at the effects and
- 9 impacts of Lake Winnipeg Regulation.
- We hope that these meetings in the
- 11 communities will be as informal as possible so
- 12 that you will not feel intimidated to come forward
- 13 and share your stories with us.
- 14 As you will note, the hearings are
- 15 recorded. This is required of us by the
- 16 Environment Act. Within a couple of days, a
- 17 verbatim transcript of today's hearings will be
- 18 posted on our website.
- 19 Anyone who is present may come forward
- 20 and tell us a story, or give us your opinion. If
- 21 you feel more comfortable coming forward with one
- or two or three of you, that's not a problem.
- 23 What we want you to do is just tell us who you
- 24 are, how Lake Winnipeg Regulation may have
- 25 impacted you, or benefited you, how it has

- 1 impacted your community, and any thoughts you
- 2 might have on how Lake Winnipeg Regulation should
- 3 go forward.
- 4 We typically, in these sessions, limit
- 5 oral presentations to about 15 minutes, but we
- 6 have found that in the community meetings we
- 7 really don't limit them. Most people speak for
- 8 less than that, some people want to speak longer,
- 9 some people will come back two or three times and
- 10 just add more to their stories, and we have no
- 11 problem with that.
- 12 Also, if anybody feels comfortable or
- 13 more comfortable making a presentation in your own
- 14 language in Cree, you are quite welcome to do
- 15 that. We only ask that either you or somebody
- 16 else translate so that we understand what was said
- 17 to us.
- 18 And finally, if any of you wish to
- 19 make a written presentation, that's quite all
- 20 right and that's part of our process, and that can
- 21 be as simple as a letter or an email, or even a
- 22 bit of a paper that you write and send in to us.
- 23 You can send it to us by mail, by email, or post
- 24 it on our website.
- 25 Having said that, that's all I have to

- 1 say by way of introductory comments. I now invite
- 2 anybody who wishes to come forward and just share
- 3 your stories with us. We just have the one mic.
- 4 I will give it to you and you can either speak to
- 5 us or you can turn and speak to the community,
- 6 whichever way you feel more comfortable.
- 7 Who wants to be first? Who wants to
- 8 break the ice for us today?
- 9 MR. COCHRANE: There was a question
- 10 asked here by some of the elders --
- 11 THE CHAIRMAN: We need you on the mic
- 12 because it is recorded.
- MR. COCHRANE: Anyways, there was a
- 14 question asked here by one of the elders. Do you
- 15 have a copy of the original agreement with
- 16 Manitoba Hydro and licensing regarding Lake
- 17 Winnipeg?
- 18 THE CHAIRMAN: I don't have it with me
- 19 today. I don't know, I don't think any of us have
- 20 it with us today. It is available online at the
- 21 Manitoba Hydro website. It is probably available
- 22 online at our website. It is -- the original
- 23 licence -- well, there was an initial licence in
- 24 1970, and then a supplementary licence in 1972,
- and then sort of after it went into operation in

January 26, 2015

- 1 1976, the licence that's up for review right now
- 2 was put in place.
- Now, the licence basically sets out
- 4 the terms and conditions of Lake Winnipeg
- 5 regulation. It is about 15 pages, each of them is
- 6 about 15 pages, most of it quite frankly, and I'm
- 7 a lawyer, but it's legal gobbledygook. But there
- 8 are specific terms in there, and the specific
- 9 conditions include that they have to keep the lake
- 10 always 711 feet above sea level. And actually
- 11 since 1976, it has never gone below that anyway.
- 12 So that hasn't been an issue.
- 13 It also requires that if the lake gets
- 14 above 715 feet above sea level, then they have to
- open the gates at Jenpeg fully and keep them
- 16 flowing until the lake goes down below 715. That
- 17 has happened a number of times. Sometimes there
- 18 have been stretches I know of, one and a half to
- 19 two years where the gates are open full time
- 20 because the lake has been so high, particularly in
- 21 the last three or four years. It might be because
- 22 of global warming, but there has been a lot more
- 23 water coming into the lake from the inlet rivers
- 24 in the last few years, so the lake has often been
- 25 higher than 715, so they have to keep it open all

January 26, 2015

- 1 of the time.
- 2 The licence also provides for a number
- 3 of pieces to the regulation, one of them is a
- 4 channel called 2-mile channel, which is just a
- 5 little bit to the west of Warren Landing. You
- 6 know that spit that comes out near Warren Landing,
- 7 it is just a 2-mile channel that goes through
- 8 there, and that provides one more outlet from the
- 9 lake. There is the natural outlet at Warren
- 10 Landing, and then 2-mile channel provides another
- 11 outlet from Lake Winnipeg into Playgreen Lake.
- 12 Then from Playgreen Lake into -- we don't have a
- 13 map with us. Sometimes Hydro has been with us,
- 14 but not today, and they have these maps -- from
- 15 Playgreen Lake into Kiskittogisu Lake, which is an
- 16 eight-mile channel. So the water moves over to
- 17 Kiskittogisu Lake. And further up Playgreen Lake
- 18 there is what is called the Ominawin bypass, and
- 19 that just also helps move the water more quickly
- 20 into Kiskittogisu Lake. And then at the top end
- 21 of Kiskittogisu Lake is Jenpeg, and there is a
- 22 control structure there as well as a small
- 23 hydroelectric generating station. And that's
- 24 where the actual controls are.
- 25 Beyond that, what are some -- am I

- 1 missing other key terms in the licence? I think
- 2 that pretty well covers it.
- 3 So the lake is regulated between those
- 4 two levels, 711 and 715 feet above sea level, and
- 5 then those conditions, if it gets higher, they
- 6 have to open the controls. It has changed the
- 7 flows a little bit. The basic idea was to have
- 8 more water in winter, or have water available in
- 9 winter to drive the generating stations that are
- 10 further downriver, particularly at Kettle and Long
- 11 Spruce and Limestone.
- MR. SINCLAIR: Do you know what --
- 13 THE CHAIRMAN: Talk into the mic.
- 14 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: Walter Sinclair,
- 15 Junior, I'm a commercial fisherman.
- Do you know what effect it has on the
- 17 water, say it blows north, north wind, and then we
- 18 have a south current, it is all backwards now this
- 19 thing. See, you have a south wind and you have a
- 20 north current, so we don't know what is going on.
- 21 I don't know if the elders noticed a difference on
- 22 that from back when. Do you guys know?
- 23 WALTER SINCLAIR SR: Around 1965, we
- 24 noticed a change to the current, you know, it
- 25 would be against the wind, and it was always with

- 1 the wind. I don't know why it does. And then
- 2 there is a change of the current from Macbeth from
- 3 south to north. I don't know where the water
- 4 changed. If there is a south wind, the water
- 5 comes up. And then when there is a north wind,
- 6 the water comes up on the south side of Macbeth.
- 7 So there must be a change in there.
- 8 And then another thing too, the
- 9 current, we noticed a few years back, you know, we
- 10 had a little accident there, we lost a few men in
- 11 Lake Winnipeg and they drowned on Swampy Harbour,
- 12 near Swampy Harbour, that area. And then their
- 13 bodies came west, the current came west. That's
- 14 the first time I ever knew of that. I always had
- 15 trouble with my nets outside of Macbeth there.
- 16 You know, it was a west current and there was an
- 17 east current.
- 18 THE CHAIRMAN: Do you have your map
- 19 with you? What you are saying -- what you are
- 20 saying is that the water is moving from -- you are
- 21 saying when the wind is coming from the north, the
- 22 water in some places is moving from the south?
- 23 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: Yep.
- 24 THE CHAIRMAN: That I can't help you
- with, I don't know why, but we want to hear that,

- 1 and if we can figure out what --
- 2 MRS. CRATE: Does it have anything to
- 3 do with that 2-mile channel? I am asking, does it
- 4 have anything to do with the two-mile channel?
- 5 Because I remember my dad telling me years ago
- 6 that since they erected the 2-mile channel, that
- 7 things started being different on that lake.
- 8 Because the lake was supposed to be turning over
- 9 and it hasn't been turning over.
- 10 THE CHAIRMAN: Can you tell us your
- 11 name?
- 12 MRS. CRATE: Mrs. Crate.
- 13 THE CHAIRMAN: Lydia Crate? That I
- 14 can't help you with right now either, but we are
- 15 not here to answer all the questions, we are here
- 16 to hear what concerns you have and --
- 17 MRS. CRATE: Is that not a concern?
- 18 The question, is that not a concern?
- 19 THE CHAIRMAN: If what you are saying
- 20 is correct, yes, it certainly would be a concern.
- 21 We want to hear from you what concerns you have,
- 22 and then we will take them away, we will try to
- 23 find some answers. And then in our report to the
- 24 Minister, we will make note of that. But if you
- 25 can tell us more about that? Now, you said it was

- 1 your father that said when they built -- and when
- 2 was that?
- 3 MRS. CRATE: When my father told me
- 4 that?
- 5 THE CHAIRMAN: Can you take the mic,
- 6 please?
- 7 MRS. CRATE: Well, I remember him
- 8 telling me around -- when he first gave me his
- 9 licence, that was the late '70s or early '80s, I'm
- 10 not exactly sure.
- 11 THE CHAIRMAN: That would fit because
- 12 2-mile channel was built in the early '70s. Now,
- 13 what you said, you were talking about in the mid
- 14 '60s, that was before Lake Winnipeg Regulation was
- 15 even started. So it is hard to say what might
- 16 have caused that.
- 17 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: You guys have to
- 18 be out there to see this, how this fishing is
- 19 working now, from back then. It is pretty weird
- 20 when you have a north wind and south current, you
- 21 are fighting with your floats all of the time, it
- 22 comes over your net. And it is very frustrating
- 23 the way it is happening right now.
- 24 THE CHAIRMAN: Is that off Macbeth
- 25 Point?

- 1 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: It is all over
- 2 the lake.
- THE CHAIRMAN: All over the lake?
- 4 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: Yeah.
- 5 THE CHAIRMAN: And is it doing that
- 6 all of the time or just some of the time?
- 7 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: Every time it
- 8 blows it is like that. Not only that, there is
- 9 dirt that we are coming up with, and I have
- 10 pictures to prove it, the dirt that we had last
- 11 fall.
- 12 THE CHAIRMAN: You are pulling up dirt
- in your nets?
- 14 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: Yes, very thick,
- 15 heavy dirt. I have photos of it on my phone if
- 16 you guys want to see it.
- 17 THE CHAIRMAN: That's the first time
- 18 we have heard that.
- 19 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: It is bad, it's
- 20 really bad, last fall was really bad. We see a
- 21 little bit right now this winter. It is actually
- 22 doing the same thing in the winter time, it is
- 23 opposite current from the wind. So we don't know
- 24 what effect it is having by you guys controlling
- 25 the water levels at 2-mile channel.

