

From: [REDACTED]
To: [+WPG/25 - Clean Environment Commission](#)
Subject: Vivian Silica Sand Extraction Project
Date: March 23, 2023 9 58:12 PM

CAUTION: This email originated from an External Sender. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you recognize the source.
ATTENTION: ce courriel provient d'un expéditeur externe. Ne cliquez sur aucun lien et n'ouvrez pas de pièce jointe, excepté si vous connaissez l'expéditeur.

Dear Commissioners,

I am writing to register my support for the recommendations made by the Manitoba Eco-Network and Our Line in the Sand, in their closing slides, presented on March 15, 2023, in the hearing regarding the Vivian Silica Sand Extraction Project.

I live in the RM of Brokenhead and have worked here as a market gardener and in communications and development for a non-profit Indigenous organization with a cross-cultural education mandate. I have a BSc in Environmental Studies from the University of Winnipeg.

I believe, as many others have expressed during the hearings, that the risk this project poses to our drinking water, however slight, is too great. Especially with the uncertainty that climate change introduces into our future, I believe it is irresponsible to jeopardize such a key source of water for life in our communities.

The fact that this review considered only one aspect of the project (the extraction) and only over a short period of time, rather than fully looking at the potential for cumulative impacts, over the full lifetime of the silica extraction and processing, diminishes my confidence that this project won't have "any negative effects on the environment" as Sio Silica asserted in their closing presentation.

I was also dismayed to learn that participant funding was not provided which limits the scrutiny that concerned citizens can afford to apply to the project.

Finally, I noted at the public hearing session I attended that the evening began not only with a land acknowledgement but an acknowledgement of "harms and mistakes of the past", and an expressed dedication from the CEC to "move forward in partnership with Indigenous communities in the spirit of reconciliation and collaboration."

I fully support this dedication. Is this silica sand extraction project compatible with such a commitment?

I read writers like Canada Research Chair on Indigenous Environmental Justice Deborah McGregor who explains "Indigenous conceptions of reconciliation extend beyond peoples to the natural world and are informed by direct relationships to the land. We must, the Elders say, reconcile with the Earth itself (TRC 2015a, 123)."
(https://www.researchgate.net/publication/363051416_Reconciling_Relationships_with_the_Land_through_Land_Acknowledgements)

Concerns raised by the participants and in Dr. Eva Pip's written submission around impacts on wildlife, forests, air quality and more suggest to me that this project does not lead us toward reconciliation with the land. The unconfirmed potential that the silica mined would be used to produce solar panels, does not make these impacts acceptable to me.

Sincerely,

Erica Young

[REDACTED]