- 1 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, we are not the
- ones doing that, it is Manitoba Hydro, but that's
- 3 the first time I have ever heard this, so we will
- 4 look into it, but I hadn't heard that before.
- 5 Hopefully, we will hear that from other people as
- 6 well.
- 7 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: I'm pretty sure
- 8 you will, I am pretty sure a lot of guys know
- 9 that, in the south basin they know that too.
- 10 THE CHAIRMAN: And it is happening in
- 11 the south basin as well?
- 12 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: All over the
- 13 lake.
- 14 THE CHAIRMAN: When you get those big
- 15 fall blows from the northeast, you are saying even
- 16 when you get a strong northeast blow, the current
- 17 is still --
- 18 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: It is the
- 19 opposite way.
- 20 THE CHAIRMAN: The current is going
- 21 the opposite way.
- 22 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: It is the
- 23 opposite way, yes.
- 24 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, that's a mystery.
- 25 We will -- we have a hydrological engineer that's

- 1 working with us, as well as one of our panel,
- 2 although I'm not sure he is fully aware of Lake
- 3 Winnipeg, but we do have somebody working with us
- 4 and we will ask him about it.
- 5 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: That's the stuff
- 6 I was telling you about in our nets, that's how
- 7 bad it was last fall.
- 8 THE CHAIRMAN: Is that mud or is that
- 9 algae?
- 10 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: We don't know
- 11 what it is.
- 12 THE CHAIRMAN: It looks green to me.
- 13 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: It is pretty bad
- 14 anyway.
- 15 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes, it looks ugly. It
- 16 will mess up your nets pretty badly. I mean, we
- 17 were in Grand Rapids last week and they showed
- 18 us -- we saw this, we saw similar pictures in
- 19 Grand Rapids last week from some of the fishermen
- 20 there, so it is happening in other places.
- 21 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: So when Manitoba
- 22 Hydro is regulating the water level, and they are
- 23 compensating so many different areas up north, why
- 24 doesn't it be the whole lake? It affects the
- 25 whole lake, not just the ones up north.

- 1 THE CHAIRMAN: For the most part their
- 2 controls of Lake Winnipeg haven't changed the
- 3 levels on Lake Winnipeg much at all. On the
- 4 average --
- 5 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: Yeah, but you
- 6 guys are looking after Norway House, Cross Lake,
- 7 Grand Rapids, I don't know about Poplar River, but
- 8 what is wrong with the other part of the lake, it
- 9 is still part of Lake Winnipeg?
- 10 THE CHAIRMAN: That's correct, but
- 11 that I can't answer you.
- 12 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: It doesn't make
- 13 sense on how you guys are running the station and
- 14 looking after only a few people on the lake, and
- 15 there is over, I don't know how many fishermen, a
- 16 total of 3,000 on Lake Winnipeg.
- 17 MRS. CRATE: That's where the green
- 18 bucks come in I guess.
- 19 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, that isn't part
- 20 of our mandate. We don't have any control over
- 21 it. We will note this, we will note your
- 22 concerns, but as far as --
- 23 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: It is all one
- 24 body, it should be the whole lake, not just look
- 25 after a few people up north. We are affected by

- 1 it too.
- THE CHAIRMAN: All right. Yes?
- MR. DION MCKAY: Dion McKay, Fisher
- 4 River. I agree with what Walter is saying, I
- 5 think -- like, I understand the reason why you are
- 6 here, you are here to listen to the community
- 7 members, to implement the input that we are
- 8 providing and hopefully turn them into
- 9 recommendations for Manitoba Hydro that the
- 10 Province will enforce as part of the regulations
- 11 for the licence, right?
- 12 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- MR. DION MCKAY: I know you're not
- 14 Manitoba Hydro, I know that. You are the Clean
- 15 Environment Commission. You have just been given
- 16 a mandate from the Province to hear from the
- 17 communities and to hopefully put this information
- 18 in the form of recommendations, right? That's the
- 19 gist of it, right?
- 20 What Walter is trying to note, though,
- 21 is no consultation has ever been done with Fisher
- 22 River Cree Nation, and probably with any of the
- 23 other First Nations in the south basin. I think
- that's his point, and I think that's an important
- 25 note to make as part of the recommendations. You

- 1 can't make it part of the recommendations for the
- 2 licence, but it is something vitally important to
- 3 note back to the Province when you do submit your
- 4 final report. Fisher River wants consultation in
- 5 regards to Manitoba Hydro development, because
- 6 that's never happened. That's point blank, right?
- 7 You can hear some of the frustration
- 8 from our community members so far, and the fact
- 9 that Fisher River has been kept in the dark from
- 10 Hydro development. So that's something that we
- 11 definitely want to see and hear in the future, and
- 12 we are hoping that you can take that message back
- 13 to the Province and to Manitoba Hydro that Fisher
- 14 River wants consultation.
- 15 I do have another concern, you touched
- on it a little bit, with the lake levels in
- 17 regards to climate change and how there seems to
- 18 be -- lately there has been more water coming in
- 19 from the different outlets, different watersheds.
- 20 And that's a trend that I think is going to
- 21 continue on. And I want to know -- I want to be
- 22 able to see through the recommendations at least
- 23 that there is some sort of climate change
- 24 adaptation plan for Manitoba Hydro to address
- 25 climate change, because nobody really talks about

- 1 it at the government level, and I think it is
- 2 about high time that that conversation is started.
- 3 Because if we don't have a plan in place to at
- 4 least forecast and to address a lot of the extreme
- 5 weather events that could happen, which we have
- 6 seen happen here in Fisher River; in 2011, in the
- 7 fall we had a flood from northwestern winds that
- 8 blew the lake water -- sorry, northeast, back into
- 9 the Fisher River. And within a matter of hours we
- 10 had, I would say, almost half the community under
- 11 water. Something at least -- I'm not as old as
- 12 some of the people here -- something that I have
- 13 never seen in my life time. And that is an
- 14 extreme weather event, right? And you look at
- 15 just the way the weather patterns have occurred
- 16 over the past while, it just seems like those 1 in
- 17 100 year events are one in ten years, or one in
- 18 five years. I know that scientifically it is
- 19 going to be pretty hard to predict, but what is
- 20 Hydro going to do and what is the Province going
- 21 to do to address these type of issues? There has
- 22 to be some sort of plan in place, there has got to
- 23 be some thought put into it, otherwise we are
- 24 going to find ourselves in the next couple of
- 25 years with another extreme weather event,

- 1 scrambling to address it.
- We had about probably 160, 170 homes
- 3 that flooded in 2011 -- 238 homes that we had to
- 4 repair because of that flood, because of that one
- 5 extreme weather event. One event, in the fall
- 6 mind you. We always prepare for a spring flood
- 7 which is a normal thing that occurs. When you get
- 8 a flood in October, I mean, what does that say?
- 9 I was in -- of all places I was at a
- 10 conference at the time on a climate change. And I
- 11 get a call from, a text from my chief telling me
- 12 that we are flooding. So, you know, I'm at a
- 13 conference addressing climate change issues, and
- 14 here we are, we are flooding back home in October,
- which doesn't happen, right?
- So we try to do what we can here in
- 17 the community, we have some emergency measures
- 18 that we enact but, you know, the Province,
- 19 Manitoba Hydro needs to have a plan in place to
- 20 address these type of issues when they do happen.
- 21 And so far we haven't heard or seen anything. So
- that's something that has got to be looked at.
- The other issue is, like if Manitoba
- 24 Hydro has a licence for Lake Winnipeg Regulation,
- 25 how are they going to regulate the new diversion

- 1 that was built from Lake Manitoba to Lake
- 2 Winnipeg? I mean, is it -- like, is that a part
- 3 of the licence at all, or is that just the
- 4 Province that's going to regulate that? And how
- 5 do the two work in conjunction to address those
- 6 water issues when the water rises?
- 7 I mean, you just said that Hydro has
- 8 been opening up, you know, Jenpeg as an example,
- 9 to alleviate the water pressure. But now that we
- 10 have this new diversion in place, how -- like what
- is the plan from both the Province and Manitoba
- 12 Hydro to address the extra, or the more influx of
- 13 water that's going to be coming into Lake
- 14 Winnipeg? And at the end of the day, how does
- 15 that affect us? And it is on top of all of the
- 16 other issues you have seen, whether they are
- 17 erosion down on the riverbanks here or at Fisher
- 18 Bay, which is a part of our traditional territory.
- 19 And I'm hoping that -- you know, I'm glad to see
- 20 some of our fisher people talk about the currents,
- 21 you know, maybe there is other issues as well in
- 22 regards to migration patterns of fish, spawning
- 23 areas, things like that, that you might have seen
- 24 as well that have changed over time.
- I don't know, I'm not a fisher person

- 1 at all, my family is a gardening family, so I'm
- 2 more on the land. But there is a lot of issues
- definitely in regards to fishing, in regards to
- 4 erosion, and just the amount of water that's being
- 5 inputted into Lake Winnipeg, that's a big concern
- 6 of mine.
- 7 Again, just to end what I need to say
- 8 here, I definitely agree with what Walter is
- 9 saying, and a consultation needs to happen with
- 10 Fisher River Cree Nation. And that's our end goal
- 11 here, that's our hope, that at the end of this it
- 12 will be a start that Hydro realizes that they have
- 13 a duty to come back, and the Province of Manitoba
- 14 has a duty to come back here to consult with the
- 15 people of Fisher River Cree Nation so we can
- 16 address these issues, because they have never been
- 17 addressed in the past. And if this is the way we
- 18 get that addressed, then so be it. We want to
- 19 make sure that it is noted in the report. And if
- 20 it can be part of a recommendation, great. But we
- 21 just want to put the Commissioner on notice that
- that's something that we need, and we want.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you for those
- 24 comments. You really captured an awful lot of
- 25 what we have been thinking about already. I do

- 1 know that Manitoba Hydro is cognizant of the fact
- 2 that there is more water coming into the lake, and
- 3 that they have to figure out a way to deal with
- 4 it. The Province is also aware of this. I'm not
- 5 sure what is being done to address that at this
- 6 point. It is something that we on the Commission
- 7 have talked about in our preparations for these
- 8 hearings. We know that -- you also mentioned the
- 9 outlet channel from Lake Manitoba, which is
- 10 something that has come up in our deliberations as
- 11 well. So you will see those thoughts reflected in
- 12 our report, and perhaps some specific
- 13 recommendations, perhaps not licensing
- 14 recommendations, but we also make what we call
- 15 non-licensing recommendations and they often end
- 16 up being implemented sort of as side issues to the
- 17 main review that we have done.
- 18 We have heard and we will certainly
- 19 make note of your concerns about the fact that
- 20 your community has not been consulted, and as a
- 21 community on the lake that may or may not have
- 22 been impacted by Lake Winnipeg Regulation. I'm
- 23 really curious about this phenomenon of flows
- 24 going one way and winds going the other. And we
- 25 will ask our hydrological engineer to look at that

- 1 and give us some comment on that. I have never
- 2 heard that before today. But that's why we come
- 3 into these communities, to hear stuff that we have
- 4 never heard before, and we can't promise -- you
- 5 know, I say this at every community meeting we
- 6 have -- we can't promise to do everything that you
- 7 would like us to do, but we do promise to listen
- 8 and consider everything that we have heard. And
- 9 it will -- if not, if we don't address every
- 10 issue, those issues will certainly inform our
- 11 thinking when we make our decisions.
- 12 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: When you guys put
- 13 that new diversion in from Lake Manitoba, have you
- 14 guys consulted the fishermen of Lake Winnipeg
- 15 before you guys did that, and what effect it has
- 16 had in our area and Dauphin River?
- 17 THE CHAIRMAN: The first outlet that
- 18 was put in place three years ago now, 2011, there
- 19 was no consultation at all. It was done under
- 20 emergency measures, so they didn't have to do any
- 21 environmental review or consult with anybody. Now
- they are talking about putting in a new permanent
- outlet, they will be required to conduct an
- 24 environmental assessment and to consult with
- 25 communities, consult with all communities, but

- 1 there will also be the specific Aboriginal, the
- 2 duty to consult, section 35 consultations will
- 3 have to be done as well with the First Nation
- 4 communities.
- 5 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: Do you guys know
- 6 what really happened? Like it is two or three
- 7 years now since that thing came in that Dauphin
- 8 River hasn't been fished. And last year --
- 9 Macbeth is an hour away from the outlet, and it
- 10 affected us also, our nets were all muddy in the
- 11 springtime. So it really affected the west side
- 12 of the lake quite a bit.
- 13 THE CHAIRMAN: Now, we weren't aware
- 14 of that because that's not our department. We
- 15 would hope that when they put in this new
- 16 permanent structure, which they are still in the
- 17 planning stages, that it will be referred to us,
- 18 and then we will come back out into the
- 19 communities and do an environmental assessment.
- 20 The section 35 assessment with First Nations
- 21 communities is done by other people in government,
- 22 not by us. But if we are asked to look at the
- 23 environmental review, then we would look at those
- 24 specific concerns that you are talking about. But
- 25 that's probably not going to happen for two or

- 1 three years. They are not going to start building
- 2 it for probably two to three years either. So the
- 3 environmental review would be maybe one and a half
- 4 to two years from now.
- 5 Were you sticking your hand up?
- 6 MR. COCHRANE: Carl Cochrane. I just
- 7 want to mention too, you know, the people that
- 8 know the effects on the lake are the guys that are
- 9 sitting here. We have been there for years and
- 10 years. You can bring as much hydrologists coming
- in there, but without the knowledge or
- 12 consultation with our fishermen with regards to
- 13 anything, they are the ones who should have been
- 14 first consulted with, I believe, with our
- 15 community in Fisher River and our people, that's
- 16 their livelihood.
- 17 And all of the effects of channels
- 18 coming in -- I heard about that current change or
- 19 whatever, like with that 2-mile channel or
- 20 whatever, I don't know what it does, but I heard
- 21 that from elders and people that are in the lake,
- 22 from fishermen talking about that over the years
- 23 and the effect that it has. There is an elder,
- 24 Dorothy here, also mentioned her father who is a
- 25 long-time fishermen, and these are the people that

- 1 have got to be consulted with because they know
- 2 exactly what is going on there. There is things
- 3 that sometimes, okay, we will make the channel
- 4 here, we will make whatever here, but we have a
- 5 big livelihood, we have a lot of fishermen here in
- 6 Fisher River, in the whole of Lake Winnipeg there
- 7 is a lot of fishermen and it affects their
- 8 livelihood.
- 9 And the things there, even with the
- 10 Hydro regulations, the water levels, like I know
- 11 when I was growing up we used to cut hay and haul
- 12 hay down -- what is that called, Walter --
- 13 Swystun, along the lake there, you can't get in
- 14 there any more. Anyway, we had a lot of cattle
- 15 farmers here making hay down that whole area
- 16 there. There is no way now, from years back, when
- 17 the water level -- and Dion also mentioned about
- 18 the floods when we get the northeast wind coming
- 19 in from the lake, like in the springtime we get it
- 20 when it comes down to the south. And the more
- 21 drainages and channels or whatever they are doing,
- 22 it all comes into Lake Winnipeg and it has a great
- 23 effect.
- 24 You know, they said they opened the
- 25 dams or whatever fully to flow. So what do we

- 1 have to do to make it like flow faster or
- 2 whatever? Because there is a lot of effects here,
- 3 like you said, 715, and I was looking on the
- 4 internet also, like it varies in different areas,
- 5 different times. I mean, I know in 2011 there we
- 6 had -- the water levels were very high, I believe,
- 7 according to when you look at the internet there,
- 8 on the lake levels. And essentially all of -- in
- 9 fact, even the shore erosion along Lake Winnipeg,
- 10 what is now a Metis settlement of Fisher Bay, and
- 11 coming up, we also owned land there that's just
- 12 washing away, washing away. It affects
- 13 everything. We have an area down there for
- 14 cottage development, when the water comes up, you
- 15 know, it affects a lot of things here, not only in
- 16 the community but the whole surrounding area.
- 17 I just want to mention also that the
- 18 fishermen here is -- that was interesting to me
- 19 too when they talked about, I don't know whether
- 20 it is a current flow or whatever, it has all
- 21 changed and that, and the fish or whatever, and
- 22 also when Walter here was showing his nets. This
- 23 past year was the worst year, I believe, that a
- 24 lot of the fishermen that mentioned that they were
- 25 really dirty and they had a really tough time out

- 1 on the lake there.
- 2 Just some of the things that I wanted
- 3 to say, and then I think the first thing, even
- 4 prior to anything, even before there was no
- 5 consultation and there should have been, the first
- 6 thing would be to approach the people that would
- 7 be affected by it.
- 8 MRS. CRATE: I don't know if Walter
- 9 will agree with me, because he is the eldest elder
- 10 here, but I remember whenever we had a northwest
- 11 wind, we would get anxious, the water would come
- 12 up. But now it is the northeast wind. And we
- 13 also have a Cree camp out there that we haven't
- 14 been able to use in years because, you know, high
- 15 water is just raising havoc with it, and the
- 16 surrounding area there.
- 17 THE CHAIRMAN: You noted in
- 18 particular, Carl, that we should be talking to
- 19 fishermen and people around the lake, that's in
- 20 part why we are here today. We want to hear some
- 21 of those stories.
- 22 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: My dad is Walter
- 23 Sinclair Senior, he has been fishing for over 60
- 24 years, and today he is still fishing at 83 years
- 25 old. And we have Fred Sinclair who is over 50

- 1 years himself. And we have John Cochrane, he is
- 2 79 or 78, he has been over 50 years. Nobody
- 3 consults with these guys and they know a lot about
- 4 the lake.
- 5 THE CHAIRMAN: I can't speak for other
- 6 people who haven't consulted, but I think you are
- 7 right that they should be consulted, and hopefully
- 8 as things move forward, they will be. When this
- 9 channel comes and, you know, it is going to be a
- 10 bit north of you but it could still have impacts,
- 11 I would hope that there is more consultation done
- 12 with people in the community. That's not our job
- 13 unless we are asked to do the environmental
- 14 review, then we will be back.
- 15 MRS. CRATE: And if Hydro does any
- 16 more work out there, I hope they don't leave the
- 17 land devastated like beavers leave it.
- 18 THE CHAIRMAN: Again, I'm not Manitoba
- 19 Hydro, but I do know that nowadays they are much
- 20 better at not harming the land like they did when
- 21 they built Jenpeg and Kettle.
- MRS. CRATE: Jenpeg, yeah, I remember.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Kettle was even worse.
- 24 They didn't cut any of the trees at Kettle and
- 25 they flooded a lot of land, but they don't do that

- 1 anymore. Dion?
- 2 MR. DION MCKAY: Yes, sir, I'm looking
- 3 online for -- like, the previous licence was for
- 4 50 years, if I'm not mistaken?
- 5 THE CHAIRMAN: That's correct. Even
- 6 this licence that we are considering right now is
- 7 in that same 50-year period. So once this review
- 8 is done and we report to the Minister, which will
- 9 be the middle of 2015, if he issues a licence then
- or later this year, it is only good until 2026.
- 11 And actually I think they have to start applying
- 12 for a relicensing six years before, so they will
- 13 have to apply for a new licence in 2020. So in
- 14 some ways, you know, we are just setting the stage
- 15 for the next application for a licence.
- And that's part of our thinking, that
- 17 if we can provide information now, or research and
- 18 monitoring that needs to be done before the next
- 19 application, that could help that process. But
- they will need a completely new licence in 2026,
- 21 so you are correct in the 50 year.
- 22 Anybody else? Anybody back here have
- 23 having to say? Just repeat your name for the
- 24 record?
- MR. THADDEUS: Councillor Darrell

- 1 Thaddeus, Fisher River.
- We were talking about the effects of
- 3 2011 wind storm that we had. I have pictures here
- 4 of what happened here in Fisher River. I will be
- 5 passing these around so you can take a look.
- 6 One site here is the cottage lot
- 7 development, it is a new site down by Fisher Bay.
- 8 That's all under water. This happened, the wind
- 9 that you are talking about, the north wind, where
- 10 it has never flooded before. In my lifetime, I
- 11 have never witnessed this kind of event. We
- 12 talked about the different weather patterns,
- events that are going to be happening more and
- 14 more often because of climate change. You know,
- 15 we are going to be under water. We have never
- 16 flooded down this way. This is Larry Traverse's
- 17 home, this is his yard. I will be sharing these
- 18 with you. This here is down by Johnny Garson's
- 19 road. I seen the water that was flowing over that
- 20 road. That has never ever happened before since I
- 21 have lived down that bay, water to come that high.
- 22 And this is the fall time. What happens if the
- 23 lake, can't control the lake, what happens in the
- 24 springtime, more and more water is coming down
- 25 from the south? We are going to be under water,

- 1 this water will have no place to go if they don't,
- 2 you know, divert the water out of Lake Winnipeg.
- The other stories that I have heard
- 4 from the fishermen that we are getting sand bars
- 5 out there, where the fishermen once used to go for
- 6 shelter during a wind storm, you can't get there
- 7 any more because of the sand bars. I know it had
- 8 an effect on the three fishermen that drowned,
- 9 they would have been able to go into the islands,
- 10 but due to the sand bars, they weren't able to get
- 11 in there. That's the story I heard from the
- 12 fishermen.
- The lakeshore erosion that's happening
- 14 with our Cree camp, we used to work down there,
- 15 the water is right up to the cabin, there is no
- 16 more land there. I used to travel the lake with
- 17 my father and other fishermen. We can not see any
- 18 shoreline any more, no beaches. That's how high
- 19 the water is.
- Now, to consult with the community, I
- 21 strongly agree with the council members and
- 22 fishermen here that that needs to happen. We see
- 23 our communities to the north here, I think it is
- 24 Lake St. Martin, they have no place there any
- 25 more. Their land is gone, their homes are gone.

- 1 I think there are still community members in
- 2 Winnipeg, still staying in hotels. What is going
- 3 to happen to our land here to the north, to the
- 4 east? We have lands here in the community where
- 5 our ranchers used to get hay. We can not get the
- 6 hay there anymore because it is all under water,
- 7 because the lake waters are so high.
- 8 Carl mentioned about the hay grounds.
- 9 And in addition to our reserve for our ranchers on
- 10 the east side, you can't get there anymore, the
- 11 road is inaccessible. I remember the farmers,
- 12 ranchers that used to collect hay down there
- 13 because I used to work for them, help them. We
- 14 can't get into that area any more.
- Our reserve, the water, the swamp, you
- 16 know, most of our reserve is unusable because of
- 17 the water levels. And I noticed year after year
- 18 that we are losing more land that we can use.
- 19 That's the comments I wanted to make,
- 20 and I hope any other stories about farming or
- 21 ranching that you could share also. Because when
- 22 Fisher River first settled here, we came here for
- 23 ranching and farming, that was part of our
- 24 Treaties that we signed in 1875. And we have to
- 25 take a look at those Treaties, what we were able

- 1 to do, we can not do anymore. I just wanted to
- 2 make those comments.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Councillor.
- 4 Anyone else wish to add comments? Does anybody
- 5 else have any stories along the lines of what we
- 6 have heard from the fishermen, or Councillor
- 7 Thaddeus' comments about flooding?
- 8 MR. DION MCKAY: Dion McKay. Maybe
- 9 just to continue on with what I said earlier on
- 10 the, you know, the whole recommendation is non --
- 11 I forget how you put it -- the non-licensing
- 12 recommendation, as you put it, Terry, in regards
- 13 to consultation with some of the other First
- 14 Nations communities that surround Lake Winnipeg,
- 15 of course. But, you know, you are going to hear
- 16 some of the stories that have been said so far,
- 17 and we are talking about 2026 we are going to go
- 18 through the same process again when a new licence
- 19 will be granted to Manitoba Hydro and, you know,
- 20 so forth. The information that we have here is,
- 21 of course, you know, very important to document.
- 22 But going forward, you know, we at Fisher River,
- 23 we understand that we need to document as much as
- 24 we can. And that's why right now there is a
- 25 definite need for consultation, so that we can get

- all of this information and this knowledge 1
- recorded. And in regards to lake levels around --2
- 3 well, the lake, is there -- do you know if there
- is like a comprehensive Lidar study that has been 4
- done in regards to the lake and its surrounding 5
- lands? And if not, that should be a 6
- recommendation going forward. 7
- THE CHAIRMAN: I don't believe -- I 8
- don't think a Lidar study has been done. There is 9
- certainly various observations from satellites, 10
- there is -- they have got 100 years of history of 11
- 12 water levels, but a Lidar study, I don't believe.
- Perhaps you could just describe what the benefits 13
- 14 of that might be?

Fisher River

- 15 MR. DION MCKAY: I think in terms of
- land use planning, which sometimes gets put on the 16
- back-burner when you are facing emergency issues 17
- such as flooding in regards to address, you know, 18
- 19 how you are going to protect communities from
- flooding, that's where your land use plan comes 20
- 21 If you have Lidar study mapping you know
- 22 which areas are the best to mitigate, whether it
- 23 is through building diversions or building dykes
- around communities or so forth. That would be the 24
- benefit of addressing some of the issues, I'm sure 25

- 1 you heard from other communities around Lake
- 2 Winnipeg, and I think that should be the
- 3 responsibility of Manitoba Hydro to do that. I
- 4 don't think it should be anybody else's
- 5 responsibility. I think if Manitoba Hydro wants
- 6 to regulate Lake Winnipeg, then it should be their
- 7 duty and their responsibility to make sure that
- 8 they understand the lay of the land, to understand
- 9 where the high points are, where the low points
- 10 are, and to make that information readily
- 11 available to the people of Manitoba, and
- 12 specifically us. I think that it's surprising
- 13 that Hydro doesn't have anything like that yet.
- 14 But it should be something that they should do in
- 15 regards to this new licence.
- 16 And I know -- I don't know if we are
- 17 calling it an interim licence or whatever the case
- 18 is, but like they are operating right now with a
- 19 new licence. And this is just kind of the final
- 20 motions to grant the official final licence until
- 21 2026. But before we get to that 2026, there
- 22 should be Lidar mapping of the land that surrounds
- 23 Lake Winnipeg. Because if we come, you know, to
- 24 2026, there should be at least an understanding of
- 25 how the land is formed around it and, you know, if

- 1 there is any other further effects that happen
- 2 from now until then, we will know where it needs
- 3 to be addressed. So I think that Hydro should
- 4 invest into Lidar mapping for the land surrounding
- 5 the reservoir, we will call it, of Lake Winnipeg.
- 6 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Just on
- 7 what this licence is called, you said, you know,
- 8 is it sort of a further interim licence. It is
- 9 sort of strange in a way, I don't understand the
- 10 history of it, but under the Water Power Act the
- 11 initial licence, when they start to build a
- 12 project, is an interim licence. And then after
- 13 they have completed the project, the proponent or
- 14 the project builder, in this case Manitoba Hydro,
- is entitled almost automatically to get a final
- 16 licence. And usually they will apply for the
- 17 final licence almost immediately after the project
- 18 is completed. And it is really just a formality.
- 19 For some reason Manitoba Hydro waited 35 years --
- 20 from 1976 until 2010, so that's 34 years before
- 21 they applied for the final licence. And again
- they felt, and probably in law they are entitled
- 23 to it almost automatically, but for small p
- 24 political reasons, because of concerns from
- 25 communities like yours and many other communities

- 1 around the lake, because there is a long history
- 2 of these concerns coming forward, the government
- 3 asked us to come out and look at it and hear from
- 4 communities and people such as you, as your
- 5 community and the people in this room. That's why
- 6 we are here.
- 7 In law they are probably almost
- 8 automatically entitled to this final licence, but
- 9 the Government has asked us to hear from people
- 10 and offer commentary before the government issues
- 11 the final licence.
- 12 As I said earlier, what we hear this
- 13 time may well, and probably will, influence the
- 14 next round when they apply for a new licence in
- 15 2026.
- 16 MR. DION MCKAY: And as I understand
- it, just so our community members that are here
- 18 understand, basically like this whole process
- 19 which has been initiated by the Province of
- 20 Manitoba is, in essence, just going through the
- 21 motions. Just like Terry said, the licence is
- 22 almost -- this whole process is a formality.
- 23 While we felt that -- the Chief and Council felt
- 24 it was important to get the Commission out to hear
- 25 us, is just to show that at the very least we care

January 26, 2015

- 1 enough, we care enough about our land and we care
- 2 enough about our fishing industry, we care enough
- 3 to show that we have these concerns.
- 4 Now, I fully understand that -- at the
- 5 end of the day, my personal perspective is that
- 6 there might not be a whole lot of recommendations
- 7 that is going to influence this licence in some
- 8 grand way that's going to address all of our
- 9 concerns. And I fully admit that and I fully can
- 10 see that and I understand that.
- 11 And moving forward to 2026, when the
- 12 next final licence comes up, that's what we want
- 13 to do, is at least document what we have right
- 14 now. That's 12 years, 11 years away. A whole lot
- 15 can happen from now until then. And I think what
- 16 council members Cochrane and Thaddeus were talking
- 17 about is we need to be heard now.
- 18 And in regards to the Province of
- 19 Manitoba, you know, I don't, honestly I don't have
- 20 a whole lot of faith in their procedures, yet they
- 21 still have a lot of work that they have to do in
- 22 regards to consultation and understanding First
- 23 Nations rights, and understanding First Nations
- 24 communities and the people that reside in them.
- But, you know, it is almost a sad

- 1 reality, you talked about this interim licence and
- 2 how it took them 30 plus years to finally apply
- 3 for a licence and how it seems to be the behaviour
- 4 and the attitude of Hydro that they can do what
- 5 they want, as they please, being one of the
- 6 only -- I think they are the only Crown run
- 7 corporation for the Province right now, and
- 8 probably the only money-making Crown run operation
- 9 that's out there. So you know -- oh, and
- 10 Lotteries, okay. I was going to say the only one
- 11 to make money, but Lotteries is definitely making
- 12 money from them.
- 13 THE CHAIRMAN: Lotteries and liquor.
- 14 MRS. CRATE: I heard on the news that
- they may be selling Manitoba Hydro?
- 16 THE CHAIRMAN: I would be very
- 17 surprised. I mean, the government has legislation
- in place saying that they can't sell Manitoba
- 19 Hydro without a province-wide referendum. I would
- 20 be surprised if they sold it. I think people
- 21 would be up in arms.
- MR. DION MCKAY: I just want to add on
- 23 to what Dorothy said, there is regulations too
- 24 from the Province of Manitoba not to raise the PST
- 25 before a referendum was done, and we all know what

- 1 happened there.
- 2 So the regulations are in place, but
- 3 we have seen so far that they are there to be
- 4 broken as well, and easily. When we had MTS here
- 5 in the Province of Manitoba, it was a Crown run
- 6 corporation, and we had a Conservative Government
- 7 come in and what happened? They sold it and it
- 8 became a private run company. It wouldn't
- 9 surprise me either, Dorothy, if at some point that
- 10 was considered. Now, I know you guys can't
- 11 comment on that and, you know, we can only assume,
- 12 right? But there is always that chance. I don't
- 13 want to put any -- I don't want to fear monger in
- 14 any way, but, you know, that can occur. And we do
- 15 have an election coming up, and I have heard
- 16 whispers of that too, you know, on the
- 17 Conservative end of things. And I think that the
- 18 sooner we get this information out and the sooner
- 19 we make our stance known, the much stronger front
- 20 we will have, at least for Fisher Cree Nation,
- 21 going forward. That if it is ever entertained, I
- 22 wouldn't want it to, but if it is ever
- 23 entertained, they would have a force to be
- 24 reckoned with here in Fisher River, and we
- 25 wouldn't -- no way in any of our imagination would

- 1 we want Manitoba Hydro to be run as a private run
- 2 company. We know what would probably happen to
- 3 the rates that we currently enjoy, although our
- 4 Hydro is high some times, it is still some of the
- 5 best rates you are going to find across the
- 6 country, and if it is privately run, you can only
- 7 imagine what is going to happen to the rates then.
- 8 Anyway, just something to say.
- 9 WALTER SINCLAIR SR: We had a big
- 10 flood here about 1974, it was the biggest flood we
- 11 had. 1975 they started working on the floodway
- 12 from Hodgson through the province boundary. I
- 13 think it was a \$25 million project. I think it
- 14 was also to make that floodway, to make Winnipeg
- 15 floodway to come out just east of the second creek
- 16 and to come out to Lake Winnipeg. And that time,
- 17 you know, a really great thing for Fisher River
- 18 and Hodgson and Peguis would have caught all of
- 19 that water that's coming from the south, and then
- 20 it would have caught all of that water that's
- 21 coming from Lake Winnipeg, it would have flowed
- 22 down there instead of flowing into the reserve.
- 23 And what happened that time, after everything was
- 24 right through, everything was approved just to go
- 25 ahead with the project. And our neighbours put a

- 1 stop to that, they wanted a man made lake in
- 2 between here and Peguis, but it wasn't in the
- 3 proposal, so that stalled it right there. That
- 4 killed it. We never got any money after that.
- 5 And I think, that's the way to go, to
- 6 be honest, stop your water coming in the reserve.
- 7 I think the leaders could invite the Province to
- 8 come in that road again to make that way coming
- 9 through here. And you will catch all of that
- 10 water coming from Lake Winnipeg, and you catch all
- of the water coming from south, instead of coming
- 12 into this river here, to flood this little river.
- 13 There is a lot of drainage that's going in this
- 14 little river here, there is a lot. Some of their
- 15 drainage is bigger than the river that catches
- 16 that water, and that's why we get that water in
- 17 the spring. And I think the leadership should get
- 18 after the Province now to start fighting for that
- 19 floodway. That's the only way that you are going
- 20 to save your land. They might have paid
- 21 \$100 million -- \$25 million in 1975.
- THE CHAIRMAN: Can I ask you, would
- 23 that floodway -- but it wouldn't have helped this
- 24 situation?
- 25 WALTER SINCLAIR SR: Oh yeah, it would

- 1 have.
- THE CHAIRMAN: From the northwest, or
- 3 northeast rather?
- 4 WALTER SINCLAIR SR: It would catch
- 5 all of that water coming from Lake Winnipeg,
- 6 because that thing was, I don't know, it was
- 7 12 feet deep, it was really a big floodway. It
- 8 would have caught all of that water, and that's a
- 9 25 mile stretch.
- 10 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay.
- 11 WALTER SINCLAIR SR: Instead of coming
- 12 into the reserve, you see this reserve is 17 feet
- 13 lower than Riverton, that's how low it is, and
- 14 that's how you get all of that flood here. I
- 15 think they have to get after the province to do
- 16 the work on it, you know. If they can do the work
- 17 from Lake Manitoba to Dauphin River, they can do
- 18 the same thing for us to make a floodway to
- 19 protect the people in the future.
- 20 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you. Anyone else
- 21 have anything to say?
- MRS. CRATE: We used to be able to
- 23 take our families out on to the beach at the mouth
- 24 of the river, we can't even do that anymore, there
- is no beach here. There is not even any beach

- 1 further east. It is all underwater.
- 2 THE CHAIRMAN: Can I ask you or
- 3 somebody else, a couple of people have mentioned
- 4 the Cree camp, where is it, or where was it?
- 5 So it is across Fisher Bay from the
- 6 mouth of the river?
- 7 MRS. CRATE: It's not across Fisher
- 8 Bay, it is just directly to the mouth of the
- 9 river.
- 10 THE CHAIRMAN: Okay. And it is now
- 11 flooded?
- MRS. CRATE: Pretty much.
- 13 THE CHAIRMAN: Anybody else have
- 14 anything to say?
- 15 WALTER SINCLAIR SR: You know, Dorothy
- 16 just mentioned about Hay Point. You know, one
- 17 time the farmers who started to hay in this
- 18 community, that's where they went to make hay, Hay
- 19 Point, they went across that bay with horses.
- 20 Yeah, that's how they used to make hay up there.
- 21 So that's right across the bay from the mouth of
- 22 the river straight east, northeast. And that's
- 23 where they used to go and make hay. Now you
- 24 can't. You can't even go across these creeks
- 25 here. Just east of us here there used to be a

- 1 road there, you can't even use that road anymore.
- 2 It used to be a highway over there, but now they
- 3 can't maintain that highway because of the flood
- 4 from the south and from the lake. You know,
- 5 that's why the Province has to do something to
- 6 make that big floodway to catch all of that water
- 7 to save all of our land.
- 8 THE CHAIRMAN: Now, you said that in
- 9 the '70s there were plans to build, or start
- 10 building the floodway?
- 11 WALTER SINCLAIR SR: Yes, it was '74
- 12 when they had that big flood, and they had a
- 13 meeting after that. There was so much damage that
- 14 year, so they decided to come all together and
- 15 plan this floodway, even Riverton and Arborg, all
- of these little towns supported our community to
- 17 make us a floodway here.
- 18 MR. DION MCKAY: I think we will break
- 19 for lunch right away. I do want to add on to what
- 20 Walter said as well. I mean, the discussion would
- 21 have been there, I think of all of those
- 22 discussions between the Province and our
- 23 neighbours to the south, and that's something else
- too we have to consider is our relationship with
- 25 our neighbours to the south. Sometimes our

- 1 priorities are different from their priorities,
- 2 and I do think if there is a lull just in the next
- 3 little while to have a discussion on, or a new
- 4 discussion on -- I don't know if it would be a
- 5 diversion or floodway or what, but there is some
- 6 effort being shown by the Province and by Peguis
- 7 to come together with us to talk about that. And
- 8 at the end of the day we will sit down with them
- 9 and we will talk about that opportunity. And you
- 10 know, whatever it entails, we will definitely want
- 11 a stake in it, you know, in terms of employment
- 12 benefits for construction or whatever the case is.
- 13 I wanted to state that out to the members now, if
- 14 it does happen or when it does happen, but, you
- 15 know, definitely we will have to align our
- 16 priorities up with our neighbours and hope that
- 17 they see things eye to eye with us as well and
- 18 that we can get something done in the future.
- 19 That being said, lunch is in the back,
- 20 and I'm sure we have some hungry tummies. Terry,
- 21 if you wouldn't mind, we will call for a lunch
- 22 break and we can come back and continue on with
- 23 our discussions.
- 24 I call on our Elder Dorothy Crate to
- 25 bless the food, and then we can get into eating.

- 1 (Prayer)
- 2 (Recessed and reconvened at 1:20 p.m.)
- 3 THE CHAIRMAN: Councillor Thaddeus was
- 4 showing us some areas on the map and then related
- 5 to these pictures that were circulated earlier.
- 6 It was informative to those of us who were taking
- 7 part in it.
- 8 First of all, let me thank and
- 9 compliment whoever provided the lunch, it was
- 10 excellent. I think all of us went back for
- 11 seconds and even thirds of things. The biscuits
- 12 in particular were very popular, but so was the
- 13 egg salad which I'm a fan of, and the cakes.
- So we, you know, we had a good
- 15 discussion this morning before lunch. We heard a
- 16 lot of your concerns. We heard in particular that
- 17 that you feel the need, and I think rightly so, to
- 18 be consulted more on your concerns, particularly
- 19 as things go forward, not only Lake Winnipeg
- 20 Regulation going forward, but also the diversions
- 21 out of Lake Manitoba, and as had been mentioned by
- 22 two or three people, including Dion McKay, global
- 23 warming and the increased water coming into all of
- 24 the lakes, the lakes and rivers in Manitoba. And
- 25 the more you link them up, the more complicated it

- 1 gets to manage. So, we need to be taking the
- 2 management of our waters a lot more seriously as
- 3 it gets more complicated, involving people at all
- 4 of these communities like yours in how we do that.
- 5 Having said that, does anyone else
- 6 have any more comments or stories that they wish
- 7 to provide? I think all of you, or most of you
- 8 were here this morning and you heard the
- 9 discussion we had before lunch, which we feel was
- 10 a very good discussion, which is exactly why we
- 11 come into these communities, we want to hear that
- 12 type of thing, stories of people who are living
- 13 with these effects.
- So does anybody else have any more
- 15 they wish to let us hear?
- 16 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: These rights,
- 17 these recommendations as they are today, are they
- 18 for the next licence, 2026, or the ones prior?
- 19 THE CHAIRMAN: What we are doing right
- 20 now is more immediate. It is for the issuance of
- 21 the final licence right now. Hydro wants to have
- that licence in place by the end of this year.
- 23 Whether that will happen remains to be seen, but
- 24 they want it in place soon. The 2026 application
- 25 will be separate. That probably won't come for

- 1 about -- what are we now, 2015 -- probably about
- 2 five or six years before Hydro applies for a
- 3 completely new licence. What we are dealing with
- 4 now is a licence that's been in place for almost
- 5 40 years, 39 years. So what we want to hear, what
- 6 we are going to report on and make recommendations
- 7 about is the current final licence, which will
- 8 only be good for another 11 years.
- 9 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: Are you guys just
- 10 starting this, these meetings now, this year?
- 11 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 12 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: Why weren't they
- 13 started maybe three or four years ago?
- 14 THE CHAIRMAN: Hydro applied for the
- 15 final licence, it was either late 2010 or early
- 16 2011. It was referred to the Clean Environment
- 17 Commission in -- we got the terms of reference in
- 18 September 2011, and we started working on it then.
- 19 But then after that, Hydro applied for the licence
- 20 for Bipole III, and they wanted that done first.
- 21 So we put Lake Winnipeg Regulation to the side and
- 22 did Bipole III, which took us over a year. And
- 23 then before we got back to Lake Winnipeg
- 24 Regulation, they applied for Keeyask, which was
- 25 also referred to us, and we did that, and that

- 1 took almost a year. And we finished Keeyask last
- 2 spring. When did we send the report over?
- 3 Probably about April or May. And we have turned
- 4 our minds to this in the spring of last year. We
- 5 held our first pre-hearing meeting with various
- 6 parties at the end of May. Then we had to wait
- 7 for Hydro to produce a document that we had asked
- 8 them for. And it just sort of took a number of
- 9 months getting people, getting the message out,
- 10 finding contractors to do some of the work waiting
- 11 for Hydro to complete their document, it took a
- 12 number of months before we were ready to come out
- 13 with the hearings.
- We just started these hearings two
- 15 weeks ago. We went up north to Thompson. We were
- in Thompson, Wabowden, and York Landing, and last
- 17 week we went up to Grand Rapids, and this week we
- 18 are in this part of the Interlake this week. And
- 19 we will continue on the other side of the lake in
- 20 the next couple of weeks, then back up to Cross
- 21 Lake, then a few weeks in Winnipeg in -- well,
- 22 March and probably into April. And I think one or
- 23 two more trips up North. I think we have to go to
- 24 Norway House some time.
- 25 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: Are you going to

- 1 be hosting a general meeting in Winnipeg?
- THE CHAIRMAN: In Winnipeg?
- 3 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: Yeah?
- 4 THE CHAIRMAN: Yes. Right now we have
- 5 already scheduled three weeks of meetings in
- 6 Winnipeg, and we are probably going to have to add
- 7 at least one week in there.
- 8 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: So you are
- 9 breaking up the lake from north, central to south
- 10 in these phases?
- 11 THE CHAIRMAN: Not really. I mean, as
- 12 far as our review goes, it is the lake as a whole,
- 13 and it is the controls at the north end of the
- 14 lake as well, they are the specific things that
- 15 affect the regulation of the lake. The schedule
- 16 of our hearings is just how it worked out, I mean,
- 17 when communities were available, what worked. And
- 18 just because of travel, we try to keep things
- 19 together. Like this week we are just in this sort
- 20 of central part of the Interlake. Next week it
- 21 will be sort of the south basin, Lake
- 22 Manigotagan -- no, next week it is the Grand
- 23 Marais and then Brokenhead, Gimli, Selkirk. It is
- 24 just what is convenient for travel. You know, we
- 25 have to stay in hotels when we are out here, so we

- 1 have to get central stuff. That's all. It is
- 2 just -- just the scheduling dynamics rather than
- 3 any plan.
- 4 Anybody else?
- 5 MR. DION MCKAY: I want to add a
- 6 couple of other things, on top of everything else
- 7 that I touched on. But when you look at our
- 8 20-year community plan and the Lidar mapping that
- 9 we did out of that, very land base use mapping,
- 10 but out of that 20-year plan we can very clearly
- 11 see that about 70 to 72 per cent of our land is
- 12 unusable because it is all swamp, it is all marshy
- 13 and it is not suitable for development. So for
- 14 Fisher River, when we look at our land use
- 15 planning, we have very limited resources on
- 16 reserve to use at our disposal. But the
- 17 interesting question was asked in terms of our
- 18 high water table that we do have in our community,
- 19 how much of that might have increased from the
- 20 time that Hydro development started, and then
- 21 currently going forward, how is -- you know, it
- 22 would be interesting to find out if that would be
- 23 a part of the consideration, like if you look at
- 24 water tables of various communities and how they
- 25 are going to be impacted by current Hydro

- 1 regulations on Lake Winnipeg, because that impacts
- 2 us, that will definitely impact us. You heard
- 3 about it in regards to the flooding that occurs in
- 4 the community on top of climate change effects.
- 5 We are a bottleneck, as a community we get
- 6 everything from Lake Winnipeg when we get those
- 7 storms, but also we get everything from south as
- 8 well, so from the RM of Fisher, of Pequis, of
- 9 Dallas, we get everything from there as well,
- 10 right? So we are a unique community in that sense
- 11 I would say.
- 12 On top of that, we stake riparian
- 13 rights to the river, and we still have got to get
- 14 it, I will say more legally defined. But the
- 15 Federal Government has stated that we do have
- 16 riparian rights here in the river. From what I
- 17 understand, we are the only community in Manitoba
- 18 that has staked its riparian rights in regards to
- 19 the water. So in regards to Lake Winnipeg
- 20 Regulation, I think it is something that, I don't
- 21 know if they have ever looked at that but -- and I
- 22 don't know going forward how we define that. I
- 23 will be honest, I'm not too sure what it is, but I
- 24 do know that it is a right. How is that going to
- 25 impact the, you know, the recommendations or the

- 1 regulations of Lake Winnipeg? There is no answer
- 2 there right now, but I just want to put the
- 3 Commission on notice that that's something else
- 4 that will have to be considered, is how riparian
- 5 rights will be impacted through Lake Winnipeg
- 6 regulations by Manitoba Hydro and the Province of
- 7 Manitoba.
- 8 THE CHAIRMAN: You said that 72 per
- 9 cent of your community is not usable. Now, do you
- 10 know if that's recent, has it always been like
- 11 that? Has the higher waters in recent years added
- 12 to that? Did you use to have more that was
- 13 usable?
- 14 MR. DION MCKAY: Well, you heard this
- 15 morning about the hay lands that our farmers used
- 16 to be able to use to harvest hay. Like I said
- 17 earlier, I come from a family of gardeners and
- 18 farmers as well. And there is people in my family
- 19 that like to farm and they can't right now, or
- 20 maybe never, I don't know. But yes, there is land
- 21 that we used to be able to use that we can't use
- 22 now. So the 72 per cent that I was talking about
- 23 is right now what we can't use. What percentage
- 24 that was going back 30 or 40 years, I couldn't
- 25 even guess what that would be.

- 1 THE CHAIRMAN: It would be interesting
- 2 to know that. I don't know how you determine it,
- 3 I'm not a scientist, but it would be interesting
- 4 to know whether at the time of Lake Winnipeg
- 5 Regulation, if that sort of added to the land you
- 6 were no longer able to use. Global warming has
- 7 almost certainly played a part, but...
- 8 Anybody else? You need to talk into
- 9 the mic, introduce yourself first.
- 10 MR. LESLIE MCKAY: My name is Leslie
- 11 McKay and I'm from this community, and I did all
- 12 kinds of work. How I see it, when I was growing
- 13 up there was a lot of houses along the river here,
- 14 never ever flooded. But until they start putting
- in those dams and flooding the land, the people
- 16 had to move away from the shore, away from the
- 17 rivers. And today, like last fall I went down on
- 18 the boat and I went down towards the mouth of the
- 19 river, and where they used to cut hay, this is
- 20 covered with water. You could easily, you could
- 21 have rode around out in the field where a boat was
- 22 not allowed to go because of all of the water.
- 23 And what is Manitoba Hydro doing to
- 24 help First Nations people, not only here, but
- 25 different areas? The way I look at it, I think we

- 1 should be compensated for the waste of our land.
- 2 Even we used to have a nice beach before, but
- 3 that's all gone now. It is all gone now. We used
- 4 to have a nice beach down at the bay area, but
- 5 that's all gone now.
- 6 What is being done about it? You hear
- 7 a lot of talk about it, but nobody wants to do
- 8 anything about it. But I believe it is time First
- 9 Nations people begin to speak up for themselves
- 10 and what is rightfully theirs, and I believe it is
- 11 only fair. Manitoba Hydro come and flood the land
- 12 and destroy the land. They figure that they are a
- 13 gift to the people in this community or in
- 14 different areas, but they don't think, they don't
- think about the needs of other people around,
- 16 around the areas.
- 17 So this is all I got to say, you know,
- 18 it is pretty sad. It is pretty sad. If you were
- 19 to come out here, if there is a big northwest
- 20 wind, you can see what it does even to the river
- 21 here, how high it brings it up. I remember it
- 22 back here, not too far from here, as a kid growing
- 23 up near the river, it never ever flooded. But
- 24 ever since they put these dams and everything
- 25 else, and that 22-mile channel as well, it has a

- 1 lot of effect on the lake. You know, it is pretty
- 2 sad. All I can say, it is pretty sad.
- It is sad for the fishermen too, it
- 4 affects the fishermen. I used to fish as a
- 5 helper, and I seen the damages that it used to do.
- 6 And I believe it is still happening today. Look
- 7 at that channel they made from Lake Manitoba, all
- 8 of that dirt affected the waves last fall. And I
- 9 was talking to fishermen, they said their nets
- 10 were just like planted. That's pretty dam sad, to
- 11 see the government do this to the people that
- 12 elected them in office, you know, and just lining
- 13 their pockets.
- 14 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Mr. McKay.
- 15 Anybody else?
- MR. THADDEUS: Thank you. Councillor
- 17 Darrell Thaddeus. In answer to speak to what they
- 18 were talking about here with the north wind, we
- 19 were talking about the effects of the north wind.
- 20 And if you can see down by Hecla Island there,
- 21 there is islands there that prevent water, most of
- the water from going into the south basin here.
- 23 But where do you see that water going? Where we
- 24 are situated right here. Most of that water is
- 25 going to come into our community. And the effects

- 1 of those winds -- they are all photographed, and
- 2 I'm sure that there is plenty of other pictures
- 3 out there that we can send. If you have any more
- 4 information, please send them to us.
- 5 We talked about compensation for the
- 6 loss, and the use of our land. I was talking
- 7 about up the road here there used to be hay lands
- 8 up there, there used to be fences, remember that?
- 9 You can't even cut hay in that area anymore
- 10 because of the high water table. To the south, to
- 11 the north, northeast, unusable.
- 12 So council have already started
- 13 amongst ourselves, you know, what our next steps
- 14 are for compensation. And I hope that out of
- 15 these discussions, recommendations from the
- 16 community, where we go from here, because that's
- 17 what we need to hear also, you know.
- 18 THE CHAIRMAN: Thank you, Councillor.
- 19 Anybody else? Anybody want to add to the
- 20 discussion?
- MR. STEVE MCKAY: Yeah, maybe here.
- What's your name?
- 23 THE CHAIRMAN: My name is on that
- 24 plaque up there, I'm Terry Sargeant.
- MR. STEVE MCKAY: I'm Steve McKay

- 1 senior. Okay. Like has been said quite a bit
- 2 already, right now, but they make the branches
- 3 from the south weir, the farmers, the pig farmers.
- 4 And I know from way back over there, I forget what
- 5 they call that, by Ashern anyway, all that water
- 6 is coming this way here, you know, because the
- 7 river that we have. Like there is the two rivers.
- 8 When you get about past Pequis there, there is a
- 9 branch off there, there is one from the west side,
- 10 one from the east side, and it comes to one river
- 11 from there. So when you get those two to meet
- 12 together, I guess they must spill a lot of water
- into that one channel that comes out to the lake
- 14 here. I was just wondering -- like, you said, a
- 15 lot of that land, hay land is flooded. You can't
- 16 even go there with a four wheeler, you get stuck
- 17 there if you go with a four wheeler there now
- 18 today. At one time you could walk over there. I
- 19 used to go and hunt over there a long time ago
- when I was young, I didn't need no (inaudible),
- 21 that's how great it was, nice. Yeah.
- But then what is happening now, like
- 23 the government is doing a lot of building dams,
- 24 that's true, but they are making good money. What
- 25 about us? Like they said, we are not getting

- 1 nothing for that. We are still paying Hydro, and
- 2 I heard that we are paying more Hydro than the
- 3 States do. It is ridiculous. I think it is time
- 4 the government looked at -- we have got these
- 5 things, what we have been doing all of these years
- 6 since the first dam was built at Grand Rapids.
- 7 That was in the '70s, the other dams were built
- 8 there, and now they are starting another one up
- 9 there. So how they can control the water? I
- 10 don't know what they do to control the water, the
- 11 lake.
- 12 THE CHAIRMAN: What can they do to
- 13 control it?
- 14 MR. STEVE MCKAY: What do they do to
- 15 control the lake.
- 16 THE CHAIRMAN: What they use, and that
- 17 big map that was brought in this morning with
- 18 Manitoba Hydro system on top shows some of the
- 19 structures of the control. You know, it is 2-mile
- 20 channel and then 8-mile channel, but the main
- 21 control is at Jenpeg where there is a control
- 22 structure and a generating station, a spillway and
- 23 a generating station. That's the main controls.
- 24 MR. STEVE MCKAY: Okay. You know, I
- 25 think it is about time the government come here

- 1 and check out what is happening, you know. Like
- 2 the river that you see here, when I was a young
- 3 kid I used to swim on that river, I used to drink
- 4 that river. When I was young, that was our
- 5 drinking water when we were here, before all of
- 6 these wells and everything else came around,
- 7 that's where we drank from. That's how clear and
- 8 clean that river was before everybody started
- 9 dumping everything into the river, making their
- 10 drains and all that into the river. You know, we
- 11 are left with it.
- 12 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, when I was kid
- 13 growing up in Gimli, there were streams that we
- 14 would drink straight out of the creek. I would go
- 15 to scout camp and drink water right out of the
- 16 Winnipeg River. I sure wouldn't do it today, just
- 17 like you wouldn't.
- 18 WALTER SINCLAIR SR: How about that
- 19 dam in Grand Rapids, do they let the water in same
- 20 as Jenpeg?
- THE CHAIRMAN: I'm sorry, can you
- 22 repeat your question?
- 23 WALTER SINCLAIR SR: There is a dam in
- 24 Grand Rapids, do they let that water out the same
- 25 as the one in Jenpeg?

- 1 THE CHAIRMAN: Yeah, it is much the
- 2 same principle as the one at Jenpeg. It is a
- 3 bigger generating station, but water comes through
- 4 the generating turbines as well as over the
- 5 spillway if they have too much water. So it is
- 6 similar in concept to the one at Jenpeg, it is
- 7 just -- it is a bigger dam, but then the lake
- 8 behind it is smaller, it is Cedar Lake. There was
- 9 a lot of flooding in Cedar Lake, as I am sure you
- 10 know, when they built that dam.
- MR. MCKAY: My name is McKay. Like,
- 12 the control of the water of Lake Winnipeg is
- 13 really, I think is not as good as it should be.
- 14 Because like I was sitting here listening to the
- 15 elders talk about places where they used to make
- 16 hay, where -- and all of our hunting lands are
- 17 being flooded over. And I worked for this
- 18 community for a few years as flood coordinator,
- 19 and seeing the flood in the fall was something I
- 20 never saw, which comes down from Lake Winnipeg. I
- 21 knew that the years that I was working with the
- 22 different organizations, along with Peguis and
- 23 Lake Manitoba, and we went to meetings, they were
- 24 more concerned about the south basin than the
- 25 Interlake basin, like considering, not worrying

- 1 about the flood lands of the crops and the farmers
- 2 and the cattlemen. It was a mistake, I say,
- 3 opening the diversion in Portage. Still yet we
- 4 can see the Federal and Provincial Governments
- 5 still paying for their mistake. And it caused a
- 6 community to be dislocated. I was working along
- 7 with a friend of mine from Fairford, and when they
- 8 opened the dam and they had no control about where
- 9 the water was going, and EMO was slow at moving
- 10 out their equipment, and he asked me, what am I
- 11 going to do? I says, well, what have you got?
- 12 And he says, I have nothing. And I says, okay,
- 13 you have snow on the ground, let's use that snow.
- 14 And what I told him to do is get some machinery in
- 15 along the east side of the river, Fairford River,
- 16 and start building up a snow dyke, which held for
- 17 a while, long enough to move some cattle and some
- 18 families out of the lower Fairford River.
- 19 And controlling the lake water, in the
- 20 past few years it has been higher than usual, and
- 21 it does -- it really does take effect on the
- 22 fisheries. Because I used to go visit at one of
- 23 the stations here, and the guys were coming in
- 24 with probably maybe three, four boxes of fish, and
- 25 that doesn't even pay for their fuel. But it is

- 1 so high that, you know, global warming, before
- 2 even global warming came, I can't say anything
- 3 about the same global warming had an effect in
- 4 probably about 30 years ago. I think basically it
- 5 was the Hydro and the generation stations that
- 6 were causing the problems.
- 7 Maybe I'm saying too much right now.
- 8 THE CHAIRMAN: No. That was fine,
- 9 thank you. Anybody else want to add to the
- 10 conversation?
- 11 SPEAKER: Is the Hydro, like when you
- 12 start -- like is the Hydro really checking
- 13 everything or monitoring whatever they started on,
- 14 or before you started you were going and surveyed
- 15 the areas where you know that it is going flood.
- 16 And like, Hydro, now today, I remember we didn't
- 17 have Hydro when I was growing up, but it is good
- 18 to have Hydro and that today, but it is costing
- 19 the government some money. But I was wondering
- 20 about that, did they monitor that stuff before
- 21 they started making dams, and are they continuing
- 22 going and checking everything as they are building
- 23 more dams?
- 24 THE CHAIRMAN: No, I know what he is
- 25 talking about. And in the early days they didn't.

- 1 When they built Kettle and probably Long Spruce
- 2 and Lake Winnipeg Regulation, that was before the
- 3 current Environment Act came into place, and that
- 4 was really -- sort of environmental impact science
- 5 and studies just started probably late '60s, early
- 6 '70s, so it was really in its infancy and it
- 7 wasn't done broadly. So there were very few
- 8 environmental impact assessments done before those
- 9 projects were built. Even Limestone, which was
- 10 built in the '80s, it wasn't subject to a major
- 11 environmental impact assessment or a review. In
- 12 fact, the first Hydro project that was reviewed by
- 13 us, by the Clean Environment Commission, was
- 14 Wuskwatim, and that was only 11 years ago. So it
- is a fairly new process. A lot of those projects
- 16 didn't have assessments done before they were
- 17 built.
- 18 In the mid '70s there was a study
- 19 board group called the Lake Winnipeg,
- 20 Nelson/Churchill River Study Board, and they did
- 21 an assessment that was a sort of environmental
- 22 assessment of the projects. It was actually -- I
- 23 read it last summer, and it is quite good. Given
- 24 that the science was really in its infancy then,
- what they did was quite good, but it wasn't a full

- 1 impact assessment the way they do today. But
- 2 since those projects, and with the growth of
- 3 environmental assessment, Hydro does do a lot more
- 4 monitoring. They do a lot of monitoring of what
- 5 has happened. In some cases they don't know what
- 6 was there before, but they still look at what is
- 7 going on. And with the newer projects they do
- 8 full environmental assessments. And when we
- 9 review them, we find all of the holes in their
- 10 environmental assessments and make them do them
- 11 even better. So I hope -- it is a bit of a
- 12 long-winded answer, but I hope it answers your
- 13 question.
- 14 Anybody else? This is going to be
- 15 your last chance, your last opportunity -- well,
- 16 not your last opportunity forever because we are
- 17 meeting in Winnipeg in March and you are welcome
- 18 to come there, but your last opportunity here in
- 19 your community, if I don't hear from anybody else
- 20 in the next minute or two or three.
- 21 Well, let me say, I think this has
- 22 been a very good session. I'm really glad we came
- 23 here. I can tell you we have gone into some
- 24 communities where only one or two people come out
- 25 and we don't hear much, if anything. But some

- 1 communities we get into really good discussions,
- 2 and I feel that today's discussion has been a
- 3 really good discussion. It has been about a lot
- 4 of issues that are obviously of important concern
- 5 to your community. A lot of those issues do fall
- 6 within our mandate and we will comment on them.
- 7 As I said to Dion earlier, I don't know, I can't
- 8 guarantee that we will make recommendations about
- 9 your concerns, but we may. It may be specific, it
- 10 may be a general recommendation that does benefit
- 11 your community as well as other similar
- 12 communities along the lake.
- But I do want to thank you for all of
- 14 your input today, for all that we've heard, and
- 15 thank you for letting us into your community.
- 16 Thank you for a great lunch. And I think this
- 17 gentleman just indicated that he wanted to say
- 18 something more before we turn it over to you.
- 19 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: I have a question
- 20 about -- you guys are the Clean Environment, is
- 21 that what you guys do?
- THE CHAIRMAN: Yes.
- 23 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: What about the
- 24 pig barns up south and there are some by Riverton
- 25 there, how far are they supposed to be away from

- 1 drainages and the lake?
- THE CHAIRMAN: Well, we don't manage
- 3 stuff that goes on in the environment, that's a
- 4 different branch of government. But about eight
- 5 years ago, nine years ago, we did a review of the
- 6 hog industry in Manitoba, and we toured throughout
- 7 southern Manitoba, into the Interlake, we had
- 8 meetings in Arborg and Stonewall. And we made a
- 9 number of recommendations about hog operations.
- 10 And I think all of them have been implemented.
- 11 And there are rules about how far the lagoons are
- 12 supposed to be from water, and how close they can
- 13 come to water when they are spreading the manure.
- 14 So that's all in place. Whether it is being
- 15 enforced, I don't know, and that's not our
- 16 jurisdiction. But we have looked at it and we
- 17 have made what -- a lot of what we felt were very
- 18 good recommendations about them.
- 19 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: So a lot of that,
- 20 like during the spring floods down south there,
- 21 there is a lot of hog farmers down there and a lot
- 22 of that stuff is coming into the Red and
- 23 Assiniboine and into Lake Winnipeg.
- 24 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, among the
- 25 recommendations we made was to move, or to

- 1 actually outlaw any new operations in the Red
- 2 River Valley for exactly the reason that you are
- 3 talking about. Because in flood years some of
- 4 those sewage lagoons got overrun by the flood
- 5 waters and all of that pig poop ended up in our
- 6 lake.
- 7 So again -- we have one more comment
- 8 here.
- 9 SPEAKER: Do you have control about
- 10 how many drainages are, or do they have to get a
- 11 licence to put a drainage in toward the river or
- 12 any run-offs?
- 13 THE CHAIRMAN: No, that's not in our
- 14 jurisdiction at all. There are other branches of
- 15 government, I would say the Department of
- 16 Conservation or Agriculture, but we don't do that.
- 17 All right.
- 18 WALTER SINCLAIR JR: I know it is a
- 19 little bit off what you guys are here to deal
- 20 with, but there is a licence that a person has to
- 21 get if they want to, if they want to even clean
- 22 out existing drainage, there is a process there
- 23 that you still have to go through. I think it is,
- there is a drainage department, a part of
- 25 Conservation, that you have to go through. The

- 1 unfortunate thing though is, and Terry, you are
- 2 very nice in the way that you put it, but there is
- 3 barely any money for the Province to enforce any
- 4 of the rules. So in spite of the rules that we
- 5 have, there is nobody there to enforce it. So the
- 6 only time something is going to get done is if
- 7 somebody raises a red flag about whatever it is.
- 8 And we actually did that last year in regards to a
- 9 farmer up in Dallas RedRose, that claimed that all
- 10 he did was clean out existing ditches, but, man,
- 11 did he ever do a lot of work out there.
- 12 SPEAKER: A lot of drainage was coming
- 13 into that.
- 14 MR. DION MCKAY: Yeah, exactly, that
- 15 was done without a licence. There is a lot of
- 16 issues there, we are aware of some of them, and we
- 17 are still waiting to hear from the Province as to
- 18 what they are going to be doing about it.
- 19 SPEAKER: (Inaudible.)
- 20 MR. DION MCKAY: He claimed he did.
- 21 He basically outright lied about it, and he went
- 22 to drainage and told them, said they were okay
- 23 with it, and that was never the case. The
- 24 Province is caught basically between a rock and a
- 25 hard place with us, and we are holding them to it,

- 1 to keep that particular person accountable for
- 2 what they do. That's not right that they go to
- 3 the government and say we were fine with
- 4 something, and we weren't. That's not the case at
- 5 all. And then the hog barns are one thing, in
- 6 regards to Red River and Assiniboine, but I think
- 7 the big thing is Winnipeg itself, I mean, they
- 8 are -- raw sewage is going right into the river
- 9 almost on a daily basis. It is a matter of fact.
- 10 There is so much, it is a lot of crap out there,
- 11 granted, but there is a lot of work to be done.
- 12 SPEAKER: Maybe we should get into
- 13 salvaging raw sewage and make some money.
- 14 THE CHAIRMAN: Winnipeg sewage is
- 15 something that the Clean Environment Commission
- 16 looked at, and we recommended against dumping raw
- 17 sewage into the rivers. And there are some things
- 18 that you can do with raw sewage. There is a
- 19 process that will recover phosphorous from raw
- 20 sewage, and it can be sold and used as fertilizer.
- 21 But that takes money.
- 22 WALTER SINCLAIR SR: There is a farmer
- 23 here, he was tired and he had to clean out his
- 24 yard, he had to take everything out and not in the
- 25 lake. And then the same thing towards here, we

- 1 had an old store here for many years and they had
- 2 tanks in the ground, so they had to dig all of
- 3 that up and haul that mud away and put new mud in
- 4 there. And then there is people that got away
- 5 with it up the line here. They had stores, and
- 6 the tanks were under there, but they were never
- 7 bothered. And there is a farmer there not far
- 8 from the ditch, he has a big farm along the creek,
- 9 two farms around the creek, they never bothered
- 10 those farmers to make them clean up. There is
- 11 people getting away with stuff, and there is
- 12 people that are getting charged. Just like the
- 13 guy digging the ditches there, he should have been
- 14 charged.
- 15 THE CHAIRMAN: This is off the record.
- 16 (OFF THE RECORD DISCUSSION)
- 17 THE CHAIRMAN: Anybody else before we
- 18 close down the record?
- MR. THADDEUS: I just wanted to say a
- 20 few words.
- 21 Well, if there is no more conversation
- 22 on this, you want to bring forward in the
- 23 recommendations that you would like to see, we
- 24 will just close it down. But in saying so, I just
- 25 want to make a few last comments on the whole

- 1 water system here in Fisher River. We have got
- 2 the lake, you know, to the north of us, we are
- 3 surrounded by another lake up here, Goldeye. We
- 4 have no land to the south because it is all bog,
- 5 and we have got all of the water coming down from
- 6 south, but the water has no place to go because
- 7 the lake levels are so high. So that's why our
- 8 lands are flooding. We have got no more use for
- 9 our land, 72 per cent of our land, as Dion said,
- 10 is unusable. We are looking at drainage for those
- 11 areas, but still, where is the water going to go?
- 12 And when the water does come in from the north, it
- impacts us, it doesn't go all of the way to
- 14 Peguis, but in surrounding areas it will flood the
- 15 low lying areas. And again Fisher River is
- 16 surrounded by bog, and that's the places where it
- 17 is going to go first. So surrounded by water from
- 18 the south, and when it does, we are caught, we
- 19 have no place, you know, to exit.
- 20 We have a fish road there that we are
- 21 working with government, you know, when it floods,
- 22 when the road does close down, you can at least go
- 23 through the fish road, it is through the bush line
- 24 here. I showed you on the map. So we still want
- 25 to get that road all worked up and improved so we

- 1 have access out of here, that's one of the things
- 2 that we are talking with Tom Chabatinoff (ph) on,
- 3 I think that's his name. Yeah. So if there
- 4 aren't any more questions, I have got Steve. One
- 5 more, that's it.
- 6 MR. STEVE MCKAY: No, just, come to
- 7 think of it here, when you were talking about, you
- 8 know, this river, I worked on this river here when
- 9 they surveyed it. I was the one cutting the lines
- 10 for the surveyors. I don't know what became of
- 11 that, I never heard anything about it, I don't
- 12 know if anybody on council heard about it. So
- 13 then that was years ago, I don't know how many
- 14 years ago, maybe 40 years ago, probably. It is
- 15 about 40 years ago anyway that they surveyed this
- 16 place here, and from here all the way down to a
- 17 reserve there where that new bridge is now. But I
- 18 don't know what became of that survey of what they
- 19 made there, but it was 1,000 feet from the river
- 20 to the outlet, from the shore to the bush. There
- 21 was 1,000 feet that we cut. We cut that line like
- 22 for those surveyors. I don't know what became of
- 23 that.
- 24 MR. THADDEUS: I don't know, I never
- 25 heard about that. Carl, do you want to say

- 1 anything else before we close?
- 2 MR. COCHRANE: I just want to say also
- 3 that our members, our elders, you know, our wisdom
- 4 is right here, and I always say that these are the
- 5 people that always should be talked about. They
- 6 lived here all of theirs lives, like fishing,
- 7 farming, all of the things. I still say the
- 8 elevation of the lake is high and it does affect,
- 9 it continues to effect everyone in our community
- 10 today. Not only that, we have traditional people
- 11 within the community also. It affects gathering
- 12 of the medicines and different things. They call
- 13 a thing called Weekis, that's for colds or
- 14 whatever. It can't be picked any more along the
- 15 lake there. People used to use that all of the
- 16 time for colds and sickness and medicines. It
- 17 affects not only farming, livelihood, fishing, and
- 18 it affects everything in our daily way of life
- 19 from day-to-day. And some of the areas, we did
- 20 our community plan, and some of the areas are
- 21 identified as hay lands and they can no longer cut
- 22 hay there any more. That's probably why we don't
- 23 have cattle farmers, because what are they going
- 24 to feed their cows? Are they going to transport
- 25 hay in from elsewhere? That's the reason why when

- 1 we first moved from Norway House is for more
- 2 economic purposes, one is farming, fishing is big.
- 3 We have about 100, maybe 95 commercial licensed
- 4 fishermen, around there, about 150 fishermen
- 5 within the community that goes out to our fishing
- 6 station at Macbeth. And then the things, like the
- 7 channels that are coming in, for me personally --
- 8 you know, when the Creator set his land the way it
- 9 should be, and when anybody tampers or does any
- 10 changes or anything like that, it doesn't matter
- 11 what it is, there is always going to be an effect.
- 12 That's what our elders always told us, my dad told
- 13 me that, my grandparents told me that. Any
- 14 changes that are done to Mother Earth, not just
- 15 our areas but all over, there is always going to
- 16 be effects of everything. Coming along with that
- 17 comes sicknesses and illnesses and different
- 18 things. There is a lot to it.
- 19 The fishermen here, they have a tough
- 20 time right now. This past year, you know, they
- 21 spent more money on a few different things, and no
- 22 fish, dirty water. Like we see the gentleman,
- 23 Walter's netting here that's filled with, you
- 24 know, mud and like everything. You know, that's
- 25 our way of life.

- 1 And with that, I just wanted to say
- 2 thanks to everyone for coming out, and thanks for
- 3 coming out and recording and listening to all of
- 4 the concerns. And I hope, I personally hope that
- 5 all of the information, the concerns from our
- 6 members here are put forward and put as
- 7 recommendations that, you know, and shows all of
- 8 the effects, the damages that it does. With that
- 9 I just want to say thank you. Now back to Dion.
- 10 MR. DION MCKAY: I think I said
- 11 everything that I needed to say. So just thanks
- 12 again for coming out, and the team, for everyone
- 13 making this possible, and Melissa for coordinating
- 14 this.
- 15 MR. STEVE MCKAY: You know, he talks
- 16 about flooding from the lake, from the south, and
- 17 all of the drainages coming to the thing. I
- 18 wanted to tell you a story that reminds me of it.
- 19 The big flood, when you are coming from the south,
- 20 coming from the lake, and after a while it came
- 21 from the south, and our whole area here, look at
- 22 our mapping here, we had some homes close to the
- 23 river. And then his house is quite a ways back
- 24 from the river along the highway. And the guy was
- 25 sitting there, you know, you talk about carp and

- 1 different things going into the land, this guy was
- 2 having coffee there, and there was carp fish
- 3 swimming around there. He wanted me to tell that
- 4 story because he thought it was pretty funny when
- 5 he has sitting there having coffee in the morning
- 6 and you see carp jumping around at the bottom of
- 7 your steps. But it is a true story.
- 8 MR. THADDEUS: Yeah, that's a true
- 9 story about the carp, the fish coming in.
- I want to say thank you to the team
- 11 for coming out and hearing what our elders have to
- 12 say, and the different community members. I hope
- 13 you have a safe ride back. Thank you everybody.
- 14 THE CHAIRMAN: Well, again, thank you
- 15 to everybody. Thank you to the folks that put the
- 16 lunch together. Thank you for the people who
- 17 organized today's session here in your community
- 18 hall. We may see some of you in Winnipeg in
- 19 March. Otherwise, happy trails, we may cross
- 20 paths somewhere else. Again, thank you all very
- 21 much.
- 22 (Concluded at 2:20 p.m.)
- 23
- 24
- 25

1	OFFICIAL EXAMINER'S CERTIFICATE	Page 84
2		
3		
4		
5	I, CECELIA J. REID, a duly appointed Official	
6	Examiner in the Province of Manitoba, do hereby	
7	certify the foregoing pages are a true and correct	
8	transcript of my Stenotype notes as taken by me at	
9	the time and place hereinbefore stated, to the	
10	best of my skill and ability.	
11		
12		
13		
14		
15	Cecelia J. Reid	
16	Official Examiner, Q.B.	
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

This document was created with Win2PDF available at http://www.win2pdf.com. The unregistered version of Win2PDF is for evaluation or non-commercial use only. This page will not be added after purchasing Win2PDF.